

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance
in Higher Education and Health Care
November 27, 2025

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME 70910204 – OTORHINOLARYNGOLOGY
OF TASHKENT STATE MEDICAL UNIVERSITY FOR COMPLIANCE
WITH THE STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION:
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (MASTER'S DEGREE) OF THE
EURASIAN CENTER FOR ACCREDITATION AND QUALITY
ASSURANCE IN HIGHER EDUCATION AND HEALTH CARE**

**external expert assessment period:
November 03 – 05, 2025**

Almaty, 2025

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3-4
2.	General part of the final report	4-5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	4-6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the analysis results of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty - 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology and conclusions on its completion	6-7
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	7-10
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme 70910204– Otorhinolaryngology	10-47
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	47-48
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council on accreditation of an educational programme	48
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the master’s degree educational programme in the specialty 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	49
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert assessment	51

LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
EHEA	European Higher Education Area
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
MH RU	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan
RLA	Regulatory and Legal Acts
EP	Educational Programme
ESG	Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in the European Higher Education Area
BD	Basic Disciplines
WHO	World Health Organization
VC	Videoconferencing
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCS RU	State Compulsory Standard of the Republic of Uzbekistan
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
STC	State Testing Center
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
IC	Individual Curriculum
IRC	Information Resource Center
IT	Information Technology
ELISA	Enzyme-Linked Immunosorbent Assay
QR	Qualified Character Reference
MPI	Medical and Preventive Institution
MHESI	Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation
MHSSE	Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education
MES RU	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Uzbekistan
RW	Research Work
MSRW	Master's Degree Student Research Work
NCMC	National Children's Medical Center
TSD	Total Scope of Disciplines
EP	Educational Programmes
BPEP	Basic Professional Educational Programme
ARI	Acute Respiratory Infections
OSCE	Objectively Structured Clinical Examination
PCE	Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education
MS	Midterm Survey
TS	Teaching staff
PCR	Polymerase Chain Reaction
RPC	Republican Perinatal Center
RSSPC	Republican Specialized Scientific and Practical Center
RSSPMC	Republican Specialized Scientific and Practical Medical Center
RSC EMC	Republican Scientific Center for Emergency Medical Care
RSSPMCPRU	Republican Specialized Scientific and Practical Medical Center of Pediatrics of the Republic of Uzbekistan
RU	Republic of Uzbekistan

WC	Working Curricula
SSS	Student Scientific Society
IWM, IWMT	Independent Work of a Master's Degree Student, Independent Work of a Master's Degree Student with a Teacher
IWS	Independent Work of a Student
IWST	Independent Work of a Student with a Teacher
TIAMS	Tashkent Institute for Advanced Medical Studies
TashPMI	Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute
TMA	Tashkent Medical Academy
SC	Standard Curricula
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council
Cm	Curriculum
FI	Field internship
CMC	Central Methodological Council
EJ	Electronic Journal
ECTS	European Credit Transfer System
KPI	key performance indicators
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team-based learning
RBL	Research based learning

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No.24 dated October 16, 2025, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty "70910204 - Otorhinolaryngology" from November 3 to 5, 2025, consisting of the following members:

No.	EEC membership	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the Public Organization "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society, member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU"
2	International Expert	Milena Staneva Staneva	PhD, Honorary Professor of the Faculty of Medicine at Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski". Expert, member of the Standing Committee for Healthcare and Sports of the National Agency for Assessment and Accreditation, Bulgaria. Chief Coordinator of the Expert Council of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Bulgaria. Head of the Angiology Unit at Acibadem City Clinical Hospital, Tokuda University, Sofia, Bulgaria.
3	Academic Expert	Burkutbayeva Tatyana Niridenovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Otorhinolaryngology Department of the Kazakhstan Medical University "Higher School of Public Healthcare" in Almaty
4	Academic Expert	Trynkin Alexey Viktorovich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases with a Course in Anesthesiology and Resuscitation of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
5	Academic Expert	Kudabayeva Khatimya Ilyassovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases No.1 of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
6	Academic Expert	Mukhambetova Gulnar Amerzayevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Nervous Diseases at NJSC "S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University", Almaty, Kazakhstan
7	Academic Expert	Akhenbekova Aida Zhaksybayevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Children's Diseases at NJSC "S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University", Almaty, Kazakhstan
8	Academic Expert	Doshakanova Assel Bidauletovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, ophthalmologist of the highest category, head of the postgraduate education department of the LLP "Kazakh

			Research Institute of Eye Diseases”
9	Academic Expert	Marat Aizada	PhD, Associate Professor of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology No.1 at the NJSC “Astana Medical University”, obstetrician-gynecologist in Astana.
10	Employer Expert	Ermetov Aziz Tashmetovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Director of the Tashkent Regional Branch of the Republican Scientific Center for Emergency Medical Care, Tashkent
11	Student Expert	Sartay Nurila Nurmakhankyzy	3rd year postgraduate doctor in the specialty "Obstetrics and Gynecology" at the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" in Almaty

The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusion of the external assessment of the educational programme "70910204 - Otorhinolaryngology" for compliance with the Standards for Programme Accreditation: postgraduate education (Master's degree) (developed on the basis of the International Standards for Improving the Quality of Postgraduate Education Programmes of the WFME 2023) and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations on accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on accreditation.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the Master's degree educational programme in the specialty "70910204 - Otorhinolaryngology"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	In the state language – Toshkent davlat tibbiyot universiteti In Russian – Ташкентский Государственный Медицинский Университет In English - Tashkent State Medical University Certificate on State Registration of the Legal Entity, Registry No. 002624-10, dated January 5, 2007
Full name of the first head	Boimuradov Shukhrat Abdujalilovich
Location and contact information	City/District: Tashkent, Almazar District, Address: Farobiy Street, 2 Postal Code: 100109 Phone: +998 (78) 150 78 01 Fax: +998 (78) 250 78 28 E-mail: info@tma.uz
State license for educational activities in the master's programme (date, number)	Register No. 002624-10, January 5, 2007 No. 000375
Information on branches and subsidiaries (if any)	Termez Branch of Tashkent State Medical University. Address: Termez, I.Karimov Street, Building No.64, Surkhandarya Region. Structure: 1 faculty, 15 departments, 9 of which are clinical. Student population: approximately 2,403 full-time students, 59 are in residency (clinical residency). Teachers: 124 full-time faculty, including 16 professors/staff with academic degrees. Clinical facilities: The branch's departments are located in approximately 30 medical institutions in Termez and surrounding areas. Chirchik Branch of Tashkent State Medical University.

	Address: Chirchik, Lomonosov Street, 1a, Tashkent Region. Programmes: "General Medicine" duration - 6 years. Pediatrics - 6 years. Languages of instruction: Uzbek, Russian, English.
Year of commencement of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2000
Duration of study	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP	176
Number of master's students in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	40
Full-time/part-time faculty involved in the EP	Total number of teachers: 5, including 5 full-time and 0 part-time Academic degree holder rate: 100% Categories: 100%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://e-lib.tpmi , https://telegram.me/edubooksbot ; https://unilibrary.uz/ https://my.tashpmi.uz .

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In accordance with state accreditation certificates No.10 and No.13 dated October 23, 2019, issued by the State Inspectorate for Education Quality Control under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, instruction is provided in Uzbek, Russian and English at the undergraduate and postgraduate levels in the following educational areas and specialties:

- Undergraduate education: 5510200 "Pediatrics", 5510100 "General Medicine", 5111000 "Medical and Pedagogical Science", 5510700 "Higher Nursing", 5511100 "Traditional Medicine"
- 33 master's degree specialties
- 29 clinical residency specialties
- 17 doctoral degree specialties.

2.3 Brief description of the analysis results of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty "70910204 - Otorhinolaryngology" and conclusions on its completion

The self-assessment report for the Master's educational programme in "70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 125 pages of the main text, 11 pages of annexes, and copies or electronic versions of 42 documents located at <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1594p2b31C3jURDGwytbwip1h013oOvHA>.

The report is characterized by its comprehensive responses to all 8 key accreditation standards and criteria, its structure, taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for Conducting Self-Assessment of Educational Programmes provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, and its internal unity of information. A cover letter signed by Rector Shukhrat Abdjalilovich Boimuradov confirming the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-evaluation report, is attached to report.

The report includes a list of 38 members of the internal self-assessment committee, indicating the responsibilities of each employee, and information about the organization representative responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme: Zhamoliddin Sattorov, Associate Professor; Bakhranovich, Head of the Education Quality Assurance Department at TashSMU; and

Sharaf Khamrakulovich Babakulov, PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Internal Assessment and Accreditation Department at TashSMU.

The self-assessment of the educational programme "70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology" was conducted based on the University Rector's Order No.84 dated February 10, 2025, "On External Accreditation".

All standards include the University's actual practice of training master's students in the specialty "70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology", taking into account the start of student admission in 2004. These standards also include substantiated data, examples of the educational programme's objectives, national and international events, and methodological support, confirming compliance with accreditation standards. The self-assessment report is comprehensive and up-to-date in terms of the number of master's students, teachers and administration, selection and admissions information, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, the university's physical facilities and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations and sites), financial information, and development and improvement plans.

The report was submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with data adjusted according to the recommendations above. It is written in a competent manner, with clear and understandable wording for each standard, described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables has references within the text, all are numbered sequentially.

3. Description of the external expert assessment

The external expert assessment of the educational programme “Otorhinolaryngology” – 70910204 was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for Conducting External Assessment of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of the ECAQA. The visit to the organization was conducted from November 3 to 5, 2025. The detailed schedule for the 3-day visit is presented in Annex 3 to this report.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- Conversation with management and administrative staff – 33 people;
- Interviews with master’s students – 40 people;
- Website study – www.tma.uz
- Interviewing 5 staff members, 5 teachers and 8 supervisors;
- Questionnaires for teachers and master’s students – 5 and 40, respectively;
- Supervision of master's degree students' training at the ENT unit of the multidisciplinary clinic of TashSMU, a 20-bed unit where round-the-clock emergency care is provided, mastering modern methods of diagnosis and treatment of ENT diseases, continuous guidance of experienced clinicians and teachers of the department (Lesson topic: Chronic laryngeal stenosis: its etiology, pathogenesis, diagnosis, clinical picture, emergency care, treatment and preventive measures. Lecturer - Babakhanov Gulimbay Kutlibayevich, DSc, Associate Professor; 2nd-year master's students.
- Lesson on research work and preparation of a master's thesis (2nd-year master's students) at the “Happy-life” medical institution, contract dated 01.01.2025 to 01.01.2028, contract No.1, dated 27.05.2020). Karabayev Khurram Esankulovich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, professor responsible for the master's degree.

Second year master’s students:

No.	Full name of master’s student	Master’s thesis topic
1.	Abdullayeva Nargiza Rustamovna	Clinical and immunological characteristics of allergic rhinitis
2.	Muzaffar Bakhram ugli	Improving the effectiveness of diagnosis and treatment of psychosomatic changes in pharyngeal tonsil hypertrophy in

		children.
3.	Bozorova Dildora Komol kizi	Characteristics of the treatment of chronic rhinosinusitis in children with bronchial asthma
4.	Davlatboyeva Lobar Ilkhomzhon kizi	Optimization of conservative treatment of vasomotor rhinitis.
5.	Zokirova Mukhlissa Rustam kizi	Comprehensive diagnosis and improvement of treatment for recurrent otitis media in children
6.	Odilova Madina Bakhtiyer kizi	Improving the diagnosis and treatment of purulent rhinosinusitis in pregnant women
7.	Sagidullayeva Dilnoza Bakhtiyarovna	Clinical characteristics and life quality assessment of patients with chronic polypous rhinosinusitis
8.	Sodikova Munisa Bakhriddin kizi	Characteristics of the clinical presentation and treatment of pharyngomycosis in children
9.	Toshtemirova Makhfuza Mamadamin kizi	Treatment optimization Chronic rhinosinusitis in children
10.	Umarova Shalola Ziedulla kizi	Clinical and immunological aspects of chronic adenoiditis in children
11.	Urakova Umida Elamonovna	Choosing treatment strategies for various clinical forms of chronic tonsillitis
12.	Erkinova Diera Khusniddin kizi	Optimizing the treatment of allergic rhinitis in children with adenoid vegetations

Portfolios of master's students who meet all the requirements were reviewed, for example: Mukhlissa Zokirova Rustam Kizi. The topic of her thesis is "Comprehensive Diagnostics and Improvement of Treatment for Recurrent Otitis Media in Children". Clear and comprehensive answers were provided to the questions posed regarding the topic of the research paper. To the question of T.N. Burkutbayev: Do you perform tympanic bypass surgery for soft palate anomalies? Answer: According to international data, up to 80-90% of children with cleft palate have recurrent otitis exudative otitis. Bypass surgery is performed in the following cases: persistent fluid in the middle ear for more than 3 months, hearing loss affecting speech development, recurrent otitis, and preparation for reconstructive surgery on the palate.

