

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF COMPLIANCE ASSESSMENT
OF THE RSE ON THE REM NATIONAL CENTRE OF PUBLIC HEALTH
OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH
OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN
WITH THE STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF
ORGANISATIONS FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL
DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS**

Dates of the site visit: June 25-26, 2019

1. Composition of the External Evaluation Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA order No.38 dated June 3, 2019, the External Evaluation Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct institutional accreditation of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals on June 25-26, 2019 with the following composition:



Chairman of the External Evaluation Commission

ALFIYA GUMAROVNA SHAMSUTDINOVA,
PhD,

Head of the Centre for Innovation and Education of the Central Clinical Hospital JSC (Almaty), President of The Association for Bioethics and Medical Law NGO, Member of the World Association for Medical Law, European Association of Paediatric and Adolescent Gynaecology

phone: + 77789576057, e-mail:

shamsutdinova@ckb.kz



Foreign expert

SAYRAGUL CHYNYBEKOVNA DOOTALIYEVA

Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Associate Professor, Acting Head of the Department of Pharmacy Management and Economics, Medicine Technology of I.K. Akhunbayev Kyrgyz State Medical Academy

phone: +996709888548, e-mail: dssaira@mail.ru



National academic expert

MANSHUK ANEROVNA RAMAZANOVA

Senior Lecturer,

Department of Public Health And Healthcare

National Medical University JSC

phone: +77078228590,

e-mail: m_ramazanova00@mail.ru



Expert-trainee

NARGIZ MARATOVNA ZIMBAYEVA

Head of sales of the YES !!! International Centre for
Medical Education

phone: +77072302600

e-mail: nzm730@mail.ru



Expert-representative of practical health care

RASHID BOLATOVICH ABDRASULOV

Candidate of MedSc, anaesthetist-resuscitator

National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology
of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of
Kazakhstan

phone: +7 702 984 2448

e-mail: rashid.001@mail.ru



ECAQA observer

SAULE SERGAZIYEVNA SARSENBAYEVA

DMedSc, MBA, Professor

Director General of the Eurasian Centre for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher
Education and Health Care NPO

Phone: +77013291665

e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The EEC report contains the evaluation of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health (hereinafter referred to as the NCPH) for compliance with the ECAQA Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals ECAQA (hereinafter referred to as the accreditation standards), and the EEC recommendations for further improvement of the operations.

2. General Part of the EEC Final Report

2.1 Introduction of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health was established in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 22, 2018 No. 24 “On Certain Issues of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan” by merging the following state-owned enterprises:

- 1) RSE on the REM “National Centre for the Formation of a Healthy Lifestyle” (NCFHL) of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- 2) RSE on the REM “Scientific and Practical Centre for Sanitary and Epidemiological Expertise and Monitoring” (SPCSEEM) of the Public Health Committee of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- 3) RSE on the REM “Khamza Zhumatov Scientific Centre for Hygiene and Epidemiology” (KhZhSCHE) of the Public Health Committee of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The NCPH is the legal successor of all rights and obligations of the above organisations, including obligations that are disputed by the parties.

The NCPH branches have many years of experience in their areas of activity.

Historically, The Scientific and Practical Centre of Sanitary and Epidemiological Expertise and Monitoring (SPCSEEM) has operated since 1952. The structure of SPCSEEM consists of three main services: 1) The laboratory service is represented by 7 reference laboratories, a department on samples collection, a laboratory service management department. 2) The main sector is represented by operational departments that are responsible for epidemiological surveillance and sanitary and epidemiological surveillance. 3) Facility management; a separate section is The Department of International Cooperation and Scientific Programmes. At present, the SPCSEEM creates a unified information field on the sanitary and epidemiological situation in the country through monitoring and programmes in 60 areas.

