

**REPORT OF
THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
FOLLOWING THE ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH
THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION MASTER'S DEGREES
PROGRAMME IN MEDICAL AND HEALTH PROFESSIONS EDUCATION**

**KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY
MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAM
IN PUBLIC HEALTH**

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

According to the ECAQA Order No. 29 dated April 5 04, 2019, an External Expert Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct on 23-24.04.2019 the accreditation of the Master's degree program in "Public Health" of Kazakh-Russian Medical University with the following membership:



External Expert Commission Chairperson

SHAMSUTDINOVA ALPHIYA GUMAROVNA, PhD,
Head of the Center for Innovation and Education of the
Central Clinical Hospital JSC (Almaty) President of the
Association for Bioethics and Medical Law, Member of the
World Association of Medical Law, European Association of
Pediatrics and Adolescent Gynecology Tel. + 7778 957 60
57, e-mail: shamsutdinova@ckb.kz



International expert

RUDOY ANDREY SEMENOVICH,
M.D., professor, Head of the Military Field Therapy
Department – professor of Military-Medical Department
Belarusian State Medical University, associate member of
Academy of Military Sciences of the Russian Federation,
titular member of Russian Scientific Society of Physicians,
Eurasian Association of Therapists, European Society of
Cardiology, European Society of Gastroenterology
e-mail: andrew_rudoy@mail.ru



National academic expert

RAMAZANOVA MANSHUK ANEROVNA
Senior Professor, of Public Health Department
National Medical University JSC
tel.+77078228590, e-mail: m_ ramazanova00@mail.ru



Expert – representative of practical healthcare

TEKEBAEVA LATINA AYZHANOVNA,

Candidate of Medical Science, Director of the “Alfred +” Scientific and Clinical Center for Neurology and Rehabilitation, Head of Neurology and Neurosurgeon Department of Kazakhstan’s Medical University “KSPH”

Tel.+77078335758, e-mail: lati.teckebaeva@yandex.kz



Expert - Master's Degree Student

LIGAY DENIS NIKOLAEVICH

Master’s degree student in “Medicine” of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education JSC

Tel.+7 (700) 109 9913, e-mail: dionis_sergion@mail.ru



ECAQA observer - SARSENBAEVA SAULE SERGAZIEVNA

Doctor of Medicine, MBA

Member of International Pediatric Association (IPA),

Turkic World Pediatric Society

Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care , Director General

Tel. +77013291665, info@ecaqa.org

In the period from 03.12.2018 to 22.04.2019, assessment of conformity of the activities of Kazakh-Russian Medical University to the Standards for Accreditation Master’s Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education was carried out.

The EEC report contains an assessment of the university for compliance with the EQACA Accreditation Standards for the Master’s degree Programs, and recommendations of EEC on further improving of the university's Master’s degree programs implementation.

2. General part of the EEC final report

Representation of the university and the Master's degree program in "Public Health"

The Kazakh Russian Medical University (hereinafter referred to as KRMU) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, the KMI was renamed the Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

KRMU is currently representing a privately-owned medical education organization with the necessary material, technical, scientific and educational base, highly qualified academic and research staff (license for educational activity AB No. 0137388 issued by the Committee for Control of Education and Science MES RK June 2, 2010). KRMU conducts specialists training on the following levels: Bachelor's degree, internship, residency and Master's degree on the basis of the existing state licenses for the levels of higher and postgraduate, additional education in accordance with the current SCES RK.

According to the order of the acting Chairman of the Committee for the Control of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 No. 264 Master's degree courses in "Medicine" (license No. 0137388) and "Public health" (license №0162831) were opened in the Kazakh Russian Medical University.

Currently, 16 Master's degree students are trained in the Master's degree courses, 11 of them in "Public Health", 5 in "Medicine", 10 in the scientific and pedagogical direction, 6 - in the subject oriented. The teaching is conducted by 26 staff members and 2 part-timers. The total academic degree holders rate is 92.85%.