- study of 7 learning and teaching documents both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the divisions (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit programme and in the lists of interview and conversation sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews and conversations with EEC members

No.	Position	Quantity
1	Khurram Esankulovich Karabayev, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Responsible for Master's Degrees	1
2	Gulimbay Kutlibayevich Babakhanov, DSc, Associate Professor	1
3	Ulugbe Bashrullayevich Mukhitdinov, DSc, Associate Professor	1

4	Askar Khamrokulovich Rajabov, DSc, Associate Professor	1
5	Aminzhon Shavkatovich Amonov, DSc, Associate Professor	1
6	Feruza Lutfullayevna Azizova, Vice-Rector for Research and Innovation	1
7	Abror Anvarovich Suvonov, Head of the Department of Finance and Economics	1
8	Rustam Ismatullayevich Turakulov, Career and Employment Center	1
9	Feruza Khussanovna Azizova, Nigora Khikmatovna Issakhanova, Academic services office	1
10	Mirkhotam Mirkhoshimovich Tadzhiyev, Simulation Training Center	1
11	Ilmira Ravkatovna Urazaliyeva, Department of Scientific Research and Innovations	1
12	Dinara Ayupovna Parpibayeva, Clinical Sites Department	1
13	Abror Kamolitdinovich Musakhonov, Digital and Innovative Technologies Center	1
14	Interview with Master's students in the specialty 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	39
15	Interview with teachers in the specialty 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	5
16	Conversation with Master's students in the specialty 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology	39
17	Khussan Saifiddinovich Ravshanov, “Compliance Control” Anti-Corruption System Management Department	1
18	Interview with Master's programme graduates – responsible: Umid Bakhtiyerovich Sangilov, Sanzharbek Istamovich Zaripov	8
19	Interview with representatives of practical healthcare (employers of Master's programme graduates) (+employers from the regions online) – responsible: Marif Shakirovich Karimov, Sharaf Khamrakulovich Babakulov	13
20	Abdurakhimov Bobir Abdunabiyevich, Testing Center	4
21	Galina Viktorovna Kuzmina, Information and Resource Center (<i>Library</i>)	1
22	Rasulbek Bakhtiyerovich Polvonov, Social Assistance Center	1
23	Bekzhon Azizbekovich Nurmukhamedov, Human Resources Department	1
24	Rustam Asralovich Zakirkhodzhayev, Infrastructure Maintenance and Development Department	1
25	Laziz Rakhmatullayevich Rakhmatullayev, Purchasing and Supply Department	1
26	Umida Umidovna Abdullayeva, Tashkent State Medical University Museum	1
27	Zafar Bobonazarovich Faiziyev, Sports Complex	1
28	Department of Clinical Pharmacology	1

On the final day of the visit, a meeting of the EEC members was held to discuss the external assessment. A final discussion was held regarding the results of the external assessment of the educational programme, document review, conversation, interview and questionnaires results. The EEC members began drafting the final EEC report. The external assessment results were summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Assessment of the Educational Programme in Specialty 70910204 – Otorhinolaryngology for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". The EEC members made no comments. Recommendations for

improving the educational programme were discussed, and Chairman Ye.M. Turgunov held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the EEC, with access to all necessary information and material resources. The commission notes the University's high level of corporate culture and the team's high level of openness in providing information to EEC members.

In a survey of master's students, 200 rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive - 93%, and 1.5% - as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (93%) believe that educational institutions or educational programmes should be accredited.

According to 77.59% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the Chairman of the EEC presented recommendations to the educational organization's management and staff based on the results of the external assessment as part of the specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the master's degree educational programme in the speciality "Otorhinolaryngology" - 70910204

Standard 1: MISSION AND VALUES

1.1 Stating the mission

During the implementation of the programme's activities, namely, following conversation with the organization's first head, members of the advisory body (Career and Employment Center, academic services office, Simulation Training Center, Department of Scientific Research and Innovation, Center for Digital and Innovative Technologies, Testing Center, Information Resource Center, Department of Infrastructure Maintenance and Development, and Department of Procurement and Supply), and interviews with master's students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of *standard 1* was established. All participants in the educational process are aware of the mission of the educational programme and participated in the development of proposals for formulating the mission. The mission was communicated to potential master's students through the website, social media and informational letters to medical organizations. The organization's strategic plan for 2022-2027 was reviewed. It includes a high level of education, the training of competent and ethical pediatric medical specialists, the promotion of research and teaching activities, and the promotion of improvements in the healthcare system through innovation. This confirms compliance with accreditation standards and demonstrates the organization's goals, objectives and prospects. Interviews with master's students revealed that before classes begin, teachers inform students about the organization's mission and work plans, and provide information on the educational programme, teachers and training facilities.

During the visit to the educational organization's divisions, the experts noted the strengths of Tashkent State Medical University in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: a high academic degree holder rate and additional fees for the academic degree of candidate of medical sciences - 30%, doctor of medical sciences - 60%, a large number of clinical sites, social support for master's degree students (payment for accommodation, travel, provision of a dormitory, food and hygiene products for those in need); monitoring of the employment of master's degree students by the university and the Ministry of Education and Science; the presence of 6 Dissertation Councils, 7 journals of the Higher Attestation Commission, payment for the therapeutic load of teachers - 25%, surgical profile - 30%.

Tashkent State Medical University has divisions directly related to the "Otorhinolaryngology" – 70910204 educational programme, which can be considered best practices in education. These include the Career and Employment Center, the Social Assistance Center and the Tashkent State Medical University Clinic. This conclusion was reached based on visits and conversations with divisions representatives.

The results of the documentation review demonstrate that the organization's mission and the mission of the “otorhinolaryngology” -70910204 educational programme, and the educational process are structured in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current regulatory legal acts in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during meetings with master's students and university staff, the experts identified a number of issues, including underrepresentation of students in the university's advisory bodies.

The educational organization conducts training for master's degree students at the following clinical sites and units: the private clinic "Happy Life" where they have the opportunity to participate in modern surgical interventions, observe advanced ENT surgical techniques, and practice under the guidance of experienced specialists; the ENT unit of the 7th City Clinical Hospital, where master's degree students provide emergency care 8 days a month and acquire practical skills in the diagnosis and treatment of acute ENT diseases; an internship under the supervision of the unit head and senior physicians in a 25-bed unit; and the ENT unit of the multidisciplinary clinic of Tashkent State Medical University with 20 beds, where master's degree students provide emergency care around the clock. Mastering modern methods of diagnosis and treatment of ENT diseases, continuous supervision of experienced clinicians and department teachers.

The educational institution pays due attention to patient safety and autonomy by using high-tech equipment and technologies only in relevant programme components, and by ensuring that master's students interact with patients only under the supervision of teachers and with the patients' consent.

Experts determined that master's students have appropriate working conditions to support their own health, as the educational institution provides annual medical examinations by teaching staff and the 56-family polyclinic of the Yunusabad district of Tashkent, where master's students undergo their medical examinations. This activity is coordinated by the Clinical Sites Department.

Basic competencies of master's degree students in the accredited specialty, such as readiness for independent living and productive professional activity, as well as specialized competencies including patient counseling (anamnesis collection, physical examination), clinical case assessment (differential diagnosis, determining an examination and treatment plan, and evaluating the effectiveness of therapy), emergency care, effective communication, and the application of ethical and legal principles in medical practice, help educational institutions implement innovative learning forms. This will enable master's degree students to develop skills and qualities such as in-depth training as highly specialized, competitive, next-generation otorhinolaryngologists with a high level of professional competence, independent practical skills in both planned and emergency surgical interventions, and teaching and research skills.

Tashkent State Medical University encourages master's students to participate in research in their chosen specialty through the approval and defense of their dissertations, and also ensures the participation of master's students in academic events such as national and international scientific and practical conferences, competitions for young scientists with publications and reports.

1.2 Participation in mission formulation

Experts determined that teaching staff, students, master's degree students and representatives of practical healthcare participated in developing the goals and objectives (mission) of the educational programme “Otorhinolaryngology” - 70910204, as confirmed by the university's Charter. Proposals were made, including ongoing research into the needs of practical healthcare for otolaryngologists and improving their effective professional training system. The master's programme's mission statement was formulated in 2022 after it gained administrative, managerial, academic and financial independence <https://tashpmi.uz/institute/missiya-instituta/>.

The Institute's mission and goals are widely accepted and supported by the administration, employees, teaching staff and master's students. Information on the mission and goals is available to all interested parties and is posted on the “Otorhinolaryngology” Department website: <https://tashpmi.uz/obrazovanie/bakalavriat/i-pediatricheskij-fakultet/kafedry/otorinologiya-detskaya-otorinologiya-stomatologiya/> Collaboration with the Ministry of Healthcare of the

Republic of Uzbekistan, regional, city and district healthcare administration, public and private medical organizations, and civil society allows for the modernization of the educational programme in line with labor market needs, thereby increasing the effectiveness of the educational process and the employment rate.

In a survey of 36 master's students (on <https://webanketa.com/>), several of the 22 questions focused on the quality of the educational process and educational programme. It was found that 85% of master's students would recommend studying at this educational institution to their acquaintances, friends and relatives. 92% of respondents believed that the educational programme's heads and teachers are aware of students' learning needs. To the question, "Do you think this educational institution allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 92% of master's students answered positively, 3.5% were unsure, 2.5% couldn't answer this question yet, and 2% were willing to believe so.

The 10 teachers surveyed (21 survey questions) also stated that 87.93% were satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace at this educational institution, and 8.62% partially agreed with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy working environment, as the head is readily accessible to both master's students and staff and responds promptly to requests. In the survey, 81.03% of teachers were satisfied with the organization's working environment, 10.04% were quite satisfied, and 1.72% were partially satisfied. According to 87.93%, teachers at the educational institution have the opportunity to develop as professionals in their field. A total of 10 people (there are 15 in total) responded, with more than 50% of the teaching staff having 15 years of teaching experience or more.

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 6 standards: fully - 6, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 2: CURRICULUM

2.1 Curriculum and certification

Experts have established a correlation between the content and required qualifications of a master's student upon completion of the "otorhinolaryngology" programme - 70910204, which is expressed in addition to the graduate's general competencies. Upon completion of the programme, master's students are admitted to an independent examination, which allows them to obtain a specialist certificate. The curriculum defines specific competencies (learning outcomes) that reflect the development of main clinical skills during training: patient counseling (history taking, physical examination), clinical case assessment (differential diagnosis, determining an examination and treatment plan, and evaluating the effectiveness of therapy), emergency care, effective communication, and the application of ethical and legal principles in medical practice. Upon completion of their studies, Master's students are admitted to an independent exam at the FSA, which allows them to obtain a specialist certificate and the academic degree of "Master" in the educational programme in the specialty "otorhinolaryngology" - 70910204 (duration of study is 3 years). Graduates who have completed training in the educational program of higher specialized education and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the academic degree of "Master" in the educational programme in the specialty -70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology", with a duration of study of 3 years and are awarded a Master's degree in otorhinolaryngology, a diploma supplement and be admitted to clinical practice in a practical healthcare organization. The graduate's qualification level corresponds to level 7 of the National Personnel Programem, related in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.647 dated 31.07.2015.

The educational institution has developed and implemented certification courses that meet the requirements of additional professional programmes and are focused on developing competencies relevant to clinical and scientific work. Each course lasted 6 hours.

The programme content was developed taking into account international approaches to learning outcomes and professional standards. The courses cover the following training areas: ENT diseases in

children, simulation skills, emergency care, rhinosurgery, etc. The courses are structured in accordance with current educational standards and requirements for additional professional learning.

In 2023-2024, of the 3 graduates of the master's programme in "otorhinolaryngology" - 70910204, 0 master's students passed the independent assessment with an "excellent" grade, 3 master's students received a "good" grade, and 0 master's students received a "satisfactory" grade. The number of students who failed the exam was zero in 2024.

Experts reviewed documents confirming the fulfillment of this accreditation standard criterion: Annex 1 to Order No.432 dated September 11, 2025, "On measures to improve the system related to the Procedure for Monitoring and Assessing Student Knowledge at Tashkent State Medical University".

The Master's degree educational programme in "5A510104 - Otorhinolaryngology" has been included in the Register of the Unified Higher Education Programme (EHEA) since 2005. The programme complies with state educational standards, graduate qualification requirements, and includes the development of key professional and research competencies necessary for practical and scientific work in otorhinolaryngology.

2.2 Intended learning outcomes

The intended learning outcomes are defined and included in the General Curriculum document based on the Standard Curriculum and approved by the Coordinating Council of Educational Programmes of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan for the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". Stakeholders are informed about the intended learning outcomes for master's students in the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" through online resources and meetings with employers at job fairs. Experts confirmed that the professional behavior and communication skills of master's students are developed through adherence to all ethical standards and mutual respect among both the department's teaching staff and units, including units' heads, postgraduate doctors, research staff and nursing staff, conducting briefings by the responsible teacher on the rules of work in the clinic units, communication with patients and are reflected in the relevant document - the Regulation for Masters and the Code of Conduct. Teachers and master's students are informed of the Code of Ethics. The Code of Ethics can be found at (<https://ssv.uz/uploads/pages/buyrug88-23032022.pdf>). **(ESG II Part 1.2)**

It has been established that the expected learning outcomes meet the requirements of national professional standards for the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" and the graduate's qualification level corresponds to level 7 of the National Personnel Programme, related in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.647 dated July 31, 2015. There is a review of the accredited educational programme from Arifov Saifiddin Saidazimovich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of ENT Diseases of the Tashkent Institute for Advanced Medical Studies, Shamsiyev Jahangir Fazliddinovich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Tashkent State Dental Medical Institute and a review from the Tashkent Medical Academy, Head of the Department of ENT Diseases, Professor, Khassanov Ulugbek Saidakramovich. Thus, the requirements of the professional community in the direction of 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are taken into account.

The educational programme defines learning outcomes for the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" which include knowledge, skills and professional behavior. Each skill can be assessed and measured, for example, through the use of feedback (anonymous questionnaires, testing, studying and recording their skills and abilities at different stages of certification) and taking measures to improve them (improving the assessment system). A set of methods, forms, types and criteria for assessment and scoring constitutes a system for assessing students' professional and scientific performance. Knowledge assessment criteria are also set out in Order 3069 of the Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education dated September 26, 2018, "On Approval of the Regulation on the System for Monitoring and Assessing Students' Knowledge in Higher Education Institutions" (<https://lex.uz/ru/docs/3921757?ONDATE=28.07.2021> &action=compare). The policy and procedure

for assessing learning outcomes within the Master's degree educational programme are carried out in strict accordance with the provisions and regulations in this area: The assessment criteria are presented in the Rector's Order No.284 dated September 17, 2022, in Annex 3.