The National Centre for the Formation of a Healthy Lifestyle (NCFHL) of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan was established by a Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan on December 3, 1997 to implement the Kazakhstan-2030 Development Strategy. The Centre carried out research, organisational, methodological and practical activities in public health and healthcare, which were aimed at the formation and promotion of a healthy

lifestyle of citizens and the development of preventive and rehabilitation medicine. The Centre was the organisational, methodological and coordination centre for promotion of healthy lifestyles and the prevention of behavioural risk factors and diseases; those activities were implemented by ministries, departments, organisations and institutions of scientific support for the implementation of preventive programmes and medical and sociological research in the republic. Research activities provided support for healthy lifestyle programmes through the scientific justification of policies, improvement of the management and monitoring of the formation of healthy lifestyles, the development and implementation of new technologies for the improvement of various groups of the population.

Kh. Zhumatov Scientific Centre for Hygiene and Epidemiology (KhZhSCHE) was established in 1998 as a result of the merger of two research institutes: The Research Institute of Epidemiology, Microbiology and Infectious Diseases (RIEMID) and The Research Institute of Hygiene and Occupational Pathology (RIHOP). The RIEMID was established in 1925 (at that time it was named as The Regional Sanitary and Epidemiological Institute). In 1972, the name was changed to the RIEMID. It was the first medical research institute that had been established in Kazakhstan. The main activities of the Institute were: the study of epidemiology, the development of measures for the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of intestinal diseases, children's infectious diseases, as well as virus diseases, natural focal infectious diseases and parasitic diseases; the study of the problems and clinical findings of immunology and infectious allergies, the improvement of the methods for the diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases and the development of new methods.

The NCPH combines the research heritage of three leading scientific and practical centres, carries out the following various types of activities, including: (a) professional development courses, training and retraining of medical and non-medical personnel, specialists from other interested departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other countries, postgraduate training of scientific and pedagogical personnel of higher qualification in PhD and master's degree programmes on relevant problems of public health and healthcare, the formation of a healthy lifestyle in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; (b) the development and approval of working programmes for postgraduate training of specialists, organisation of practical training for students of educational institutions in healthcare.

The Department of Science and Professional Education is a structural subdivision of the NCPH, it performs a number of tasks, among which are planning and organising educational events on the programmes of continuing professional education.

Training in continuing professional education programmes at the SPCSEEM have been implemented since 2009, the training has been carried out at the NCFHL since 2004 and at the KhZhSCHE since 2005 in accordance with the requirements of the Model Programme for Professional Development and Retraining of Medical and Pharmaceutical Personnel No. 165 dated April 14, 2017 (Appendix 54, 60).

The continuing professional education programmes are implemented in accordance with the NCPH Rules of Organisation of Continuing Professional Education that were approved by the Chairman of the NCPH Academic Board No. 2 dated February 26, 2019.

The main programmes of continuing professional education at the NCPH are implemented on the basis of the SPCSEEM, the task of which is to improve the skills of public health authorities, in particular, specialists from the centres of sanitary and epidemiological expertise. The branch of the SPCSEEM has 44 educational programmes for improvement of qualifications in "Hygiene and Epidemiology" and "Laboratory Diagnostics" in accordance with the organisation's mission and consumer requests.

The NCPH educational services at the level of continuing professional education are represented by a wide range of events, both on the basis of its branches and off-site visits to other organisations: retraining and professional development cycles, master classes, seminars, traineeships, and trainings. The procedure for planning and implementation of the events is regulated by the Rules for the Organisation of Continuing Professional Education at the NCPH that were approved by the NCPH Academic Board (No.2 dated February 26, 2019). Training is provided for medical and non-medical personnel of the healthcare system in various types of tertiary care.

Lecturers are highly qualified specialists, doctors and candidates of medical sciences, doctors of the highest expert category with experience in practical work and teaching. The total number of educators who are involved in the educational process of continuing professional training is 54 employees; 9 of them are scientific researchers, including 2 doctors of medical sciences, 2 professors, 7 candidates of medical sciences, 9 master's degree students.

The NCPH budget is formed through the implementation of the State Assignment, the implementation of scientific and technical projects, WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA fellowship programmes, World Bank projects, as well as through the provision of paid services. The NCPH is managed by collegial bodies: the Supervisory Board, the Academic Board (AB), the Economic Council, and the Disciplinary Commission. Since 2017, the NCPH has been the main site for the implementation of the main functions of the Public Health Service.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

To date, the NCPH has not yet been accredited as an organisation implementing continuing professional development of healthcare professionals.

