

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF CONFORMITY TO THE  
STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL  
ORGANIZATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION  
NATIONAL RESEARCH ONCOLOGY CENTER LLP**

**1. Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 54 dated September 10, 2019, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct an institutional accreditation on September 26-27, 2019 of National Research Oncology Center LLP as an organization implementing programs of supplementary education with the following membership:



**External Expert Commission Chairman**

**CHINGAEVA GULNAR NURTASOVNA**

DMedSci, Professor of the Department of Nephrology of the Kazakh National Medical University NJSC, member of the Association of Nephrologist of Kazakhstan, the Russian Dialysis Society, International Pediatric Nephrology Association, ISN (the International Society of Nephrology, ERA-EDTA (the European Renal Association – European Dialysis and Transplant Association)

tel.: +77017419079, e-mail: chingayeva.g@gmail.com



**Foreign expert**

**ATTILA TORDAI**

M.D., Ph.D., D.Sc., Head of the Department of Transfusion Medicine, Professor, Semmelweis University Budapest (Hungary), General secretary of the Hungarian Society of Hematology and Transfusion Medicine, member of the European Federation for Immunogenetics (EFI), Eurotransplant Tissue Typers Advisory Committee, Hungarian Society of Transplantation, Hungarian society for Human Genetics

e-mail: tordai.attila@med.semmelweis-univ.hu



**National academic expert**

ESENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA

DMedSc, Associate Professor of the Oncology Department of the Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University NJSC, member of the association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan

tel.: +77772221145,

e-mail: Esenkulova-s@mail.ru



**Expert – Representative of Practical Health Care**

OSPANOVA MADINA ERALYEVNA

Head of the Department of Cryobiology of the RSE on REM Scientific and Production Center for Transfusiology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

tel.: +77021930322 ,

e-mail: sk\_ospanova\_me@mail.ru



**Expert – student representative – resident**

TAZHIGALIEVA TORGYN MAKSATKYZY

Resident in Radiology of the National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Center JSC

tel.: +77021930322 ,

e-mail: torgyn.tazhigaliyeva@gmail.com



### **ECAQA observer**

SARSENBAEVA SAULE SERGAZIEVNA

DMedSci, MBA, Professor, Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care  
Director General

tel.: +77013291665, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The EEC report contains an assessment of the National Research Oncology Center LLP for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate education, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the activities of the above organization.

The visit of the external expert commission to the National Research Oncology Center LLP was organized in accordance with the program approved by the ECAQA Director General S. Sarsenbaeva on September 16, 2019 and coordinated with the chairman of the EEC Chingaeva G.N. and the Chairman of the Board of the NROC Burkitbaev Zh.K.

## **2. General part of the EEC final report**

### **Introduction of National Research Oncology Center LLP**

In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 11, 2018 No. 255, the National Research Oncology Center LLP (hereinafter referred to as the NROC) was established with 100% state participation and is a subordinate organization of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter – MH RK).

By the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter - RK) dated October 17, 2018, an interdepartmental Roadmap for the implementation of the project "Construction of the National Research Oncology Center in Astana" for 2018-2020 (hereinafter - the Roadmap) was approved.

According to the Roadmap, the NROC on May 1, 2019 begins to carry out activities in the building of the National Research Center of Oncology and Transplantology with full continuity of activity (medical, educational and scientific), using the equipment and involving all NRCOT employees.

By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2006 No. 719 "On approval of the Plan for the creation of a cluster of medical services in Astana new centers based", as well as by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2008 No. 433 "On the establishment of the Republican Scientific Center of Emergency Medical Care" (hereinafter - RSCEMC) a new medical center was created.

The clinical activity of the RSCEMC began on October 19, 2009; it was on this day that the first patient was hospitalized. The uniqueness of this center was that it was a multidisciplinary medical center that provided emergency and elective care of the fourth level and had air medical service. RSCEMC was a leading methodological providing emergency medical care. Personnel potential was formed from leading specialists of the country and near and far abroad. The center has become a platform for the implementation of new innovative technologies and the introduction of modern diagnostic and treatment methods based on best practices.