Following each class, master's students receive regular oral feedback and a survey twice per academic year from the Department of Education Quality Improvement at TashSMU. A survey of master's students in various specialties, including specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" found that 91.5% of them reported that their teacher provides feedback after classes. To improve the educational programme for specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology", the educational organization has implemented the following measures in 2024-2025: professional standards approved by orders of the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Qualified Character Reference of master's degree graduates, and the compliance of graduates' knowledge, skills and abilities with the requirements of the professional standard of the educational programme aimed at preparing for the FSA.

A mandatory component of Master's degree training is participation in providing medical care to the population. Master's students undergo training at medical institutions such as the Republican Specialized Center "Happy Life" with 7 units and 60 beds, which boasts modern diagnostic equipment and provides high-tech treatment procedures that meet international standards. Clinical facilities are also located at the 7th City Clinical Multidisciplinary Hospital, with 11 units and 25 beds, the Tashkent State Medical University Clinic with 20 beds, two private clinics, and a diagnostic outpatient clinic (Annex 2.6.1). Practical training is conducted on the job in hospital settings and at the primary health care level. <https://tashpmi.uz/obrazovanie/kvalifikatsionnye-trebovaniya/>

For example, in the ENT unit of the multidisciplinary clinic of TashSMU, master's students learn procedures such as 24-hour emergency care: tracheostomy, paracentesis, drainage of peritonsillar abscesses and retropharyngeal abscesses. They also master modern methods of diagnosis and treatment of ENT diseases. The private clinic "Happy Life" offers the opportunity to participate in modern surgical procedures: tympanoplasty, middle ear sanitizing surgery and functional endoscopic rhinosurgery. Independent study for master's students includes preparing presentations; working with educational literature; studying scientific journals; researching online; managing patients; calls; preparing case problems and tests; using distance learning technologies; working with simulators; and working with educational electronic programmes. Students also prepare research projects and develop tables to organize educational material. All results of independent work are presented in the form of reports and presentations, as well as participation in scientific research. The Department of Otorhinolaryngology organizes training in conducting scientific research.

Master's students' professional conduct is ensured through instruction from a responsible teacher. Students are familiar with the Code of Ethics, which was developed and approved by Code of Conduct, approved by Order No.88 of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated March 24, 2022 (<https://ssv.uz/uploads/pages/buyrug88-23032022.pdf>). When surveying employers, experts clarified their satisfaction with master's students' behavior. Overall, master's students maintain ethical behavior toward teachers, fellow students and healthcare staff. Ethical rules of conduct are reflected in the Regulation for Master's Students (<https://ssv.uz/uploads/pages/buyrug88-23032022.pdf>), which any employee of the educational organization can contact to resolve conflict situations. No such situations were reported during the period 2024-2025. During a meeting with experts, the master's students themselves confirmed that teachers observe ethics in relation to them. When asked whether conflict resolution studies had been conducted for teachers in the past few years, the answer was positive.

When determining the intended learning outcomes, the Education Quality Assurance Department considered previous undergraduate and internship learning outcomes, as well as the goals and objectives of subsequent continuing professional development in the chosen specialty. The educational institution offers continuing professional development, including programmes in the specialty of the accredited educational programme. For example, programmes have been developed and implemented on the following topics: The institution has developed 7 continuing education programmes ("ENT

Endoscopic Surgery", "Emergency Care in Otorhinolaryngology" "Clinical Research", "Audiology", "Topographic Anatomy", "Clinical Pharmacology" and "ENT Oncology"), aimed at enhancing students' professional competence and developing practical skills in their respective fields. The programmes comply with current educational standards, include theoretical and practical components, and are regularly updated to reflect the requirements of the professional community and modern learning methods. They also include mandatory general methodological components and electives in "Clinical Pharmacology" and "Radiology", taking into account the student's level of preparation (year of study, specialization). Elective courses comprise 780 hours/26 credits (UZ) – 27 (ECTS) of the total course load.

Experts established clear continuity between the intended outcomes of master's students' prior learning (prerequisites) and their master's degree programme, as well as subsequent continuing professional development programmes. The organization has developed 2 continuing education programmes in clinical pharmacology and medical radiology, including for the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". Master's students are informed of these programmes.

77.59% of teachers-respondents believe that students at this educational organization possess a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the programme, and 8.62% partially agree.

*Teachers surveyed during the external assessment responded that 53.45% are fully satisfied with the level of master's students' prior training, and 36.21% are **partially** satisfied.*

The qualification obtained by completing the educational programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" corresponds to level 8 of the National Qualifications Framework (**ESG 1.2**) and has the code 70910204. Completion of the master's programme results in the award of the academic degree "Master" in Otorhinolaryngology, which is in demand in higher and postgraduate education, the research sector and practical healthcare organizations.

2.3 Curriculum organization and structure

The educational programme organization for the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" is defined based on the intended learning outcomes of master's students and therefore includes the following: knowledge, skills, professional attitudes and behaviors for each component of the medical education programme that facilitates their achievement by master's students and are measurable for assessment, feedback and improvement actions. The duration of the programme is 3 years. The systematic and transparent nature of the programme is guaranteed by focusing on new advances in clinical medicine, the current needs of society and practical healthcare, and by regularly making appropriate adjustments to the programme's content. The educational organization conducts training based on the principles of quality, academic honesty and an anti-plagiarism policy. At the state level, the Cabinet of Ministers issued Order No.27/8, 50 on August 7, 2024, and the Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation issued Order No.381 dated October 14, 2024, "On improving the quality of education in order to prevent plagiarism and respect copyright" at universities. <https://lex.uz/docs/6788000> .

Based on this order, an internal document of TashSMU dated November 18, 2024 No.594 was issued on the verification of master's theses using the "Anti-plagiarism" programme (Annex 2.5.3.).

To implement the educational programme for specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" the organization's documents include teaching materials that define the programme's goal, integrate practical and theoretical components, and provide independent study. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established, including the development of work programmes that are discussed at department meetings, reviewed at the CMC meeting, and approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs.

While attending the practical lesson: G.K. Babakhanov's lesson topic: Chronic laryngeal stenosis: its etiology, pathogenesis, diagnosis, clinical presentation, emergency care, treatment and preventive measures - 18 hours, the experts received convincing evidence that the training was being conducted according to plan. Before the lesson, master's degree students completed quizzes, received

feedback from the teacher, and had the opportunity to improve their knowledge of chronic laryngeal stenosis, its etiology, pathogenesis, diagnosis, clinical manifestations, emergency care, treatment and preventive measures; and developed clinical reasoning and decision-making skills.

The organization ensures compliance with ethical standards in the implementation of the educational programme, as experts have reviewed the Code of Ethics approved by Order No.88 of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated March 24, 2022. During interviews, master's students responded that they were aware of the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the teaching materials and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The supervising system described in Master's Programme Regulation No.36 dated March 2, 2015, was evaluated. There are 8 supervisors, whose tasks include developing practical skills and clinical thinking, preparing students for independent research, teaching and clinical practice, providing advisory, methodological and educational support, and assisting with theoretical and scientific aspects of training. The procedure for informing master's students of their rights and responsibilities is reflected in Master's Programme Regulation No.36 dated March 2, 2015.

Teachers use learning methods for master's students, including case-based learning (CBL), problem-based learning (PBL), team-based learning (TBL), business games, role-playing games, "brainstorming", group discussion, combined questioning, small-group learning, simulation technology and presentations (student-centered learning). Practical skills are practiced in class and assessed during a practical skills exam using dummies and simulation models. Communication skills are assessed, and students demonstrate the practical skills they have acquired during their training and the ability to perform therapeutic and diagnostic procedures. Clinical site physicians, unit heads, and on-call physicians, who directly manage patients, also participate in ensuring patient and student safety. This responsibility is enshrined in bilateral agreements between TashSMU and the clinical site <https://tashpmi.uz/institute/normativnye-pravovye-dokumenty/prikazy-ministerstva-i-resheniya-kollegii/>. In addition to TashSMU teaching staff, heads of republican medical centers specializing in otorhinolaryngology also participate in working groups developing standard programmes and curricula. The location of clinical departments at city and republican clinics allows for the effective implementation of active learning methods (clinical case analysis, preparation and presentation of case histories, bedside teaching, in-clinic teaching with the participation of a real patient, in-patient training, attendance at medical conferences and consultations, and web-based teaching); learning through research (scientific research activities).

The list of learning methods is described in the Working Curriculum and the Syllabus of the subject. Using these methods, master's degree students can participate in providing medical care to patients. Teachers can provide master's degree students with management of approximately 6-7 specialized patients per day, 20-24 per month. Using these methods, master's degree students can participate in providing medical care to patients. Teachers can provide master's degree students with management of approximately 4 specialized patients per day, 80 patients per month. For example, master's degree students in the educational programme in the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" upon completion of their training can perform such procedures as patient counseling (collecting anamnesis, physical examination), clinical case assessment (conducting differential diagnostics; determining an examination and treatment plan; evaluating the effectiveness of the therapy), providing emergency medical care; effective communication, application of ethical and legal principles in medical practice; application of biomedical science achievements based on research, scientific knowledge and evidence-based medicine.

Experts have determined that the educational institution fully implements the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism. This is reflected in the Cabinet of Ministers Order No.27/8, 50 dated August 7, 2024, and the Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation Order No.381 dated October 14, 2024, "On Improving the Quality of Education to Prevent Plagiarism and Comply with Copyright" at Universities. [See <https://lex.uz/docs/6788000>.] Based on this order, TashSMU

issued an internal document No.594 dated November 18, 2024, regarding the review of master's theses using the "Anti-plagiarism" programme (Annex 2.5.3.).

Academic honesty applies at stages of master's degree programmes, including basic disciplines, clinical sciences and skills, behavioral and social sciences, and interdisciplinary specialties. Anti-plagiarism measures are also applicable when master's students are working on their thesis. Master's students are trained to promptly obtain informed consent from patients for all diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. Experts noted that the patient's medical records contain a corresponding document signed by the patient.

Thus, by the end of the 3-year study, master's students will acquire the basic skills and abilities in the profession 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology", which will allow them to work in institutions such as practical healthcare organizations (**ESG 1.2**).

The experts did not find any violations regarding the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuing professional development, since the organization of education is stipulated by the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan <https://lex.uz/docs/6445147>, the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.ZRU-63 dated September 23, 2020 "On Education" <https://lex.uz/ru/docs/5013009>. Since 2021, the institute has been granted financial and academic independence (Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated December 24, 2021 No.60 "On additional measures to ensure academic and organizational-managerial independence of state higher educational institutions" <https://lex.uz/docs/5793264?ONDATE=25.12.2021%2000> and Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.61 "On measures to grant financial independence to state higher educational institutions" <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/5793256>. For example, the educational organization employs 15 people, of which 87% are women and 13% are men.

The educational organization has a mechanism for regularly adapting teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as the current needs of practical healthcare. This mechanism includes planning and monitoring, studying and evaluating the improvement and ensuring the quality and integrity of the educational programme, credit hours and the academic degrees and qualifications awarded.

This demonstrates compliance with Standard 2 regarding adapting learning to the needs of master's students. At the same time, alongside the principles of quality and academic honesty described in the document, there are planning and monitoring, research and evaluation, improvement and ensuring the quality and integrity of the educational programme, credit hours, and the awarded academic degree and qualification.

This demonstrates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting learning to the needs of master's students.

2.4 Curriculum content

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes. These were developed in accordance with the requirements of the Qualified Character Reference and the State Education Standard, discussed at department meetings, the faculty council and the CMC, and approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process rests with the head of the department, Sh.Ye. Amonov.

The content of the work programmes and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including clinical pharmacology, as well as the specifics of research and development and the scientific achievements of teachers, as well as the specifics of research and development and the scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following: development of methods for the treatment and prevention of congenital and acquired pathology of childhood. The teaching staff is actively working on the publication of educational and teaching aids. Over the past 5 years, the Academy staff has published 8 units of educational literature (textbooks, teaching aids, methodological recommendations (Annex 2.9) reflecting modern trends in the development of world medical science and practice, which makes it possible to introduce these achievements into the

educational process. Acts of introducing scientific achievements of medical practice into the educational process, new technologies for the manufacture of drugs, new diagnostic methods, methods of determination using innovative reagents undergo the necessary registration procedure. For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Otorhinolaryngology", the organization has the resources to organize the assessment of practical skills of master's students (assessment of practical skills (abilities) in simulated conditions in specialized (special) disciplines is used). However, there are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programmes, including 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". Experts have found that in the educational programme, the requirements of legislation were taken into account, including those related to the provision of preventive, specialized and social medical care to the population of the republic.

The ratio between cycles within the specialty programme is determined by the standard: the curriculum comprises 5,400 hours/180 credits (UZ) – 192 (ECTS). Elective courses comprise 780 hours/26 credits (UZ) – 27 (ECTS) of the total course load. (Annex 2.4.1-2.4.4)

The volume of general education disciplines accounts for 86% of the total volume of disciplines. The general education disciplines include scientific activity disciplines totaling 2,700 hours/90 credits (UZ).

The potential future roles of a master's degree graduate, namely, medical expert and manager, are developed through courses such as "Healthcare Management", "Fundamentals of Medical Management" and "Improving the Quality of Medical Care. Legal aspects of physician activity are discussed in the "Legal Foundations of Medical Practice" course at the Department of Forensic Medicine”.

The scientific component in the training of master's students is formed by the discipline "Methodology of scientific research", including clinical research and clinical epidemiology.

The educational organization guarantees adjustments to the structure, content and duration of the educational programme in the event of any changes in various sciences, demographics and in response to the needs of the healthcare system. To this end, a process for developing, reviewing and approving the educational programme is coordinated and regulated by internal regulations, and the EP is reviewed and discussed annually.