Over the years of its activity, the university has formed its brand, traditions and values, continuing to follow the course towards universities of international level, indicated by the leadership of the country. The principles of the Bologna process, the credit system of training are implemented in all specialties of Bachelor's degree.

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", KRMU was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and technological activities, certificate Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

The budget of KRMU is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of professionals of higher, postgraduate and additional education) and paid educational services. University funding is stable and contributes to the improvement of the material and technical base and an increase in the number of students.

The main applied research area of KRMU is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mHealth for the rural population. So, for achievements in the field of mHealth complexes development, the rector of the KRMU Jaynakbaev N.T. was awarded on July 1, 2015 the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute for Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS).

Since 2011, quarterly the University has published a journal "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine".

In order to develop international cooperation, 45 agreements and memorandums have been concluded with foreign institutions of higher education.

In 2012 and 2018, the University successfully passed the State attestation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Students' training is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. Mode of study - full-time. Over the 27 years of its activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 professionals who successfully work in the practical healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University carries out its Mission through the implementation of the educational program of higher and postgraduate education in "Public Health" (training period 1; 1.5; 2 years (Master's degree), the objectives of which are: training competitive professionals who are able to meet the needs of society in providing medical care, to use and improve advanced innovative technologies in practice and science, to use the achievements of information and communication technologies, to strengthen public health.

Mission and Vision, which were previously discussed and agreed with the stakeholders (faculty, employees, employers) are presented on the website <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/>, also KRMU develops its activities through the KRMU Strategic Development Plan (long-term) (<http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/>) and the Operational plan for the implementation of the strategy (academic year), which are discussed and approved at a meeting of the University Academic Council with the participation of stakeholder.

KRMU has its own Organizational structure, approved by the order of the rector (No. 277 dated 01.11.2018).

University management is implemented through collegiate bodies: Scientific Council (SC), Academic Council (AC), Scientific and Clinical Council (SCC), Local Ethical Commission (LEC), Coordination Council for Quality and Strategic Development (CCQSD), Council of Young Scientists and Student Scientific Society (CYSSSS).

3. Analysis of the compliance of the Master's degree educational program in 6M110200 - "Public Health" with the Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education and a review of the each standard strong point

Standard 1: Mission and outcomes

The External Expert Commission received confirmation that the mission of KRMU and the mission of the Master's degree program in "Medicine" is complied with the goals and objectives of postgraduate medical education, the needs of the country's health care system and the development of human resources in medical education. The participation of staff, employees, Master's degree students and employers in the discussion of mission and goals was established during interviews with Master's degree students and teachers, heads of departments and representatives

of practical public health. The development and approval of the mission and vision took place in accordance with the existing procedure, ensuring the involvement of all stakeholders, both at the planning stage and during the implementation of decisions made. Training on the "Public Health" Master's degree program, used in the accredited university, ensures the implementation of education outcomes, the list of which is included in the working curricula.

Strong points:

- orientation of the educational program in "Public Health" to the expectation of the employer and the labor market needs.

- focus of the educational process on the formation of professional responsibility, clinical skills, knowledge and skills to protect the patient's health, the desire for continuous self-improvement, continuous professional development and lifelong learning.

- introduction of innovative teaching methods into the educational process.

- integration of educational, diagnostic and treatment and scientific directions in the educational program of the specialty "Public Health".

- demand for KRMU graduates at the medical services market of Kazakhstan.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 20, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 1: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 2: Educational process

The educational program for the specialty "Public Health" is implemented in accordance with the mission, goals and expected learning outcomes and reflects the SCES, the needs and expectations of society. The methods, the forms of teaching and learning, as well as the content of EP are based on modern principles, contribute to the formation of professional competencies and determine the content, volume and sequence of learning components.

The EEC received convincing data on the methodological support of educational programs and the use of a variety of teaching methods by faculty. A high percentage of satisfaction with studying at KRMU was established when questioning Master's degree students.