2.3 Analysis of the Self-Evaluation Report of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The Institutional Self-Evaluation Report of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan on compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of continuing education organisations (continuing professional development) is presented on 103 pages, including 90 pages of the main text and 13 pages of appendices and tables. The report is characterized by the completeness, structuredness and internal unity of the information that was provided by the educational organisation seeking accreditation about its activities.

The Report is compiled in accordance with the Guide to institutional self-evaluation of organisations for continuing medical education and is fully consistent with the ECAQA Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals. The list of members of the internal self-evaluation commission indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission (3 people) is available. A.S. Abildina, Head of the Department of Science and Professional Education, MSc, MBA, has been appointed responsible for preparing for institutional accreditation.

The NCPH institutional self-evaluation was carried out on the basis of order No.05-19 regulatory statute dated January 11, 2019 “On the creation of a working group” for preparing for institutional accreditation. The following work was done by the working group on the preparation of the Self-Evaluation Report: the key areas of activity and objectives for the implementation of continuing education programmes were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis of methodological and educational materials was carried out. The content of the Self-Evaluation Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

3. EEC conclusions on external evaluation and site visit

The visit of the External Evaluation Commission to the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan was organised in accordance with the visiting programme that had been approved by Saule Sergaziyevna Sarsenbayeva, ECAQA Director General, and Alfiya Gumarovna Shamsutdinova, Chairman of the EEC, and Valikhan Isayevich Akhmetov, Director of the NCPH. The visiting programme included interviews with the leadership and administrative staff, meetings with doctors and students, interviews with educators and surveys of trainees, visual inspection of resources, and study of documentation that was related to the educational process.

Within the framework of the site visit and the external evaluation of the NCPH on compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of

Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals, the EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main performance indicators of the organisation.

The information that was received by the external experts during the visit to the NCPH branches – SPCSEEM and NCFHL – was analyzed during meetings with leadership, employees of departments, studying documentation, questioning of trainees and educators, interviewing employers, doctors and compared with the data of the Self-Evaluation Report, which made it possible to verify the reliability and validation of information that had been provided by the NCPH on compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals.

Despite the fact that the NCPH described its best practice regarding compliance with accreditation standards in the Self-Evaluation Report, during the visit, the external experts requested 33 documents, which revealed the compliance of the NCPH activities with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals.

On the last day of the visit, the members of the EEC conducted an assessment of compliance of the organisation seeking accreditation with the ECAQA Quality Profile and Criteria Evaluation for the Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) of Health Care Professionals. The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. Comments and recommendations for improvement of the NCPH activities were provided.

Thus, the external evaluation and the site visit of the EEC members allowed verifying and validating the data of the NCPH Institutional Self-Evaluation Report in accordance with the Regulation on the External Evaluation Commission, the ECAQA Guide on External Evaluation of the Medical Education Organisation

4. Analysis of compliance of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for Healthcare Professionals and review of the strengths of each standard

Standard 1: Mission and outcomes

The members of the EEC obtained evidence of the presence of the mission and vision of the NCPH, which is available for review by all stakeholders (employees, trainees, patients) on the organisation's website (<https://hls.kz/archives/17816>). The employees and faculty participated in the process of preliminary discussion and development of the mission. The participation of all stakeholders (employers, partners) in the development and discussion of the mission is recommended. The mission was brought to the attention of the organisation's employees at general meetings.

The learning outcomes of trainees are reflected in the Working Training Programmes according to the specialty. This fact was established when studying the results of a survey of trainees upon completion of continuing education programmes. The professional development and retraining cycles allow implementing a competency-based approach to training by creating the necessary conditions, which are aimed at the formation, development and professional growth of the individual on the basis of national and universal values, achievements of science and practice.

The experts were convinced that the NCPH and its branches, which had been at the market of educational services of the CPD for more than decades, were one of the authoritative and in-demand organisations of continuing education for different categories of trainees.