Teachers provide master's students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with 88% being fully satisfied, 10.5% being partially satisfied, and 1.5% being dissatisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base, the RSSPMCP with 500 beds and 200 outpatient visits, and 29 clinical bases of the Tashkent State Medical University. It also concluded 360 agreements with medical organizations, including, within the framework of the academic mobility programme of the CHILDCA project, during 2022-2023, 6 teachers completed internships at the University of Arad, Romania, 4 teachers completed internships in Poland, Germany and Italy, 3 master's students completed training in Kazakhstan.

In response to the survey question, "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient management, etc.)?", 92% of master's students fully agreed, 6.5% partially agreed, and 1% disagreed. Furthermore, 91.5% of master's students stated that the teacher provides feedback after classes (listening to their opinions, conducting a mini-survey, and an error analysis session). Meanwhile, when asked, "Are master's student representatives involved in the development of educational programmes?", the experts responded positively. 92.5% of the master's students surveyed were completely satisfied with the class schedule.

The master's programme includes foundations and research components (120 hours) in the first year and clinical research (1,470 hours) in the second and third years. Teachers use a critical assessment methodology for scientific literature and medical research data, which is supported by documents such as the Curriculum and the Subject Syllabus. This learning format is organized through a monthly “journal club”.

Master's students confirmed that evidence-based medicine is integrated into their education. Specifically, by using clinical protocols in patient management, master's students are familiar with evidence-based literature.

A survey of master's students revealed that their educational institutions provide access to student participation in research, with 84% fully satisfied, 14% partially satisfied, and 1% dissatisfied. Master's students should engage in research, and in their responses to the survey, 84% indicated they were already engaged in research, 14% planned to start, 1% were searching for a research topic, and 1% were not currently engaged.

2.5 Learning methods and experiences

The primary learning methods in the master's programme are case-based learning (CBL), problem-based learning (PBL), team-based learning (TBL), business games, role-playing games, “brainstorming”, group discussion, combined questioning, small-group learning and presentations (master's-centered learning). Supervising is provided in accordance with the Master's Programme Regulations (approved in 2015). In interviews with master's students, experts found that teachers most often organize research projects. The clinical supervisor is responsible for teaching master's students practical skills and methods for performing job responsibilities in accordance with the curriculum, monitoring the quality of medical care and assisting in addressing deficiencies. Feedback is provided daily, and master's students can ask their supervisor any question and also have access to medical records and the patient management information system through the mentor's account (under their control).

Virtual learning methods are used, including the use of information and communication resources, which include attending medical conferences, consultations and teaching using Web technologies; learning through research (research work and preparation of a master's thesis, participation of master's students in the implementation of scientific grants).

Simulation-based learning technologies are being implemented to improve the effectiveness of practical training and to enhance and reinforce practical skills. A simulation center opened in 2022. The center provides practical training for students, starting from preclinical departments, postgraduate training of master's degree students, clinical postgraduate doctors and physicians.

Despite the institute's presence on a simulation center for the specialty of Otorhinolaryngology, master's degree programmes are not offered there.

Given the specific nature of master's degree training in this specialty, clinical training is conducted with real patients using high-tech equipment and techniques only in the relevant programme components.

The principles of quality, academic honesty and anti-plagiarism (**ESG II Part 1.3**) are documented in the Order of the Cabinet of Ministers dated August 7, 2024 under No.27/8, 50, as well as the order of the Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation dated October 14, 2024 under No.381 "On improving the quality of education in order to prevent (plagiarism) and comply with copyright" in universities. <https://lex.uz/docs/6788000> . Based on this order, an internal document of TashSMU dated November 18, 2024 under No.594 was issued on the verification of master's theses under the “Anti-plagiarism” programme (Annex 2.5.3.). The experts asked master's students, "What do they understand by academic honesty?" and received the following response: "It's honesty, fairness, responsibility, respect and trust". The experts concluded that the principles of academic honesty in master's programmes primarily relate to areas such as: Academic honesty is applicable at stages of master's education, including basic disciplines, clinical sciences and skills, behavioral and social sciences, and interdisciplinary specialties. Master's students are informed of their rights and responsibilities in the Working Curriculum and the Subject Syllabus. The head of the department and the responsible teacher are responsible for this. Master's students' ethical compliance is based on the Ethical Rules of Conduct and reflected in the Regulations for Master's Students (<https://ssv.uz/uploads/pages/buyrug88-23032022.pdf>).

Experts confirm that the educational organization provides master's students with the necessary skills and abilities that can impact their personal development and be applied in their future careers (**ESG II Part 1.3**). This is confirmed by the results of a study of documents such as the Master's Programme Regulations, as well as by the results of class visits, meetings with teachers and a master's student survey.

Principles of equality, including gender, cultural and religious ones, are observed with respect to master's students and teachers, as enshrined in the University Charter, the Regulations on the Master's Programme and the State Educational Standards. A visit to the educational institution revealed no instances of non-compliance with these principles. The primary document for the educational institution is: "The educational activities of the Institute are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan (<https://lex.uz/docs/6445147>) and the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.ZRU-63 dated September 23, 2020, "On Education" (<https://lex.uz/ru/docs/5013009>)." Since 2021, the institute has been granted financial and academic independence (Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated December 24, 2021 No.60 "On additional measures to ensure academic and organizational-managerial independence of state higher educational institutions" <https://lex.uz/docs/5793264?ONDATE=25.12.2021%2000> and Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.61 "On measures to provide financial independence to state higher educational institutions" <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/5793256>), establishes the principle of equal rights of all citizens to education, regardless of gender, age, social status and other factors.

Teaching and learning methods are regularly adapted to changing conditions (**ESG II Part 1.5**) and the requirements of practical healthcare. For example, the educational programme management (Department of Education Quality Assurance) has added elective courses on "Clinical Pharmacology" and "Radiology" to the curriculum, which were developed based on surveys and employer visits. The choice of clinical learning site for master's students was also based on an analysis of the needs for otorhinolaryngology training.

Of the 39 master's students surveyed, 87% responded that teachers use active and interactive learning methods in classes quite often, while 11% believe that they do so rarely or sometimes.

2.6 Curriculum delivery and training facilities

Master's degree students in the accredited educational programme are trained in accordance with the State Educational Standard and the Standard Curriculum, which includes training at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels of medical care. Master's degree students can study in laboratories at the Tashkent State Medical University and the RSSPMCP. An agreement has been signed with each clinical site for the period from January 1, 2025, to January 1, 2028. The Department of Otorhinolaryngology is responsible for this agreement. The clinical sites provide master's degree students with the opportunity to complete their internship programme, create the necessary conditions, and possess physical facilities that comply with current sanitary and technical standards and ensure all types of theoretical and practical training stipulated by the curriculum, as well as the effective implementation of master's degree research. To achieve the goals of the Master's programme, all healthcare opportunities are effectively used, including on-the-job training (in the form of rotation and night calls for students as physician assistants at the medical facility - the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University complex, the ENT unit of the 7th City Hospital, as well as in accordance with agreements between the Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy-life" medical institutions, agreement from 01.01.2025 to 01.01.2028, agreement No.1, dated 27.05.2020). A total of 370 agreements have been signed for the current year.

The experts visited the following clinics: the multidisciplinary clinic of Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy-life" medical facilities, each with 3 classrooms and a lecture hall, and 8 supervisors involved in the educational process. Currently, 40 master's students are enrolled in the accredited programme: 11 first-year students, 12 second-year students and 17 third-year students, respectively. They are fully provided with clinical training (a sufficient number of patients in the specialty).

The selection of clinical sites was based on the structure of the educational programme and related disciplines. The authority to select/determine the clinical site for master's degree students is free. These medical organizations are accredited: TashKhMU (October 2019), RSSPMCP – October 9, 2024 (ISO 9001:2015 Certificate No.: QMS-1623/A, Order No.: 1801/01, valid from October 4, 2024 to October 3, 2027).

Experts ensured that master's students have access to medical facilities' resources. When interviewed, master's students confirmed they have full access to patients and units at the clinical site.

The following employees and stakeholders, including employers, master's students and graduates, participated in the planning, development, discussion and approval of the educational programme (**ESG II Part 1.2**). The master's programme was approved at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council of TashSMU, Minutes No.10, June 23, 2025.

The master's programme was approved at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council of Tashkent State Medical University, Minutes No.10, June 23, 2025. Approval of the master's programme includes: A review was received from an internal reviewer, Professor S.S. Arifov, Head of the Department of ENT Diseases at the Tashkent Institute for Advanced Medical Studies, and an external reviewer, Professor D.F. Shamsiyev, Head of the Department at the Tashkent State Dental Medical Institute.

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (*standard 2*) and the general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the education quality assurance department and a conversation with the head and staff.

The experts reviewed the work of the divisions, including the otorhinolaryngology department. A total of 9 meetings were held, and cross-examination revealed that the implementation of the EP is fully compliant with the State Educational Standard, the Standard Curriculum and the Working Curriculum.

The training of master's students in the specialty "Otorhinolaryngology" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. Thus, during a conversation with the organization's management, experts received information about the clinical work of master's students, and teachers confirmed that the training of master's students is carried out directly in clinical units: the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University complex, where the ENT unit has 29 beds, the 7th city hospital - the ENT unit with 25 beds, as well as in accordance with agreements between Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy-life" medical institutions, where ENT beds are part of the surgical unit - 60 beds. Master's students in this specialty can manage patients with such diseases as: acute and chronic stenosis of the larynx, chronic polypous rhinosinusitis, acute and chronic otitis media, bilateral chronic sensorineural hearing loss of grade 4 and preparation of patients for cochlear implantation, chronic tonsillitis, adenoiditis in children, exudative otitis media.

During a practical session by G.K. Babakhanov on the topic of Chronic Laryngeal Stenosis: Its Etiology, Pathogenesis, Diagnosis, Clinical Presentation, Emergency Care, Treatment and Prevention, the experts discussed with the master's students how the organization facilitates the development of their practical skills, including using simulation equipment. At the same time, the master's students deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop their communication skills.

2.7 Opportunities for higher degrees and research

The educational institution has the following opportunities for conducting research: for example, 2nd-year master's student Abdullayeva Nargiza Rustamovna: topic "Clinical and immunological characteristics of allergic rhinitis", 2nd-year master's student Bozorova Dildora: topic "Features of the treatment of chronic rhinosinusitis in children with bronchial asthma", 2nd-year master's student Sagidullayeva Dilnoza: topic "Clinical characteristics and assessment of the quality of life of patients with chronic polyposis rhinosinusitis".

Within the framework of the accredited master's programme, the department's staff conducts research: Master's students can be informally involved in scientific research. For example, in 2024, first-year master's student U. Korabayeva participated in the international Olympiad held at the

Samarkand Medical Institute and took 1st place in the ranking between universities. In 2025, first-year master's student Diyera Erkinova participated in the international Olympiad at the Samarkand Medical Institute and took 2nd place. <https://sputniknews.uz/20211104/ozbekistonda-otmlar-reytingi-elon-qilindi-21228341.html> . According to the prestigious UK ranking organization "Times Higher Education" and the agency "Young University Rankings - 2022", the institute received status in the ranking of young universities "Reporter".

During the 2024-2025 period, master's students prepared 18 articles and 8 abstracts, averaging 12 presentations at international scientific and practical conferences. The results of their research are presented in the form of reports and conference presentations. Journal clubs are held monthly, where master's students present their latest advances in medicine. Master's students presented 12 conference presentations, including 4 at international conferences, 5 at national conferences, and 3 at university scientific forums. These presentations included oral presentations, poster presentations and participation in roundtables, which contributed to the development of research skills, professional competence, and the ability to present research results in the field of otorhinolaryngology.

The master's students interviewed confirmed that they are provided access to research equipment and scientific events held at the training facilities, such as functional diagnostics rooms and laboratories.

Findings by criteria. Comply with 28 standards: fully -26, partially - 2, not compliant - 0.

Standard	Standard compliance	Recommendations for improvement
2.3.1	Partially completed	Expand the list of electives
2.4.4	Partially completed	Include an elective course on scientific research methodology.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment policy and system

A study of control and measurement equipment for the “Otorhinolaryngology” specialty (including 1,000 tests of varying difficulty levels, 200 tasks and 300 final assessment questions) revealed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of master's students' academic achievements. During interviews, master's students described the assessment methods. For example, assessment of master's students' theoretical knowledge and practical skills is carried out at the following levels: primarily, formative (daily) assessment; midterm assessment (surveys upon completion of certain sections of mandatory courses); assessment of independently prepared topics; final assessment, which is conducted orally; and the state final attestation at the end of training. Students are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from their teachers. The assessment results appeal system is reflected in the document. The assessment results appeal system is reflected in the Master's Programme Regulations and the Master's Degree Assessment Charter. There have been no precedents for appeals during the educational institution's operation. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills but also professional behavior and communication skills, as evidenced by the following: observation of master's students during management and examination of patients, provision of medical care and laboratory practice. **(ESG II Part 1.3)**

Validation and reliability assessment of master's degree student assessment methods (tests, tasks and cases) are carried out as follows: to ensure reliability and validity, assessment tools for the semi-annual and annual assessments undergo an expert review, the results of which are presented in 2 reviews.

The educational institution has a practice of engaging external examiners to assess master's degree students, which is documented in the Master's Programme Regulations. This ensures the independence and objectivity of assessment results. **(ESG II Part 1.3)**

This ensures the independence and objectivity of assessment results. **(ESG II Part 1.3)**

Thus, to verify the data for *Standard 3*, experts interviewed Sherzod Sadullayevich Abdullayev, Head of the Master's Degree Department, and reviewed the documents and methods for assessing master's degree students.

The organization has 1,000 test assignments of varying difficulty levels, 200 case problems and 300 questions for the final knowledge assessment in Russian and Uzbek, which were compiled and approved at a meeting of the Otorhinolaryngology Department (Minutes No.1 dated August 26, 2025). The control and measurement equipment were reviewed by D.F. Shamsiyev, Professor and Head of the Otorhinolaryngology Department at the Tashkent State Dental Medical Institute. The Head of the graduate academic office responded that additions and updates to the control and measurement equipment are planned for annual updates. The principles, methods and criteria for assessing master's students' knowledge during examinations and certifications, the format of the examinations, passing scores and the number of permitted retakes are set out in the Charter on the Assessment of Master's Students' Knowledge.