Strong points:

- the qualitative content of the educational program that meets the needs of practical public health;

- competence-oriented approach;

- a variety of areas of training (individual educational path);

- educational infrastructure of three-stage training; conditions for the implementation of intellectual and creative abilities of Master's degree students;

- cooperation with scientific, pedagogical and medical organizations both abroad and within the Republic of Kazakhstan;

- compliance with state educational standards; constant material and technical base qualitative updating

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 16, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 2: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To introduce the distance learning component in the implementation of Master's degree programs to optimize the educational process and attract more students;

2) To take into account the actual needs of practical public health while developing electives; 3) To attract foreign partners as mentors, external reviewers of educational programs, teaching materials, scientific publications and Master's degree students' theses.

Standard 3: Assessment of student learning

The university's principles, methods and practices for evaluating the professional competencies of Master's degree students trained in "Public health" educational program, guarantee openness and accessibility, ensure that students achieve their learning outcomes and are comparable to the teaching methodology. A balance between formative and summative assessment is provided. Evaluation of academic skills corresponds to the level of the Master's degree course. During the interview, experts found that more than 90% of Master's degree students recognize the fairness and objectivity of methods for assessing their knowledge and skills.

Strong points:

- the formation and evaluation of all key competencies of the graduate;
- a transparent procedure for evaluating educational achievements at all stages of preparation;
- the focus of the educational program on the training outcomes;
- monitoring of how Master's degree students mastering learning outcomes through feedback to improve quality

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 9, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 3: accomplished

Recommendations: to activate feedback from Master's degree students and teachers to improve the educational programs.

Standard 4: Master's degree students

KRMU conducts an academic policy of tolerance: openness, transparency and accessibility, both at the stage of admission and throughout the entire period of study on the Master's degree course. Information about academic policy is updated and published on the website and is publicly available.

KRMU allocates and distributes resources to support Master's degree students. The University has allocated 10 intra-university grants for training on the Master's degree course in two specialties "Medicine" and "Public Health", *including 5 out of 4 in the specialty "Public Health"*. The EEC experts obtained evidence of an effective policy of attracting, recruiting and selecting students.

Strong points:

- high qualification of the departments faculty;
- participation of students in all medical events;
- Master's degree students' availability of information and service (library, academic counseling, career center)

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 12, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 4: accomplished

Recommendations: no.

Standard 5: Staffing

KRMU is fully provided with qualified academic staff with a high academic degree holders rate. There is sufficient availability of qualified mentors with sufficient research experience to prepare a Master's degree students thesis. University human resources are able to use modern pedagogical technologies and methods; creates the conditions necessary for the comprehensive development and socialization of the students' personality; shares advanced experience, which makes it possible to effectively implement vocational education programs in accordance with the academic staff qualification profile and requirements for educational activities licensing.

Strong points:

- academic degree holders rate, medical category of the highest qualification, a large medical and teaching experience of the academic staff;
- personnel policies aimed at encouraging and rewarding teachers in order to develop their experience in education;
- development of employees, support of their training, ensuring their further professional development (Teacher's school).

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 5: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 6: Educational resources, settings and scholarship

KRMU has a developed material and technical base, equipped with educational, methodical, and scientific literature on paper and electronic media, training, auxiliary technical means and information and communication technologies. The University conducts systematic work on the development, updating and supplementation of material and technical equipment and the introduction of new information and communication technologies in the educational process. Periodically it conducts faculty training with the involvement of domestic and foreign experts

Strong points:

- sufficiency of material and technical base for the training of Master's degree students in the specialty "Public Health";
- opportunity for students' self-training by providing access to educational resources of the library and the Internet

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 4, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 6: accomplished

Recommendations:

- 1) To use information and computer technologies while implementing educational programs and for development of Master's degree students' practical skills more actively;
- 2) To strengthen the magistracy section content of the website.

Standard 7: Monitoring and evaluation of educational process

KRMU has an effective system for monitoring the evaluation of educational programs, focused on students' satisfaction with the level of education they receive. The University systematically collects, analyzes, corrects and supplements the results of feedback from teachers and students on the stated mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan.