The first sibling transplantation of a kidney was performed on November 24, 2010; this operation was carried out by the specialists of RSCEMC, together with specialists from South Korea, Seoul, Anam Hospital.

On July 4, 2014, the RSCEMC was renamed into National Research Center of Oncology and Transplantology JSC (hereinafter - NRCOT), the reason for renaming the multidisciplinary center was set by the goals and objectives for the development and improvement of transplantology and oncology in the RK.

On the basis of the clinic, such unique and high-tech methods of treatment and diagnostics were introduced as: allogeneic and autografting bone marrow transplantation for blastoses, cell and organ transplantation, biological wound coverings, reconstructive operations in angiosurgery, innovative technologies in x-ray surgery (radiofrequency ablation of organs and tissues, vessels chemoembolization, replacement arthroplasty. Treatment protocols have been developed and improved such as intensive care and management of women in childbirth and puerperas in critical conditions, intensive care after a kidney, liver transplant.

From October 1, 2017 to April 30, 2019, the NRCOT operated as part of the University Medical Center Corporate Fund, being one of the branches of subsidiaries in the structure of Nazarbayev University AEO.

The goal of the NROC is the provision of safe, effective and high-quality medical care, the development, implementation and distribution of modern technologies in the field of medical science, education and practice.

NROC is a multidisciplinary medical center whose priority areas are oncology, hematology, oncohematology, vascular surgery, reconstructive plastic surgery, hepatobiliary surgery, interventional x-ray surgery and transplantology. There are eighteen clinical departments: the Department of Hepatobiliary Surgery (Surgery No. 1), the Department of Vascular Surgery (Surgery No. 2), the Department of Orthopedics (Surgery No. 3), the Department of Gynecology (Surgery No. 4), the Treatment Department No. 1 (cardiology, nephrology, neurology, gastroenterology and hepatology), Department of Paid Therapy No. 2, Department of Oncohematology with Oncological Resuscitation and Department of Resuscitation and Intensive Care.

The capacity of the center is 207 beds, 15 of which are cardiology, 5 beds - neurology, 5 beds - nephrology, 12 beds - gastroenterology and hepatology, 10 beds - paid therapy, 62 beds - oncohematology, 30 beds - surgery No.1 (liver and kidney transplantation, hepatobiliary, abdominal reconstructive, urology, thoracic surgery); 18 beds - surgery No. 2 vascular surgery, 30 beds - surgery No. 3 orthopedics, 20 beds - paid surgery and 18 beds - the intensive care unit.

In accordance with the Charter, approved by order of the Acting Chairman of the State Property and Privatization Committee of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 22, 2018 No. 613, one of the main activities of the NROC is educational.

The organizational, functional and staffing structures of the organization are built with regard to the mission, goals, objectives and policies in the field of quality assurance. The Department of Science and Education (hereinafter - the Department) is a structural unit of the NROC.

Residency training has been carried out since 2010. In 2010, the RSCEMC issued a license for postgraduate education No. 0137410 AB series dated 02.06.2010. RSCEMC was a subsidiary of Nazarbayev University and could carry out educational activities without a license, in accordance with article 8 of the Law "On the Status of Nazarbayev University, Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools and the Nazarbayev Foundation". The license for educational activities was reissued from the RSCEMC to the NRCOT, No. KZ81LAA00007958 dated 13.12.2016.

Residency programs are implemented in accordance with the Rules for the organization of the educational process at the NROC residency, approved by the order of the Chairman of the NROC Board on July 5, 2019 No. 106-OD. Implementation of residency programs is conducted in 12 clinical specialties. The total number of students in the 2018-2019 academic years was 78 residents. In 2019, 40 people graduated.

Retraining and advanced training is carried out in 13 specialties. Educational activities at the level of additional professional education are represented by a wide range of events, both on the basis of its center, and with visits to other organizations: retraining and advanced training cycles, master classes, seminars, on-job internships, and trainings. The order of their planning and implementation is regulated by the Rules of the organization of additional professional education in the NROC. Training is provided for medical specialists with higher and secondary medical education, as well as non-medical personnel in the health care system.