The results of master's degree student assessments are documented through departmental analysis, faculty council meetings, the CMC and the Institute's Academic Board. A report is compiled based on the student's performance, identifying any shortcomings and providing recommendations for addressing them.

Over the 5 years, the FSA results showed that overall academic performance remained good throughout the analyzed period, averaging 4 points (out of 5). However, a slight decline in academic performance was noted in the 2020-2021 academic year. This can be attributed to the COVID-19 pandemic, although the academic performance indicator during that period increased to 99%. To date, no appeals have been filed by master's students.

During a visit to organization and a conversation with Zh.B. Sattarov, Head of the Education Quality Assurance Department, the commission was convinced that a documentation system exists that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees. This system includes documents such as annual operational plans, annual reports, divisions' regulations, agreements with teachers and master's students, the Code of Ethics, the Regulations on the Master's Programme, the Academic Policy, and learning and teaching documentation (work programme, working curriculum, syllabuses and journals), assessment tools (checklists, reports), certificates, verifications and credentials. A website review revealed that the following documents which are necessary for master's students are posted on its pages: The Code of Ethics, the Regulations on the Master's Programme, the Academic Policy, the Regulations on the Clinical Site, and information on the Syllabus, the Procedure for Monitoring and Assessing Student Knowledge, and "On the Procedure for Forming and Approving a Database of Test Assignments by Subject," which is regularly updated.

During a visit to the organization, management was asked: "Are external examiners involved to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" The answer was positive.

During interviews with 10 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts obtained convincing information: 60.34% of teachers use the OSCE, and 51.72% use portfolios. Master's students also shared their opinions on the timeliness of test delivery, pre-exam counseling, clarity of the entire assessment process and its fairness. For example, master's students reported that 91.5% are satisfied with the knowledge and skills assessment methods.

The 13 employers surveyed also noted that graduates' training is aligned with current developments in medical practice and science, as they were satisfied with their clinical training. Employers said they participate in the evaluation of master's students themselves, as they are included on examination committees. However, the educational institution did not provide systematic feedback to them. Employers believed that independence was the most desirable skill for master's degree graduates.

3.2 Assessment in support of learning (formative assessment)

The assessment system regularly identifies the strengths and weaknesses of master's degree students, including testing and oral questioning (knowledge assessment), analysis and resolution of

practical situations, business games, etc. (skill development and assessment). A comprehensive assessment for a lesson is determined based on the assessment of knowledge and skills, as well as the student's active participation in the lesson. Formative assessment is conducted at each lesson, typically after the seminar and using case problems or tests. Formative assessment of master's degree students also includes assessment of their level of mastery of practical skills developed during practical classes and is conducted in classrooms with patients. Formative assessment is recorded in a journal, which is reviewed by experts. Teachers regularly provide feedback to master's degree students based on their assessment results. Feedback from master's students following their assessments is collected in the form of a checklist and published in group chats with the teacher and on Telegram. In interviews, master's students confirmed that they receive feedback after completing their studies.

Through feedback from master's students, improvements were made, including the ability to select a research topic based on their interests in collaboration with their academic advisor and the inclusion of pedagogy and psychology courses in the first year.

Experts reviewed resources for organizing knowledge and practical skills assessments, as well as a bank of test questions and case problems.

Experts determined that the choice of assessment methods for master's students relies on OSCEs and on-call assessments, as the practical component of training is central. For example, formative assessment methods such as skills and professional behavior assessments facilitate interprofessional learning. Clinical observations, meanwhile, demonstrate integrated learning and a focus on clinical skills. Established assessment methods ensure that master's students have mastered all sections of the curriculum and acquired the necessary practical skills.

According to master's students, teachers provide them with information about the results of their assessments. **(ESG II Part 1.3)**

3.3 Assessment in support of decision-making (summative assessment)

Summative (final) assessment of master's students involves: first, systematically collecting and analyzing information on the master's student's achievements throughout the course of study. This may include grades on tests, practical exercises, clinical observations, project participation and other activities. Second, various assessment methods are used to obtain a complete picture of the master's student's performance. This may include written tests, practical exams, clinical observations, assessment of skills and professional behavior, and participation in group projects or discussions. The third stage involves comparing the master's student's achievements with established standards and assessment criteria. This allows us to determine how well the students meet the programme requirements and professional standards.

The criteria for admission to the final assessment include completing all assessment procedures, and a final grade is generated that reflects the master's student's overall performance in the course. This grade can be expressed numerically (e.g., as points or percentages) or qualitatively (e.g., "excellent", "good", "satisfactory," etc.).

This is documented in the Charter on the Quality Assessment Rating System and the Regulations on the Master's Programme.

Admission to the independent examination of master's students is based on good academic performance. In the educational organization's practice, master's students (including those in other specialties) pass the independent examination 100% of the time.

The assessment of master's students' clinical decision-making is conducted using a checklist and reflects the objectivity of the summative assessment.

The fairness and objectivity of the summative assessment is confirmed and documented in the Charter on the Quality Assessment Rating System.

The reliability and validity of quantitative data from the assessment results of master's students is ensured by the Department of Otorhinolaryngology and the Department of Education Quality Assurance **(ESG II Part 1.3)**.

3.4 Quality assurance of the assessment system

The mechanisms that guarantee the quality of all assessment methods applied and the existing master's degree assessment system as a whole are supported by the following: assessment methods and results are carried out according to the course schedule; they are consistent and communicated to students in advance (a point-rating system). The assessment system is objective, as it is determined by the criteria set out in the relevant regulations. The rating system is one of the reasons for eliminating conflicts of interest. The educational institution engages independent examiners to assess master's degree students. For example, in 2024-2025, leading specialists from the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan and employers were included in the assessment committees. This is stipulated in the Regulation on the Master's Programme (approved in 2015).

The results of formative and summative assessments are discussed at department meetings, and conclusions are drawn regarding the assessment methods and content.

Patient safety issues are included in the assessment of master's students.

The Department of Otorhinolaryngology reviews its formative and summative assessment methods twice annually. These reviews are documented in the Protocols and annual reports. *An employer survey conducted in 2024-2025 showed that graduates of the Otorhinolaryngology programme demonstrate high performance (ESG II Part 1.3).* The experts were familiar with the results of the master's student assessments for 2019-2014, which showed that all master's students successfully passed their final exams and received a Master's Diploma (Annex to Standard 3).

EEC findings by criteria Comply with 15 standards: fully - 15, partially –0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 4: MASTER'S STUDENTS

4.1 Selection and progression policy

The educational institution has a policy for the admission of master's students, called the Academic Policy. Approaches to master's student admission are based on national requirements and internal regulations, namely Article 50 of the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On Education", the National Programme for Personnel Training, Decrees and Resolutions of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, and Resolutions of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan. Transparency of the selection process and equal access to master's programmes are ensured through the official website of the State Testing Center (now the Knowledge Assessment Agency) - <http://my.uzbmb.uz> and the Unified Portal of Interactive Public Services (EPIPS) - my.gov.uz, as confirmed in paragraph No.PP-61 of the Presidential Resolution of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On measures to grant financial autonomy to state higher educational institutions" dated December 24, 2021.

This document outlines approaches to the admission of master's students with disabilities.

The document takes into account requirements for master's applicants regarding their previous undergraduate and internship achievements (e.g., English language proficiency and IELTS certificate), and also describes safety requirements (e.g., instruction from a responsible teacher or moderator). **(ESG II Part 1.4)**

The educational institution has created a barrier-free learning environment, including ramps, call buttons, elevators and toilet for disabled people. To meet the needs of master's students with disabilities, the institute's buildings and equipment are constantly maintained and updated. Parking is permitted near the buildings, and access to the buildings is ensured. The institute has installed the necessary equipment for students with disabilities, classrooms are furnished with appropriate furniture, and students can live in specially adapted dormitory rooms. The institute's lecture building is adapted for the needs of master's students with disabilities.

The educational process is organized in accordance with the individual needs of master's students; individual counseling is provided if necessary; data on master's students with disabilities is integrated into database systems, which facilitates the learning process and guarantees confidentiality.

Approaches to the admission and transfer of master's students from other educational institutions are reflected in paragraph of the Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.PP-279 "On the organization of admission to study in state higher educational institutions" dated June 15, 2022.

The appeals procedure for admission to a master's programme is outlined in the Master's Programme Regulations. To date, there have been no appeals. **(ESG II Part 1.4)**

Representatives of students, specifically master's students, are involved in the development of the admissions and selection policy for master's students. Feedback is being sought from master's students on this issue, and the following changes have recently been made to the master's admissions approach: new master's degree specialties have been included.

The review of the admission and selection policy and the number of master's degree students is carried out annually, and the Education Quality Assurance Department is responsible for this.

During the 2022-2024 period, 20 master's students were admitted to all educational programmes, including the programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". The total number of master's students graduating during the admissions start dates for all specialties was 22, including those in the accredited educational programme 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". The educational organization analyzed the practical healthcare sector's need for otorhinolaryngologists and determined that the annual admission to the educational programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" would be 22. This figure is consistent with resource capabilities. Employer feedback serves as the source of information on the need for otorhinolaryngology specialists. Based on the standard: 1 ENT physician is per 20,000–30,000 people, the combined public and private healthcare systems in the Republic of Uzbekistan create a need for approximately 12,000 otorhinolaryngologists, which significantly exceeds the current workforce capacity. This indicator highlights the need to expand the training of specialists in "Otorhinolaryngology" and strengthen human resources policies at the country's medical universities. Currently, there are 2,284 ENT physicians. Therefore, the current personnel shortage in "Otorhinolaryngology" in the Republic of Uzbekistan is approximately 9,700 specialists, confirming the need to expand training, strengthen specialized departments and increase the number of specialists in this specialty as part of the national healthcare development strategy.

Thus, the experts validated the self-assessment report data according to *Standard 4*. The experts reviewed the master's degree admissions documentation, including the Academic Policy and the Charter on the Quality Assessment Rating System. Many of the documents were well-written.

4.2 Performance improvement and exit from the programme

Processes and opportunities for improving the academic performance and professional development of master's students, as well as the conditions under which a master's student may be dismissed from their programme, are documented in the Academic Policy, approved on August 31, 2022.

Academic advising of master's students is conducted and based on the results of monitoring the academic progress of master's students, including reports of unforeseen incidents that could potentially cause harm to a patient, and on the "Academic Policy" document. The practice of academic advising, personal support for master's students and the development of not only professional skills were assessed by experts through interviews. *Interviews with master's students and graduates revealed the following: 92% of master's students responded that they have sufficient time for practical training.*

Teachers prevent unexpected incidents involving master's students that could potentially cause harm to patients. This is accomplished by assessing their mastery of practical skills. According to teachers, no such incidents were observed during the 2022-2024 period. At the same time, the Department of Otorhinolaryngology has developed a "department policy" that sets out requirements

for master's students in 70910204 – “Otorhinolaryngology”. Each master's student is familiar with and applies informed patient consent for examination, treatment and medical procedures in their clinical practice. Before classes, master's students are instructed by their teacher on compliance with the rules of conduct in a medical organization and sign a document - the Instruction Log. This was confirmed by the master's students during their meeting with experts.

Social, financial and personal support for master's students is provided in accordance with Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. UP-6208 dated April 20, 2021, and documented in Resolution No.605 of the Cabinet of Ministers dated September 24, 2021, "On measures to implement a system for rent payments to master's students residing on the basis of a rent right". 400,000 sums were paid from the state budget per master's student residing on a lease (contract) basis. For the period 2022-2024, support was provided to 5 master's students from the regions for paying for rented housing. Support is also provided to pregnant and nursing master's students of an accredited educational programme. This support consisted of a scholarship allowance of 575,000 sums. Master's students studying on a fee-paying contract basis receive a scholarship allowance of 150,000 sums per month. In addition, master's students renting apartments receive a 400,000-500,000-sum social package. Psychological support for master's students is provided through free consultations with a psychologist. The confidentiality of this assistance is regulated by the Academic Policy. The Head of the Finance and Economics Department is responsible for this.

To support career planning for master's degree graduates, employment services are provided. The employment rate for graduates of all master's programmes was 100% in 2024. A graduate career center (**ESG II Part 1.4**) operates in accordance with the Master's Programme Regulations (approved in 2015).

4.3 International medical graduates

The “Academic Policy” governs the recognition of qualifications in the master's programme. Admission of international applicants to the master's programme is governed by the Master's Programme Regulations. No international master's students were admitted for the 2022-2023 period, including to the accredited programme 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology". The “Academic Policy” and the “Master's Programme Regulations” guarantee equal opportunities for master's students. An agreement is signed with master's students, a copy of which is given to each student and one copy is kept in the dean's office.

The dean's office is responsible for identifying the challenges faced by international applicants to the master's programme. To this end, department staff were interviewed, and they shared information on the following issues: tuition fees, cultural differences and adaptation, and restrictions upon returning to their home country for employment. There are currently no master's students who do not speak the state language or Russian, so experts have not identified any issues with completing professional clinical training. International master's students can leave feedback about the master's programme via questionnaires. No negative feedback was received from master's students during the review period.

4.4 Master’s student work and study

Master's students are provided with a programme that defines their goals, objectives, overall workload and work hours, their areas of responsibility and the intended learning outcomes. Master's students are informed about their supervisors. Currently, 8 clinical supervisors at 3 clinical sites are involved in the training of master's students in the accredited programme. Master's students are informed about the number and timing of formative assessments and final examinations. Information about the examinations is published on the university website. The experts reviewed the information on the website in the examinations section.