Strengths:

1. Brand recognition of NCPH and its branches in the structure of medical organisations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
2. Key activities of the NCPH in the structure of the Public Healthcare Service.
3. The presence of clear strategic planning and management.
4. It is the organisation that combines diverse centres, which provide comprehensive services in public health.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 12, partially comply – 1, do not comply – 0.

Standard 1: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To engage all stakeholders in the review and development of the mission and spread information on the mission widely.

Standard 2: Educational programme

The experts determined that the implementation of continuing education programmes was carried out in accordance with the regulatory legal acts of continuing education. Professional development is implemented in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” dated July 27, 2007, the Model Programme for Professional Development and Retraining of Medical and Pharmaceutical Personnel by Order No. 165 of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2017, on the basis of the Order No. 660 of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 28, 2017 “On introducing amendments and additions to the Orders of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 24, 2009 No. 774 “On approval of the Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties Nomenclature List. ” Working training programmes are developed on the basis of the Order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2017 No. 165 “On approval of the Model programmes for professional development and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel.”

The educational programmes for professional development are provided for personnel with higher and secondary medical education in the following specialties: “Hygiene and Epidemiology (Common Hygiene, Occupational Hygiene, Hygiene of Children and Adolescents, Food Hygiene, Community Hygiene, Radiation Hygiene, Toxicology, Epidemiology, Parasitology, Bacteriology, Virology, Microbiology)” for specialists with higher medical education with specialization in sanitary-epidemiological service;

- “Laboratory diagnostics (laboratory assistant, laboratory doctor assistant)” for specialists with secondary special education, secondary vocational education;

- “Hygiene and epidemiology (sanitation medical assistant, sanitation physician assistant, laboratory assistant, epidemiologist assistant, entomologist)” for specialists with secondary special education, secondary vocational education;

- “Public Health”.

Retraining and professional development cycles, master classes, seminars, traineeships, and trainings are conducted.

When developing educational programmes, practical healthcare applications for the quality of continuing education of a healthcare professional are taken into account. The experts made sure that the NCPH educational programmes contained elements of professional training and were aimed at the formation and development of scientific concepts and methods, evidence-based medicine, knowledge and skills in clinical disciplines; development of clinical thinking, skills of effective interaction and development of leadership skills.

During the site visit, the experts obtained evidence of the effective implementation of educational programmes and methodological support of the educational process, the availability of internal regulatory documents governing the organisation of the educational process. The NCPH has the necessary logistical support for conducting various forms of training. The experts attended several practical trainings, as well as studied the teaching materials, which made it possible to validate this Standard.

Retraining and professional development cycles at the NCPH are held in 27 specialties. The NCPH faculty members are involved in research work and introduce the results into educational programmes and teaching methods. A survey of trainees showed that the trainees were satisfied with the training.

Strengths:

1. The NCPH and its branches have trained public health professionals for decades and have been leaders in training professionals in this field.
2. Working training programmes are developed in accordance with the Model programme for professional development and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel in “Hygiene and Epidemiology” and “Laboratory Diagnostics”.
3. During professional development cycles, trainees have a base of the reference laboratory of republican status.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 17, partially comply – 2, do not comply – 0.

Standard 2: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement: none.

Standard 3: Assessment and documentation

The assessment of trainees' academic achievements is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures that were developed in accordance with the set goals and objectives of the NCPH and in compliance with state policy and internal regulatory documents.

The EEC was convinced that the NCPH ensured transparency of the entire educational process and assessment system and provided trainees with a wide range of educational services, ensuring continuous monitoring of the education quality.

Monitoring of transparency of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes is reflected in "Regulation on the educational process" and is carried out through a survey of trainees. To determine the level of knowledge, skills and competences of trainees of professional development and retraining cycles, as well as to control the acquirement of educational material, formative and summative assessment is implemented using modern assessment methods. The form of assessment is determined by the educators themselves.

The external experts made sure that the knowledge of the NCPH students was assessed through the use of various types of test cases. This type of assessment is used both in the formative and in the summative assessment. Additional methods of assessment are the observation of the teacher, taking into account the communicative skills of a trainee. Trainees take part in assessing the quality of the implementation of working training programmes by participating in questionnaires and feedback on the quality of educational services.