Strong points:

- the monitoring and evaluation system of the educational program, based on D. Kirkpatrick multi-level approach;
- the process of forming optional EP component;
- feedback from stakeholders; necessary conditions for the implementation of intellectual and creative abilities of Master's degree students of the educational program;
- implementation of training in the state and Russian languages; creative and occupational contacts with scientific, educational and medical organizations both abroad and within the Republic of Kazakhstan; compliance with state educational standards;
- constant high-quality updating of material and technical base.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 8, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 7: accomplished

Recommendations: To promote feedback from Master's degree students and teachers to improve the educational programs.

Standard 8: Governance and administration

KRMU management has a sufficient level of managerial competencies, takes responsibility for the implementation of all processes that ensure the achievement of the mission. The management system and its activities are open, transparent and accessible. The leadership of the university is ready and capable of change. This ensures the effectiveness of management activities.

Strong points:

- continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the educational program mission;
- transparency of the management system and decisions made;
- the responsibility of academic leadership in the development and management of the educational program was defined;

- stable financial condition of KRMU;
- broad cooperation with partners in the health sector

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 19, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 8: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 9: Continuous renewal

KRMU is continuously reviewing the organizational and staff structure, updating the goals and functions of the strategic development plan and regulatory documents taking into account the needs of health care and society, upgrading the material and technical base, improving modern educational technologies and innovations in the learning process to implement the institutional goals and objectives of the college, needs of students and practical health care.

Strong points:

- academic staff advanced training, every 5 years, incl. on pedagogical competences; participation of academic staff at training events (seminars, workshops, conferences);
- introduction of innovative technologies in the educational process;
- exchange of experience with colleagues from other organizations of education and science, processes of management of the Master's degree program, which include monitoring, evaluation and revision.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 4, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 9: accomplished

Recommendations: to intensify the introduction of the program three-lingual education at the Master's degree level.

4. Recommendations for the improvement of the Master's degree program in "Public Health" of the Kazakh Russian Medical University;

1) To introduce the distance learning component while implementing Master's degree programs to optimize the educational process and attract more students;

2) To take into account the actual needs of practical health care while developing electives;

3) To use information and computer technologies in the implementation of educational programs and the development of practical skills of Master's degree students more actively;

4) To promote feedback from Master's degree students and teachers to improve the educational programs;







5) To strengthen the content of Master's degree section of the website;

6) To attract foreign partners as mentors, external reviewers of educational programs, teaching materials, scientific publications and Master's degree theses;

7) To improve the implementation of the program of three-lingual education at the Master's degree level.

7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу по специальности магистратуры 6М110100 «Сестринское дело» АО «Казахский Медицинского Университет Непрерывного Образования» на период 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Балмуханова Айгуль Владимировна	
Члены ВЭК:		
Зарубежный эксперт	Поздеева Татьяна Васильевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Калиева Шолпан Сабатаевна	
Эксперт-представитель практического здравоохранения	Абдрасулов Рашид Болатович	
Эксперт-магистрант	Сыздыкова Азиза Биржанкызы	
Наблюдатель от ЕЦА	Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна	

7. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Members of EEC reached common ground to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit Master’s degree educational program 6M110200 “Public Health” for a period of 5 years.

EEC Chair	Shamsutdinova Alphiya Gumarovna	_____
International expert	Rudoy Andrey Semenovich	_____
National academic experts	Ramazanova Manshuk Anerovna	_____
Expert – Representative of practical healthcare	Tekebaeva Latina Ayzhanovna	_____
Attendee-expert	Ligay Denis Nikolaevich	_____
ECAQA observer	Sarsenbaeva Saule Sergazievna	_____

Appendix 1.

Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the Master's degree program in "Public Health" of the Kazakh Russian Medical University

Standard	Evaluation criteria	Evaluation		
		Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled
1.	Mission and outcomes	20	0	0
2.	Educational process	16	2	0
3.	Assessment of student learning	9	1	0
4.	Master's degree students	12	0	0
5.	Staffing	10	0	0
6.	Educational resources, settings and scholarship	4	0	0
7.	Monitoring and evaluation of educational process	8	0	0
8.	Governance and administration	19	0	0
9.	Continuous renewal	4	0	0
	Total	102	3	0