Master's students participate in events organized by clinical sites, in accordance with the Comprehensive Plan for the Joint Activity of the Educational Organization’s Clinic. Experts reviewed this plan for 2024 and found that master's students participate in joint events. The Department of

Otorhinolaryngology is responsible for developing the plan. The master's students' clinical training programme includes management of 80 patients per month, participation in (assistance to) surgeries such as adenotomy, tonsillectomy, septoplasty, functional endoscopic rhinosurgery, mastoidectomy, antrotomy, tympanoplasty and middle ear sanitizing surgeries. Home visits are also included, along with 4 calls. All of this is regulated by the document "Regulations on the Clinical Site".

Department teachers inform master's students of the conditions for their participation in providing medical care through supervisors, based on the Clinical Site Regulations. The Education Quality Assurance Department, through the department head and moderators, ensures that the programme component involving master's students' participation in providing medical care does not dominate.

If a master's student is forced to interrupt their studies (due to pregnancy, maternity leave, illness, or military service), the educational institution has the following provisions: the master's student's application for academic leave is reviewed within one week and formalized by order of the rector (director) of the higher educational institution. In accordance with this order, at the students' request (or discretion), their studies may be transferred to part-time, distance learning or external studies for the duration of the academic leave. For this purpose, an individual study plan is developed for the master's student in accordance with the Master's Programme Regulations and Academic Policy.

4.5 Master's student safety

The legal status of master's students regarding the provision of medical care to patients is defined in the Agreement on Master's Degree Studies. Medical care is provided annually by the teaching staff and the 56-family polyclinic of the Yunusabad district of Tashkent, where master's students undergo medical examinations. This activity is coordinated by the Clinical Sites Department.

The physical safety of a master's student during training is regulated by the Safety Procedures, which the master's student signs before starting training, as well as by the clinic's documents, including the Instruction Log.

Master's students' psychological safety is ensured by a full-time university psychologist. Master's students can contact department staff and the psychologist if they experience psychological stress. A psychologist is available to provide psychological support in the event of personal trauma or a critical situation.

4.6 Master's student remuneration and fees

Master's students receive a monthly scholarship allowance of 575,000 sums. Students on a fee-paying contract basis receive a monthly scholarship allowance of 150,000 sums. In addition, a social package of 400,000-500,000 sums is provided for master's students renting accommodation. The official document, "Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.UP-6208 dated April 20, 2021, and Resolution No.605 of the Cabinet of Ministers dated September 24, 2021, 'On measures to implement a system for paying rent for master's students renting accommodation'", describes the funding for master's students and is posted on the university website. The payment policy is revised based on the results of the final assessment. Master's students may work 0.5 of their full-time position during their free time, in accordance with Resolution No.561 of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated October 3, 2022, "On Improving the Personnel Management System of State Medical Institutions". This year, there are 18 such master's students, including 18 master's students in the accredited programme.

In special circumstances (e.g. disabilities, family situations), an individual training programme for master's students is applied, which includes individual counseling or distance learning. In special circumstances, master's students are granted academic leave. According to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers dated 03.06.2021 under No.344, the Regulation on granting academic leave to students of higher educational institutions was approved. In accordance with the Decree of the President dated 03.02.2021 under No.UP-6155 "On the state programme for the implementation of the action strategy for five priority areas of development of the Republic of Uzbekistan in 2017-2025", the

following procedure for granting academic leave is established: master's students who are unable to continue their education in the traditional form due to illness, child care or a sick family member are granted the right to receive academic leave; According to the Regulation, academic leave may be granted to students of higher educational institutions in the following cases:

- during military service;
- for health resumption;
- during pregnancy and childbirth;
- for childcare;
- for care of a sick family member (father, mother or persons in loco parentis, spouse, child).

A master's student's application for academic leave is reviewed within a week and formalized by order of the rector (director) of the higher education institution.

Granting a master's student an academic leave is not considered their expulsion from the higher education institution. During the academic leave, the student is not paid any scholarship allowance.

Experts have determined that in this case, the duration of study is adhered to on a case-by-case basis.

4.7 Master's student health and welfare

Master's students are provided with professional and personal support focused on their physical health, personal welfare and psychological welfare, including “professional burnout”, through consultations with a staff psychologist. During a meeting with experts, master's students mentioned that they can obtain legal assistance by contacting the graduate academic office and Clinical Residency.

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 19 standards: fully - 19, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 5: TEACHERS AND CLINICAL SUPERVISORS

5.1 Teacher and clinical supervisor establishment

There are 5 full-time teachers and zero part-time faculty members. The requirements for teachers in the master's programme take into account the high level of scientific and pedagogical potential of the 8 Clinical Supervisors. The department head is responsible for hiring teachers.

The academic degree holder rate is 100%, with five (100%) holding the highest category. Master's students in the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are trained by 5 teachers at the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University Complex, which has a 20-bed ENT unit; 7th city hospital, which has a 25-bed ENT unit; and also, under agreements between the Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy-life" medical institutions, where the ENT beds are part of the 60-bed surgical unit.

The experts reviewed the teachers' job descriptions and the clinical site regulations.

The experts were familiar with the personnel policy, the Supervisor Regulations and the Academic Policy. The teacher-to-master student ratio is 9:1.

Staff incentives are regulated by the institute's bylaws, specifically <https://tashpmi.uz/> . In accordance with current legislation, teaching staff and other categories of employees are entitled to salary supplements based on their qualification category, academic degree, and, according to working conditions, for hazardous work conditions. The principles of ethics and academic honesty for teachers are reflected in the Code of Ethics. During interviews with teachers, they confirmed their awareness of this issue and their adherence to high ethics and academic honesty.

To verify the self-assessment report data for *Standard 5*, external experts obtained teachers' opinions on the HR policy, which included the absence of hiring restrictions based on gender, race, nationality or language. A conversation with the head of the HR department allowed the experts to learn about approaches to recruiting clinical site faculty for teaching (there is only 1 such faculty member), the strategy and tactics for master's student enrollment, the informational support for the educational programme, and to identify challenges in human resource management and development.

There are technical and administrative staff to support the educational programme (**ESG II Part 1.5**), including the Department of Infrastructure Maintenance and Development.

A survey of teachers revealed that the majority (87.93%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace at this educational institution, while 6.9% were partially satisfied. At this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in research and publish their research results – 93.1% completely agree, while 5.17% were partially satisfied. 70.69% were completely satisfied with the HR service, while 22.41% were partially satisfied. 56.9% were completely satisfied with their salaries, while 24.14% were partially satisfied.

5.2 Ethics and conduct of teachers and clinical supervisors

The HR policy defines the responsibilities and obligations of teachers in the high-quality education of master's students. This is described in the section defining and describing the responsibilities and obligations of teachers for the high-quality delivery of education while adhering to the principles of ethics and academic honesty.

The responsibilities and obligations of clinical supervisors are described in the Regulation on the Clinical Site (approved in 2024).

The principles of ethics and academic honesty for teachers are described in the Code of Ethics. The teachers interviewed confirmed that they were aware of the Code of Ethics. The official publication of these documents is available on the university website in the HR Policy section.

The monitoring system and process for improving the performance of teachers (**ESG II Part 1.5**) and clinical supervisors are regulated by the document "Rules of Pedagogical Ethics for Educational Organizations" developed and approved in accordance with the established procedure by the Ministry of Preschool and School Education and the Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation of the Republic of Uzbekistan, respectively. Teachers are certified by the Commission for the Study of the Activities of the Teaching Staff. A teachers' survey is also conducted by the Education Quality Assurance Department. *According to the results of a survey of teachers in 2025, more than 87.93% were satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university.*

5.3 Continuing professional development for teaching and clinical supervisory staff

During a meeting with the head of the human resources department and during interviews with teachers, experts obtained opinions on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation for working with master's students, and the implementation of supervising, which are also during interviews with teachers, experts obtained opinions on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation for working with master's students, and the implementation of supervising, who undergo advanced training in their specialty every five years.

Experts determined that teachers and master's students have sufficient time for teaching, supervising and learning. Teachers' work schedules are established in the Regulation "On the Procedure for Hiring Teaching Staff in Higher Education Institutions". Working hours are 8:00 AM to 5:00 PM. The Therapeutic load is specified in the Clinical Site Regulations and is as follows: Department Head – at least 18 hours per month; Professor – at least 20 hours per month; Associate Professor – at least 22 hours per month; Senior Teacher – at least 25 hours per month; Assistant – at least 30 hours per month.

Experts received feedback on the teacher advanced training programme. The faculty undergoes continuing professional development in both pedagogy and pediatrics at the Main Scientific and Methodological Center of the Republic of Uzbekistan (<https://bimm.uz/ru>). This approach guarantees that each faculty member receives training in pedagogical competencies at least once every three years. 5 teachers participating in the educational programme completed training in 2023-2025, including 5 teachers from the accredited educational programme in "Otorhinolaryngology". These activities are funded by the educational organization. The expert verified the teachers' certificates in the following topics: Microsurgery of the Middle and Inner Ear and Functional Endoscopic Rhinosurgery.

Teachers' salaries consist of a basic salary; a teaching staff and other categories of employees receive salary supplements based on their qualification category, academic degree, and, according to working conditions, for hazardous working conditions.

Supervisors are funded in accordance with current legislation.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for master's students, stimulating the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

The human resources policy (**ESG II Part 1.5**) and approaches to engaging clinical supervisors are reviewed annually in line with the changing needs in postgraduate medical education. The most recent review was conducted in 2024, and the following changes and additions were made: a rating system for assessing teaching staff performance was introduced as part of the employee incentive programme, which annually evaluates all areas of teachers' performance, and based on the results, differentiated pay is established.

There are opportunities for career growth and development of teachers' competencies within educational institutions - 86.21% of surveyed teachers responded, and 12.07% partially agreed. 37.93% attended professional advanced training programmes less than a year ago, 32.76% - during the current year, 15.52% more than three years ago, and 3.45% answered "I don't remember when".

The organization implements social support programmes for teachers - 63.79% answered that "yes, such programmes exist", 3.45% - "I have already taken advantage of this", 1.72% of respondents answered that there are no such programmes, and 24.14% of respondents do not know about this.

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 8 standards: fully - 8, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 6: EDUCATION AND TRAINING RESOURCES

6.1 Physical facilities for teaching and learning

Master's students are trained at the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University complex, which has a 20-bed ENT unit, and at City Hospital No.7, which has a 25-bed ENT unit. The clinic has also been operating under agreements between Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy Life" medical institutions, which have 60 ENT beds in the surgical unit, including master's students in the accredited educational programme in 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" at Tashkent State Medical University and the RSSPMCP. The clinic has a total of 710 beds. The clinic also includes 10 classrooms, 2 conference halls for seminars and journal clubs, a research laboratory, a 380-seat library, a 50-seat computer lab and a 335-seat testing center.

Before beginning the relevant course of the educational programme, master's students receive a syllabus from their teacher, indicating the skills they should acquire and develop during their studies.

The educational organization provides master's students with opportunities for practical and theoretical training through the Information Resource Center.

Access to the latest professional literature and international sources is provided through work in the branch of the National State Medical Library with a reading room.

Access to simulation equipment is provided in the Simulation Center.

A safe learning environment in functional/instrumental diagnostic laboratories/rooms (**ESG II Part 1.6**) is ensured by familiarizing master's students with occupational health and safety regulations before the start of classes, as well as through a safety briefing, instructions on working with equipment and chemicals, and procedures related to protection against microorganisms. The experts reviewed the Safety Regulations, the Instrument Performance Test Log, the replacement of faulty parts, the power supply check, and other necessary measures to ensure safe operation of equipment. The master's students interviewed confirmed their knowledge of these documents.

The educational institution conducts research in the following areas: Congenital and acquired pathologies of childhood. Over the past 5 years, progress has been made in implementing these areas in practical healthcare. Master's students in years 1-3 are involved in the research work (or parts thereof). They perform tasks such as analyzing scientific literature, compiling clinical data, and

preparing reports and presentations. All information about the research work is included in the master's student's portfolio, the structure of which is based on the Regulations on the Master's Programme.

The curriculum includes topics where master's students explore medical research methods (in nasal pathologies and paranasal sinuses, anomalies of the outer and middle ear, inflammatory diseases of the middle ear, laryngeal pathologies in children and adults, and pharyngeal diseases). The total number of hours is 1,872.

If master's students conduct scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

For example, in the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology", research is planned on the following topics: Clinical and immunological characteristics of allergic rhinitis, Treatment of chronic rhinosinusitis in children with bronchial asthma, Comprehensive diagnosis and improvement of treatment for recurrent otitis media in children, Improving the diagnosis and treatment of purulent rhinosinusitis in pregnant women, Clinical characteristics and assessment of quality of life of patients with chronic polypous rhinosinusitis, Clinical and immunological aspects of chronic adenoiditis in children. Choice of treatment tactics for various clinical forms of chronic tonsillitis and Optimization of treatment for allergic rhinitis in children with adenoid vegetations. This information was obtained through interviews with teachers and master's students.

The physical facilities, including its library collection, are regularly updated. Over the past 5 years, the following has been updated: the development of new teaching aids, books, online resources and other materials; the acquisition of new models of medical equipment and laboratory instruments; the creation of dedicated patient examination rooms, reception areas and other specialized spaces. **(ESG II Part 1.6)**

Interviews with 5 full-time teachers revealed that there are both successes and challenges in educational management, depending on the specific base (master's students' access to equipment, a sufficient number of specialized patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work.

6.2 Postgraduate medical education based on clinical training

Experts assessed the documentation maintained by master's students, including call schedules, rotations across units, the introduction of seminars, scientific-practical, scientific-pedagogical, etc., and semi-annual or annual reports.