Strengths:

1. The availability of appropriate trainee assessment methods;
2. Monitoring of the trainees' acquirement of learning outcomes through feedback;
3. Educational and methodological complexes of disciplines have been developed for the effective acquirement of educational programmes.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 5, partially comply – 2, do not comply – 0.

Standard 3: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To develop a standard operating procedure (SOPs).
- 2) To systematize the assessment of educational programmes, ensure the participation of all stakeholders and internal quality control.
- 3) To develop criteria for assessment of the learning outcomes of training in each discipline.

Standard 4: The Healthcare Professionals

The EEC experts obtained evidence that the NCPH carried out educational

activities in accordance with the established state requirements, regulatory and legal acts in continuing professional education, taking into account a flexible and mobile training system for healthcare professionals.

At the organisation seeking accreditation, trainees have the opportunity to complete intramural studies. The experts obtained evidence of the presence of a roadmap, which had been sent to oblast and city health departments, medical organisations, and private medical centres. The plan and tuition fees are available on the website. In some cases, the NCPH offers the development of an individual on-the-job training programme, off-site cycles.

Policies for admission, enrolment and motivation of trainees are available and effective.

Strengths:

1. NCPH stimulates the individual participation of health professionals in CPD programmes and provides health professionals with academic counselling, which includes issues on the selection of educational programmes and CPD activities.
2. NCPH encourages healthcare professionals to discuss the individual value and usefulness of accessible and available continuing education programmes.
3. NCPH takes into account the individual preferences of students, which contributes to the continuous improvement of continuing education programmes and increases the demand among consumers of educational services.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 17, partially comply – 2, do not comply – 0.

Standard 4: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement: none.

Standard 5: CPD Provision

The NCPH demonstrated its desire to comply with all regulatory requirements (orders, regulations, rules, qualification requirements, methodological support) in continuing education, including passing through appropriate procedures for recognizing the institution as an organisation of continuing education. Decision-making on CPD programmes takes place at the NCPH Academic Board meeting.

The experts were convinced that the NCPH regularly evaluated and reviewed programmes with the participation of trainees, employees, and other stakeholders on the basis of the systematic collection, analysis and management of information, as a result of which the programmes were adapted to ensure the programmes' relevance. The NCPH collaborates with medical HEIs in the development of continuing education programmes, the contracts are available. The NCPH also cooperates with international organisations such as the WHO, the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD), and the International Association of National Institutes of

Public Health (IANPHI). During the site visit, the experts studied various teaching methods of neighbouring countries and beyond which are applied at the NCPH to improve the educational process from the transfer of knowledge to the formation of professional competencies that implement the educational programme for professional development.

The number and composition of teaching staff are planned on the basis of the needs of the educational process, the quantity of hours and the enrollment of trainees. The qualifications and basic education of the NCPH teaching staff corresponds to the specialties of retraining and professional development programmes: 54 employees, including 9 scientific researchers, including 2 doctors of medical sciences, 2 professors, 7 candidates of medical sciences, and 9 master's degree students.

Strengths:

1. NCPH and its branches have highly qualified competent specialists in public health with scientific, practical and pedagogical experience, skills in developing and forming, timely updating of the Working Curriculum taking into account the recommendations and the WHO Global Programmes, the WHO Regional Office for Europe, the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including the implementation of government programmes.

2. The teaching staff is constantly engaged in continuing education and self-education.

3. NCPH has part-time educators from the medical faculties of the university on a contractual basis for the implementation and improvement of the education quality of the professional development programmes in terms of the compulsory component.

4. NCPH has memoranda of cooperation with HEIs in the country, according to which the NCPH and its branches provide a site for traineeships, a field site for collecting material and writing thesis research as part of master's degree and PhD programmes, internships for graduates, as well as a site for visits for occupational guidance.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 10, partially comply – 2, do not comply – 0.

Standard 5: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To create a separate academic body for the development, approval, implementation and monitoring of learning and teaching material.
- 2) To review educational programmes with the participation of external experts who are representatives of the academic environment, practical health care, professional organisations, as well as foreign experts.