A review of resources demonstrated that they are aligned with the goals and objectives of educational activities. For example, the visit was to clinical sites of the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University Complex, which has a 20-bed ENT unit, and City Hospital No.7, which has a 25-bed ENT unit. In accordance with agreements between Tashkent State Medical University and the "Happy Life" medical institutions, ENT beds are part of the surgical unit. The educational institution's staff ensures collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and clinical site management to achieve master's degree students' intended outcomes. A sufficient number of specialized patients (e.g., those with middle ear, nasal and paranasal sinuses, laryngeal pathologies) are provided, modern equipment is demonstrated and accessible to students, and teachers ensure high-quality education while adhering to ethical and deontological principles.

During a visit to the clinical sites of the Tashkent State Medical University and the RSSPMCP, experts assessed the resources, their compliance with the educational programmes, their accessibility for teachers and master's students, and the extent to which the equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

To validate the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of programme quality, interviews were conducted with master's degree students. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with the learning, sufficient time for patient management, working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and teachers' qualifications, social and moral support for master's students who need it, participation in "Journal Clubs", and access to international professional literature databases. Overall, master's degree students were satisfied with the learning and assessment methods, and specifically entered this institution because they believed the educational institution had good

resources, a strong reputation and international connections. At the same time, they would have liked more autonomy in patient management and the organization of international events.

A fully equipped simulation center is available. Despite the institute's simulation center, master's students in the educational programme 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are not required to hold classes there.

Master's students in the educational programme 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" can practice their practical skills: providing emergency care to patients with cardiovascular pathologies, is also included in the curriculum. Therefore, master's students' training in the simulation center is an integrated part of their clinical training.

The master's students demonstrated their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, and provided their views on the organization of learning, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research projects and funding. They also demonstrated a broad range of knowledge. The experts reviewed the master's students' documents (portfolios, master's student assessment checklists and master's student survey results).

To develop master's degree students' teamwork experience, the educational organization conducts activities such as joint educational projects, mobility and academic exchange, research and partnership projects with the support of the European Commission, WHO, UNICEF and other international organizations. Collegiality in master's degree students' work is evident in their interactions with master's degree students from other specialties and physicians at clinical sites. Master's degree students can conduct health education activities for patients and training sessions for interns. Interprofessional collaboration is also achieved through interdisciplinary collaboration. For example, second-year master's degree student Dildora Bozorova held a class on the topic "Characteristics of the Treatment of Chronic Rhinosinusitis in Children with Bronchial Asthma". Master's degree students can conduct health education activities for patients and training sessions for interns. For example, second-year master's degree student Muzaffar Bazarbayev held a class on "Improving the Efficiency of Diagnosis and Treatment of Psychosomatic Changes in Pharyngeal Tonsil Hypertrophy in Children".

In the questionnaire, master's students noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 93.5% of teachers completely agree with this, 5% partially agree, 1% found it difficult to answer.

Regular upgrades to clinical facilities and equipment and other educational resources are carried out in accordance with the changing needs of master's degree training. The planned and current number of master's degree students is taken into account to ensure a 3:1 ratio of master's degree students to teachers. The Department of Otorhinolaryngology determines the profile of clinical supervisors, and the Education Quality Assurance Department evaluates their compliance with the goals and objectives of the master's programme, their level of education and their proficiency in teaching methods. For example, from 2022 to 2024, 5 clinical supervisors completed the "Pedagogy" seminar. Clinical supervisors are provided with the following materials for master's degree training: conducting research projects.

Educational expertise encompasses the following areas of otorhinolaryngology, which are presented in the form of research, including dissertations.

The educational organization participates in educational projects such as "diversifying the implementation of international programmes for the development of higher medical education and research activities based on educational projects".

The employees of the Education Quality Assurance Department conducts annual monitoring of the quality of educational programmes, and the results are included in the Department Meeting Minutes.

Sociological surveys, including issues of educational quality, could become one of the mechanisms for educational expertise.

The expertise is conducted through an analysis of specialist needs and an analysis of master's degree teaching methods, and the results allow conclusions to be drawn about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

Incentive payments, in addition to salary, are established as mechanisms for motivating and developing employees and teachers' interest in conducting research in postgraduate education. Staff incentives are regulated by the institute's local regulations, in particular <https://tashpmi.uz/>. In accordance with current legislation, teaching staff and other categories of employees are provided with salary supplements based on their qualification category and academic degree. A rating system for assessing teaching staff performance has been implemented as part of the employee incentive programme. This system annually evaluates all areas of teachers' activity, and differentiated pay is determined based on these results.

6.3 Training master's students at alternative clinical bases

The academic policy for master's degree students includes the option of studying in organizations if existing clinical bases don't cover all the topics of the educational programme. Meanwhile, master's degree students in the specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are trained at the multidisciplinary clinic of the Tashkent State Medical University Complex, which has a 20-bed ENT unit, and at the City Hospital No.7, which has a 25-bed ENT unit. Students also study under agreements between the Tashkent State Medical University and "Happy-life" medical institutions, where the ENT beds in the surgical unit comprise 60 beds, and where there are units with a total of 60 beds. Master's degree students study subjects of the educational programme, such as diseases of the upper respiratory tract and ear in children and adults, in clinical units.

The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the supervision of a teacher and does not require additional training. As part of the CHILDCA academic mobility programme, 6 faculty members completed internships at the University of Arad, Romania, 4 faculty members completed internships in Poland, Germany and Italy, and 3 master's students completed training in Kazakhstan during 2022-2023. A document on the transfer and academic credit recognition between educational organizations is available in the Academic Policy (**ESG II Part 1.2**).

63 cooperation agreements and 92 memorandums have been concluded with organizations, universities and associations, including international organizations. This collaboration allows for the integration of learning methods and technologies into master's degree programmes. For example, in the specialty of the accredited educational programme, international cooperation is ongoing with Poland, Germany and Italy, and 3 master's students have completed training in Kazakhstan.

The teachers at the educational institution actively participate in national and international events. Department staff are partners and closely collaborate with international organizations such as WHO and UNICEF. All are national trainers specializing in training and implementing the latest WHO and UNICEF recommendations on child nutrition, monitoring child growth and development, and managing and treating children with various diseases (grade 4 sensorineural hearing loss, implementation of cochlear implants).

- Over a 5-year period, 4 teachers were trained abroad in the following topics:
- Endoscopic Rhinosurgery, Septoplasty in Children, Cadaver Courses – Prof. Kh.E. Karabayev (2023, Turkey)
- Functional Endoscopic Sinus Surgery (FESS), Skull Base Surgery, Otoplasty – Assoc. Prof. Zh.D. Ergashev (2025, South Korea)
- Clinical Otorhinolaryngology, Diagnosis of Inner Ear Pathology – Prof. Sh.E. Amonov (2023, Poland)
- Modern Educational Methods, Clinical Otorhinolaryngology, Inner Ear Pathology – Prof. Sh.E. Amonov (2024, France).

6.4 Information sources, resources and use

Experts assessed master's students' and teachers' access to essential web resources, including virtual and information and communication resources, as well as access to electronic media (at the Information and Resource Center). Master's students confirmed that they can use the Electronic Library, including when preparing for classes.

The experts visited the library, which provides access to the Electronic Library for master's students and employees. A total of 62,748 pieces of literature on the accredited specialty are available in hard copy and 30,446 in electronic form. The main monographs in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are the following: the textbook "Anatomy, Physiology and Methods of Examination of the Ear" by Sh.E. Amonov, Kh.E. Karabayev, and others; and the textbook "Pediatric Otorhinolaryngology" by Sh.E. Amonov, Kh.E. Karabayev, G.K. Bobokhanov, and U.B. Mukhitdinov. "Otorhinolaryngological and orthodontic issues of pathology of the rhinomaxillary complex in children" - Khasanov S.A., Makhsudov S.N., Babakhanov G.K., Tashkent: "University", 2022. - 284 p. ISBN 978-9943-829; "Rhinosinusogenic orbital complications in children" - S.A. Khasanov, Kh.N. Abdullayev, Tashkent, "EFFEKT-D" - 2021. ISBN 978-9943-7839-7-3; "Modern view on the diagnosis and treatment of tympanosclerosis" - Amonov Sh.E., Ismatova K.A., ISBN 978-9910-7427-3-6 © Publishing house "Fan ziyosi", 2024; "Acute rhinosinusitis in young children" - Karabayev Kh.E., Mamatova Sh.R., Tashkent, © Publishing house "Fan ziyosi", 2024. ISBN 978-9910-7428-2, they are available in the library.

Access to international databases is available: Scopus and Web of Science. Master's students are aware of this.

Information and communication technologies (ICTs) are represented by "MOODLE" and "HEMIS". The educational programme uses "MOODLE" and "HEMIS". During independent study, master's students use MOODLE. Access to patient data and the healthcare information system is provided through the MIS. Master's students manage 1-2 patients per day, including completing the necessary documentation under the supervision of a teacher.

Thus, the educational organization provides master's students, teachers and clinical supervisors with access to information and the use of innovative information and communication technologies. **(ESG II Part 1.8)**

Over the past 2-3 years, the following information and communication technologies have been implemented: "MOODLE" and "HEMIS". An Electronic Library is used to organize independent study for master's students. An Information and Resource Center is used to ensure seamless information exchange with fellow students. Access to relevant patient data and healthcare information systems is organized through the MIS **(ESG II Part 1.6)**.

The experts reviewed the following documents regulating these processes: Academic Policy and the Master's Programme Regulations.

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 15 standards: fully - 15, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 7: QUALITY ASSURANCE AND IMPROVEMENT IN POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION

7.1 The quality improvement system

A quality assurance system has been implemented, documented in the Regulation on the main professional educational programme, the Regulation on the work programme, the Regulation on the point rating system, the Regulation on the state final certification (approved in 2024), which includes a work schedule for the working group, as well as assessment tools and reporting forms.

The decision-making and change management process for master's degree programmes is regulated by the Education Quality Assurance Department. This document was developed and approved by the Education Quality Assurance Department. **(ESG II Part 1.1)**

The experts evaluated the programme for monitoring the processes and results of the educational programme, which includes the stage of reviewing the educational programme, the internal reviewer

Professor Arifov S.S., Head of the Department of ENT Diseases of the Tashkent Institute of Advanced Medical Studies, the external reviewer Professor Shamsiyev D.F., Head of the Department of the Tashkent State Dental Medical Institute. The review was received from the Tashkent Medical Academy, Head of the Department of ENT Diseases Professor Khassanov U.S. (minutes No.10 dated June 23, 2025), a discussion of the programme was held at a meeting of the Otorhinolaryngology Department (minutes No.1 dated August 26, 2025), and feedback was collected on various elements of the master's programme through a survey of master's students.

A master's student survey is conducted annually and covers topics such as master's student concerns, classroom conditions and equipment, access to clinical sites, patients, laboratories, equipment, availability of educational literature, and more. The results of the master's student survey, conducted by the Education Quality Assurance Department in 2025, showed that master's students are generally satisfied with their education at the department.

The Education Quality Assurance Department also conducts employer surveys, and the Career Center conducts employer surveys. As a result of analyzing the employer survey results, the following changes were made: topics on pedagogy and psychology were included in the first-year course.

A 27-question questionnaire was developed to survey teachers, covering topics such as the organization of the educational process, the environment, salary levels, the prior training of master's students, and other issues. The results of the teachers' survey, conducted by the Education Quality Assurance Department in 2025, showed that teachers were generally satisfied with their research, teaching and clinical work in the department. **(ESG II Part 1.9)**

The selection and alignment of teachers and teaching methods is also based on feedback from master's students. For example, the results of the master's student survey led to the regulation and implementation of a procedure for assessing the achievements and quality of interactions between master's students and each teacher, as well as the inclusion of these assessments in the institute's personnel policy.

Programme assessment takes into account the goals and objectives of the learning and the intended learning outcomes (through master's student assessment and independent examination). The programme's implementation is assessed through feedback from master's students and teachers, as well as graduate achievements.

Approaches to master's degree admissions are assessed through questionnaires.

Assessment methods for master's degree students' knowledge and skills are assessed using a checklist and demonstrate step-by-step assessment of practical skills.

Monitoring and assessment of the quality of the educational programme in master's degree specialties includes feedback from employers, feedback on the quality of training and graduate performance, and master's degree students' satisfaction with the organization of the educational process and the curriculum, and is conducted quarterly.

Feedback from clinical supervisors includes a questionnaire administered by the Education Quality Assurance Department.

Thus, stakeholders **(ESG II Part 1.9)**, including master's students, graduates and employers, are involved in the monitoring programme and evaluation activities of the educational programme.

The results of the clinical practice assessment of master's students and graduates of the master's programme are communicated through publication on the website and at department, CMC and Academic Board meetings. Therefore, stakeholders such as employers are informed of the monitoring results and receive feedback, as well as those responsible for master's student admissions and educational programme planning.

Interviews with 13 employers were conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of master's degree students, participation in the training of master's degree students through supervising, providing the department and master's degree students with the necessary resources for

practical training and the development of medical judgment, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of master's degree graduates, etc.

Employers praised graduates for their knowledge of diagnosing and treating ENT diseases. The employment rate over 5 years was 100%.

The results of master's students and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programmes. The final assessment results for master's students in various specialties in 2024-2025 show the following: first-year master's students – 4.0-4.1; second-year – 4.75; third-year – 4.0-4.75.

Thus, the results of the independent assessment of master's students in 2024 showed that all graduates successfully passed the final assessments.

Teachers rated the level of clinical training of master's students in 2023 and 2024 as successful.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring master's students is concentrated in the Education Quality Assurance Department and the Internal Inspection Department, the results of the clinical practice assessment of master's students and graduates are immediately reported to the responsible officials. The Department of Master's Studies is responsible for master's programmes. To improve the educational process, the following measures have been taken over the past 2-3 years: implementation of a rating system of remuneration and financial incentives; provision of opportunities for advanced training at the institute's expense; creation of conditions for the use of computer and office equipment, technical training aids, and other equipment; promotion of participation in international scientific paper competitions and competitions for individual grants; publication of methodological developments for staff.

The educational organization initiates procedures for regularly reviewing and updating its organizational structure through feedback. The current organizational structure of the postgraduate education sector (Master's programmes) was approved in 2025. The following is new: The Center for Employment and Career Development.