Standard 6: Educational resources

In order to train students, the NCPH offers the developed physical facilities, which meet the qualification requirements and include 7 reference laboratories, study room fund, libraries, and IT rooms.

Lecture halls, conference rooms are equipped with the necessary technical equipment. There are 3 training rooms for 10-20 people, a large conference room for more than 100 people, and a small conference room for 50 people at the SPCSEEM (NCPH branch). Training rooms are equipped with necessary cabinet furniture, modern laboratory equipment, teaching equipment, computers/laptops, and stationary multimedia projectors for seminars/workshops.

The library fund is 2000 units for 2019, there is direct access to the Republican Scientific Medical Library (RSML) of S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University. At laboratory facilities, trainees have access to modern laboratory equipment (virological, bacteriological, immuno-enzymatic units, PCR, dosimeters, chromatographs, etc.). Continuous work is underway to improve IT technologies and the NCPH infrastructure. Uninterrupted operation of the Internet is provided. The percentage of Internet access is 100%.

Strengths:

1. NCPH trainees have access to the laboratory equipment of the NCPH and its branches.
2. Specialists of NCPH and its branches are active participants in the development of interdepartmental and international projects and other legal acts; they are experts in attracting the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan to evaluate activities in sanitary and epidemiological well-being, participate in international, national conferences, seminars, round tables and working groups.
3. NCPH interacts dynamically with leading international public health organisations to develop key areas of activity.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 22, partially comply – 2, do not comply – 0.

Standard 6: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To provide for the possibility of organising a simulation centre in accordance with the requirements of continuing education.

Standard 7: Evaluation of CPD Activities

The development and evaluation of educational programmes is carried out taking into account the requirements of regulatory documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The NCPH has defined the structure and algorithm of the mechanism for monitoring retraining and professional development programmes. Feedback is got from trainees after each cycle, and their recommendations serve as the basis for improving programmes. The system for evaluating educational programmes is represented by internal evaluation (questioning, feedback, discussion at the Academic Board meeting) and external evaluation (reviews, comments). The examination, monitoring and improvement of curricula are carried out by a methodological commission consisting of educators and administrative staff.

Strengths:

1. NCPH evaluates continuing education programmes and their processes and outcomes.
2. Questionnaires of trainees and educators are conducted continually.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 8, partially comply – 3, do not comply – 0.

Standard 7: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To optimize feedback through the introduction of electronic questionnaire.

Standard 8. Organisation

The external experts studied the organisational structure and, during interviews with leadership and responsible employees, they obtained evidence on the presence of effective and efficient management of key areas of work and organisation of the educational process. The leadership's activities regarding the fulfilment of the mission and objectives of the NCPH are studied and evaluated on the basis of the analysis and generation of reports and plans, analysis of the implementation of the goals and objectives of the strategic plan, annual plan, reports. The advisory body of management and decision-making is the Academic Board.

The budget is formed from paid educational and budgetary funds. The price list is approved by the Academic Board. The price list is revised on the basis of monitoring and analysis of the market price.

The administrators of the CPD programmes are the structural units that supervise the educational process at the NCPH and its branches; they are key persons in quality assurance of the CPD programmes. At the NCPH, the structural unit that is responsible for the entire educational process is the Department of Science and Professional Education. At the SPCSEEM (NCPH branch), the structural unit that is in charge of educational processes is the Department of International Cooperation, Management of Educational and Scientific Programmes.

Strengths:

1. The presence of units for governance and management of CPD programmes;
2. Planning of needs and resources is based on existing normative legal acts, as well as on monitoring and analysis of the competitive environment among the facilitators of the CPD, personal appeals of healthcare professionals on the off-budget basis, requests from territorial healthcare departments, including the “Public Procurement” web portal.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 9, partially comply – 0, do not comply – 0.

Standard 8: accomplished.

Recommendations on improvement:

- 1) To bring record keeping and training in the state language into conformity with the requirements.

Standard 9. Continuous renewal

During the observation and conversations with employees, trainees, educators, and representatives of practical health care, the EEC made sure that the NCPH periodically reviewed the organisational structure, strategic plan, programme content, learning outcomes, assessment methods and resources. The needs of practical health care, the emergence of new regulatory documentation in health care and continuing education are taken into account. The SWOT analysis of the internal and external environment, the priority areas for the strategic development of NCPH, the effective activities of the NCPH, customer satisfaction, and the analysis of the effectiveness of the quality system for 2018-2019 made it possible to update and adapt the mission and vision of the NCPH.

The NCPH leadership allocates the necessary resources for the continuous renewal of continuing education programmes, including human resources (the sufficient number of employees), logistics. The discussion of additions and amendments to educational programmes is based on the analysis of recommendations and suggestions of final exams, requests from healthcare organisations, proposals of the teaching staff, taking into account current trends in medicine and science.

Strengths:

1. NCPH provides procedures for regular review and updating of the process, organisational structure, content, learning outcomes/competencies, assessment methods and the educational environment of CPD programmes, taking into account changes in the needs of practical healthcare and pharmacy, new regulatory documents, and transformations in society.

2. NCPH systematically collects information on existing educational processes and provides an interim review of relevant data for improvement.

3. NCPH uses the most relevant and proven training methods for healthcare professionals in the educational process and continuously collaborates with key organisations, which are involved in shaping health policies and strategies including educational processes (WHO, Centre for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC, USA) , UN (UNICEF)).

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply – 6, partially comply – 0, do not comply – 0.

Standard 9: accomplished.







Recommendations on improvement: none.

5. Recommendations on improvement of the operation of the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan:

1. To engage all stakeholders in the review and development of the mission and spread information on the mission widely.
2. To improve the records management of continuing education (standard operating procedures) and teaching, taking into account the state language policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
3. To improve approaches to the assessment of educational programmes with the participation of all stakeholders, ensuring internal and external quality control with the involvement of external experts (representatives of the academic environment, practical health care, professional organisations, as well as foreign experts).
4. To develop criteria for assessment of the learning outcomes of training in each discipline.
5. To develop the activities of the academic body, whose functions include the development, approval, implementation and monitoring of the quality of learning and teaching documentation on continuing education.
6. To provide for the possibility of organising a simulation centre in accordance with the requirements of continuing education.
7. To optimize feedback through the introduction of electronic questionnaire.

7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету институционально аккредитовать РГП на ПХВ «Национальный Центр Общественного Здравоохранения» Министерства Здравоохранения Республики Казахстан в качестве организации, реализующей программы дополнительного образования на период 5 лет

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	Шамсутдинова Альфия Гумаровна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Дооталиева Сайрагуль Чыныбековна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Рамазанова Маншук Анеровна	
Эксперт – слушателей	Зимбаева Наргиз Маратовна	
Эксперт - представитель практического здравоохранения	Абдрасулов Рашид Болатович	
Наблюдатель ЕЦА	Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна	

[Translation from Russian of the image above]

Recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members unanimously agreed to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit **the RSE on the REM National Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan** as an organisation implementing continuing education programmes for a period of 5 years.

The EEC Chairman	Alfiya Gumarovna Shamsutdinova	<i>/signature/</i>
Foreign expert	Sayragul Chynybekovna Dootaliyeva	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Manshuk Anerovna Ramazanova	<i>/signature/</i>
Expert-trainee	Nargiz Maratovna Zimbayeva	<i>/signature/</i>
Expert-representative of practical health care	Rashid Bolatovich Abdrasulov	<i>/signature/</i>
ECAQA Observer	Saule Sergaziyevna Sarsenbayeva	<i>/signature/</i>

**Quality profile and evaluation criteria of the RSE on the REM National
Centre of Public Health of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of
Kazakhstan for compliance with the Standards for Institutional
Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development
(CPD) for Healthcare Professionals**

Standard	Evaluation criteria	Evaluation		
		Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply
1.	Mission and outcomes	12	1	0
2.	Educational programme	17	2	0
3.	Assessment and documentation	5	2	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals	17	2	0
5.	CPD Provision	10	2	0
6.	Educational resources	22	2	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	8	3	0
8.	Organisation	9	0	0
9.	Continuous renewal	5	0	0
	Total:	105	14	0