The master's degree programme's curriculum, programme structure and content, master's degree competencies, and knowledge and skills assessment methods are analyzed annually based on feedback from students and employers. The experts reviewed the minutes of the 2022-2025 meeting of the Otorhinolaryngology Department, as well as the minutes of the CMC. In particular, in Minutes No.10 dated June 23, 2025, the selection of learning methods for the master's degree programme was discussed, a decision was made on master's degree assessment methods, and the approval of the elective courses for the accredited master's degree programme was considered at a meeting of the Otorhinolaryngology Department.

The Master's degree student portfolio form was approved at the CMC meeting (Minutes No.1 dated August 27, 2025). The experts reviewed the Master's degree student portfolios.

Evaluation of educational resources and the compliance of clinical sites with the goals and objectives of the Master's degree programme in 70910204 “Otorhinolaryngology” is carried out regularly and is documented in the Institute's Charter, Strategic Development Plan, annual plans and reports.

Monitoring and evaluating the quality of the master's degree programme includes employer feedback, feedback on the quality of training and graduate performance, and master's student satisfaction with the organization of the educational process and the curriculum. The information collection mechanism consists of online and written data collection. The Center for Graduate Employment and Career Development oversees and processes the information throughout the year (online) and once a year (written data).

The curriculum renewal process is based on prospective studies, including feedback on the quality of training and graduate performance, master's student satisfaction, and an analysis of employer feedback. **(ESG II Part 1.10)**

Teachers participate in international and national educational events.

7.2 Patient safety

A quality assurance system has been implemented, including analysis of master's student errors and patient safety, and is reflected in the "Academic Policy", "Regulations on the Master's Programme" and "Regulations on the Clinical Site". Analysis of master's student errors is the responsibility of the department head and moderator.

Master's students are briefed on the Code of Ethics for Medical Professionals, the rules of conduct within the medical institution, and the need to fulfill obligations toward physicians, teachers, patients and their families in accordance with the Code of Conduct. Compliance with the Code is monitored by teachers and clinical supervisors.

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 10 standards: fully - 10, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Governance

The experts reviewed the governance structure of postgraduate medical education, which includes the Department of Master's Degrees and Clinical Residency. The structure was approved in 2025. The Education Quality Assurance Department is responsible for supervising. The Clinical Sites Department is responsible for selecting clinical training sites and concluding contracts with them.

Experts reviewed the strategic development plan for the period 2022-2027, which outlines development areas, including the training of competent otorhinolaryngologists, promotion of research and teaching activities, and improvement of the healthcare system through the implementation of innovations.

The department also has a work plan for the current year. After reviewing the annual reports of the Otorhinolaryngology Department, experts concluded that work is underway in several areas, including teachers' development, science and clinical work.

The Department for the Management of the Anti-Corruption System "Compliance Control" is responsible for reputational risks and the image of the educational organization, and experts met with its staff.

Master's degree programmes are conducted in accordance with the requirements of such regulatory rules regarding the admission of master's students as the Regulation on the Master's Programme and the Academic Policy. Assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out based on the Regulation on the Procedure for Monitoring and Assessing Knowledge (Annex No.1 to Order No.432 dated September 11, 2025). To implement the educational programme, the educational institution has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by the Graduate academic office. The experts reviewed the documents on completion of master's students' studies, including those on completion of master's students' studies. A certificate of completion of the master's programme is issued to master's students upon completion of the entire programme of study and contains information on the courses completed and the dissertation defense.

The Regulation on the Procedure for Knowledge Assessment and Monitoring (Annex No.1 to Order No.432 dated September 11, 2025) was developed by the Education Quality Assurance Department and approved by the Academic Board. Teachers participated in the development of the programme.

All employees are informed about the programme through its posting on the university website.

The educational programme for specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" is supported by relevant learning and teaching documents and teachers.

Completion of master's students' training is documented by the issuance of a Master's Diploma, which is recognized by the national authorized healthcare bodies. Thus, the educational institution complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies.

Thus, the educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the educational activities of the institute are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan <https://lex.uz/docs/6445147> , the Law of the Republic of

Uzbekistan No.ZRU-63 dated September 23, 2020 “On Education” <https://lex.uz/ru/docs/5013009> . Since 2021, the institute has been granted financial and academic independence (Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated December 24, 2021 No.60 “On additional measures to ensure academic and organizational-managerial independence of state higher educational institutions” <https://lex.uz/docs/5793264?ONDATE=25.12.2021%2000> and Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.61 “On measures to grant financial independence to state higher educational institutions” <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/5793256>).

8.2 Shared governance

The responsibilities and obligations of the leadership and staff for postgraduate medical education are defined by the graduate academic office and Clinical Residency and are codified in the “Academic Policy” document. Transparency of governance and decision-making in the educational process is ensured through discussions at the CMC and the Academic Board, as reflected in the “Academic Policy” document.

The educational organization evaluates the management of the educational process and employees in relation to the achievement of the mission of the master's programme, the expected intended learning outcomes by providing feedback to master's students and teachers (see Section 7.2 of the report), conducting certification based on the document "Order of the Rector for the Study of the Activities of Teachers", and audits on issues of the quality of the educational process.

In response to the survey question “Do the organization’s management listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research and clinical work?”, 75.86% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 15.52% answered “sometimes,” 3.45% - “quite rarely” and 1.72% - “never”.

Funding for master's programmes is provided by the educational institution's budget and through state support. The division of finance and economics is responsible for planning and allocating funds for master's programmes. The scope of duties, responsibilities and authorities are reflected in the employee job descriptions approved by the Academic Board. A financial plan is prepared annually, including a target budget for training, which amounts to 8,629,919.00 sums. The financial plan is aligned with the strategic plan for 2022-2027. The share of funding for master's programmes has increased, given the expansion of master's specialties. The largest portion of funds is spent on equipping the simulation center. During a meeting with financial sector employees, experts found that the salary fund amounts to 4,832,737.00 sums, and the scholarship fund amounts to 872,660.00 sums.

A financial report is submitted annually, which is approved by the Supervisory Board and demonstrates, among other things, the distribution of educational resources in accordance with needs and the coverage of all types of expenses (payments from the Student Incentive Fund, information and communication services, etc.) for the implementation and development of the Master's programme.

Today, experts are confident that the educational organization has financial and organizational stability, since 2021 the institute has been granted financial and academic independence (Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated December 24, 2021 No.60 “On additional measures to ensure the academic and organizational-managerial independence of state higher educational institutions” <https://lex.uz/docs/5793264?ONDATE=25.12.2021%2000> . Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.61 “On measures to grant financial independence to state higher educational institutions” <https://lex.uz/uz/docs/5793256>).

The organizational structure update process: The Center for Advanced Technologies and Strategic Initiatives was opened in 2022. This center succeeded the Innovation Center and was established based on Order No.410 of TashSMU dated October 3, 2022. The "CAREER CENTER - TPMI" was established; a department for coordinating work on providing master's students with housing; a department for the commercialization of scientific and innovative developments; and an anti-corruption department. The master's degree programme has been updated, including the introduction of pedagogy and psychology courses in the first year.

Updates are introduced through discussion at the CMC and the Academic Board and are accompanied by the development of job descriptions for the Rules. The educational organization annually allocates resources for continuous improvement in the amount of 739,116.00 sums in 2024-2025. To specifically improve the educational process, sociological research is being conducted, including among employers, and literature on postgraduate medical education (master's degree) is being reviewed.

During this analysis, approaches to teaching in the master's degree programme were revised, and methods such as teaching by master's students during the undergraduate programme and providing one humanities day per week were introduced.

8.3 Master's students and staff representation

The following advisory bodies have been operating within the educational institution: the Academic Board and the Scientific Council, in whose work master's students participate. Mechanisms for rewarding master's students for their community service include financial support. During a survey of master's students, experts found that master's students may seek support from the following individuals if they experience various types of inappropriate treatment: verbally to their tutor; verbally and in writing to the dean's office (Telegram channel); verbally or in writing to the relevant vice-rector (Telegram channel); verbally and in writing to the rector (Telegram channel); and the leader of the Youth Union. The educational institution has a master's student development programme, which includes academic mobility, participation in international conferences and internships at foreign educational institutions. Master's students are included in advisory bodies such as the Institute Council and the Public Council.

8.4 Administration

The university has an appropriate administrative (4 people) and teaching staff (285 people), including management: 7. Experts determined that the quality management system (QMS) was implemented in 2019 and includes regular internal and external audits, including those supporting the master's programme processes. The quality management system (QMS) was implemented in 2019 in accordance with the Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated January 16, 2019, No. PP-4119 "On additional measures to improve the education quality control system".

The education quality assurance department is responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the QMS. Teachers are familiar with the QMS, as confirmed by interviews. The key QMS documents are the following: quality policy and goals, quality manual, documented procedures (such as document governance, internal audits and nonconformity governance), as well as work instructions, regulations and records for recording results.

The overall administration and governance of the educational process and the Master's educational programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" are assessed through careful and detailed annual planning, including its financial component. A balanced distribution of available resources is ensured through collaboration with university divisions and rational interaction between key structural divisions. Effective collaboration with the practical healthcare sector ensures positive development dynamics for the institute. **(ESG II Part 1.9)**

EEC findings by criteria. Comply with 8 standards: fully -8, partially - 0, not compliant – 0.

CONCLUSION: during the external assessment of the educational programme, it was determined that 107 of the 109 accreditation standards demonstrated full compliance. 2 standards were partially compliant. No non-compliance with the standards was identified.

Given that the initial accreditation of the educational programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" is underway and master's degree students are being admitted, in compliance with the requirements of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan No.ZRU-63 dated September 23, 2020

"On Education" <https://lex.uz/ru/docs/5013009>, the educational organization has initiated specialized (programme) accreditation. Therefore, the tasks of the external expert commission included assessing and studying the existing principles and approaches to master's degree training, quality assurance mechanisms and management of the master's degree educational programme. The EEC specifically examined the organization of training in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" including documentation, teaching staff, educational resources and other important issues related to compliance with accreditation standards.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the master's degree in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" of the Tashkent State Medical University:

Standard	Recommendations for improvement
2.3.1	expand the elective components (there are only 2 electives in the educational process – “Clinical Pharmacology” and “Radiology”)
2.4.4	Include an elective course in research methodology

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members established the compliance of the Master's degree educational programme in specialty 70910204 "Otorhinolaryngology" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	Full name
Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
International Expert	Milena Staneva Staneva
Academic Expert	Burkutbayeva Tatyana Nuridenovna
Academic Expert	Trynkin Alexey Viktorovich
Academic Expert	Kudabayeva Khatimya Ilyassovna
Academic Expert	Mukhambetova Gulnar Amerzayevna
Academic Expert	Akhenbekova Aida Zhaksybayevna
Academic Expert	Doshakanova Assel Baidaletovna
Academic Expert	Marat Aizada
Employer Expert	Ermetov Aziz Tashmetovich
Student Expert	Sartay Nurila Nurmakhankyzy

6. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК установили соответствие образовательной программы магистратуры Ташкентского Государственного Медицинского Университета по специальности «70910204 - Оториноларингология» Стандартам аккредитации программы последипломного медицинского образования (магистратура) и пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА аккредитовать данную программу на период 5 лет.

	ФИО	Подпись
Председатель	Тургунов Ермек Мейрамович	
Международный эксперт	Милена Станева Станева	
Академический эксперт	Мырзабекова Гулшара Туребековна	
Академический эксперт	Буркутбаева Татьяна Нуриденовна	
Академический эксперт	Трынкин Алексей Викторович	
Академический эксперт	Кудабаева Хатимия Ильясовна	
Академический эксперт	Мухамбетова Гульнар Амерзаевна	
Академический эксперт	Ахенбекова Аида Жаксыбаевна	
Академический эксперт	Дошаканова Асель Байдаулетовна	
Академический эксперт	Марат Айзада	
Эксперт-работодатель	Эрметов Азиз Ташметович	
Эксперт-обучающийся	Сартай Нурила Нурмаханкызы	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	Оценка		
			Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И ЦЕННОСТИ	6	6		-
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	28	26	2	-
3.	ОЦЕНКА МАГИСТРАНТОВ	15	15		-
4.	МАГИСТРАНТЫ	19	19		-
5.	ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ И КЛИНИЧЕСКИЕ НАСТАВНИКИ	8	8		-
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	15	15		-
7.	ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЕ И УЛУЧШЕНИЯ КАЧЕСТВА ПОСЛЕДИПЛОМНОЙ ПОДГОТОВКИ	10	10		-
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	8	8		-
	Всего:	109	107	2	-
			109		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы магистратуры

№	Наименования документов/дата утверждения	Количество
1.	Каталог элективных курсов	2
2.	Кодекс этики	2
3.	Документы контроля качества	23
4.	Музей (фотографии)	23
5.	Отдел финансов	1
6.	Клинические протоколы по Педиатрии	5
7.	Годовой отчет оториноларингологии	1
8.	Положение о магистратуре	1
9.	ППС	6
10.	Результаты анкетирования	2
11.	Списки участников интервью	6
12.	Таблицы профиля	12
13.	Генеральный сертификат	1
14.	Сертификаты	5
15.	ГОСО	1
16.	Клинические протоколы, разработанные ППС университета	1
17.	Критерии оценки знаний	3
18.	ТТУ структура	1
19.	Номенклатура	2
20.	Отчет о магистратуре	1
21.	Общая информация про университет	1
22.	Оториноларингология Силлабус	7
23.	Положение о клинической базе	1
24.	Положение о технике безопасности	1
25.	Порядок контроля и оценки знаний студентов	1
26.	Порядок утверждения тестовых заданий	1
27.	Список научных журналов	1
28.	Список соглашений с зарубежными ВУЗами	1
29.	Список главных специалистов МЗУз	1
30.	Приказ № 310	1