Lecturers are highly qualified specialists, doctors and candidates of medical sciences, doctors of the highest category with experience in clinical work and teaching, trained in the best centers and clinics of the world. The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional professional training is 40 people, including 6 MD, Candidate of Medical Science - 14, PhD -3, Masters-7.

Since the beginning of 2012, more than 100 specialists of the center have been sent to leading foreign clinics where they have mastered and then successfully introduced the latest diagnostic and treatment technologies in the fields of transplantology, oncohematology, vascular surgery, obstetrics and gynecology, hematology, etc. The training was conducted at the leading clinics in the USA, Israel, Lithuania, Japan, Korea, Singapore, France, Germany, Russia, etc. For 2010-2019, more than 2,000 trainees of advanced training and retraining courses from the regions were trained by teachers. As part of the 005 republican budget program, 150 specialists of the healthcare organizations of Kazakhstan were trained.

### **3. Analysis of the self-assessment report of National Research Oncology Center LLP**

The institutional self-assessment report of the National Research Oncology Center LLP (hereinafter referred to as the NROC) for compliance with the Institutional Accreditation Standards of medical institutions of postgraduate education is presented on 133 pages, excluding the annexes; it is characterized by the completeness of answers to the standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECA Self-Assessment Manual, and also the internal unity of information provided by the accredited organization. A cover letter signed by the First Deputy Chairman of the Board Kulkayeva G., confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report, is attached to the report.

The report contains a list of members of the internal commission for self-assessment, indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission (14 people in total), information about the representative of the organization responsible for carrying out institutional self-assessment – Zhukubaeva A.A., head of the department of science and education. The chairman of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation is Kulkayeva Gulnara Utepergenovna - first deputy chairman of the board, chairman of the working group.

The institutional self-assessment of the National Research Oncology Center LLP was carried out on the basis of the order dated 09.07.2019 No. 117-OD “On approval of the composition of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation of the National Research Oncology Center LLP”.

A certain work was done by the working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report: the key areas of activity and tasks for the implementation of continuing education programs were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their contents are reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strong points and areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications on 110 pages, including applications, are presented in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. The report is written skillfully, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and the tables contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with the institutional accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the National Research Oncology Center LLP and a review of the each standard strong points.**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The experts were convinced that the mission, strategic goal and vision of the NROC are focused on the training of health professionals (cardiologists, oncologists, surgeons, angiologists, interventional surgeons, etc.) who are in demand and competitive in the labor market. At the same time, the organization's mission is more focused on population health indicators, which requires a review of the mission with including the educational role of the center. In the strategic plan of development of the NROC there is a direction for the development of education at the level of training of residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and advanced training of doctors. The charter, studied by experts, also contains the task of organizing educational programs.

The involvement of employees participating in the training of residents and to a lesser extent trained in the process of developing, discussing and accepting a mission (EMB protocol from 2018), the vision of the NROC and subsequent activities to achieve it has been established. In a survey of 60 residents and 14 teachers, it was found that the majority are informed about the content of the mission and where they can find it (website, information stand in the department and in the lobby), but mainly administrative staff are involved in the development of the organization's development strategy and partly employees of the departments. In a conversation with 5 representatives of practical healthcare, the process of involvement in the development and formulation of the mission is not fully reflected; however, employers are completely satisfied with the quality of training of residents who come to work with them. The content of the mission of the institute changes dynamically over time as necessary.

To distribute the mission, strategic goal and vision, the NROC has developed an action plan for its promotion, bringing it to the teaching staff, students, the public, health organizations, applicants for residency programs and other stakeholders.

The final results are defined in all programs and voiced in practical classes. Experts during the interview with students received evidence that residents of all specialties are informed about the outcomes of training, and teachers provide them with syllabuses, handouts, and electronic literature.

##### **Strong points:**

- 1) The presence of clear strategic planning and management of the educational process through the unit - the department of education and science;
- 2) Organization of the multidisciplinary center, providing comprehensive unique medical services and resources for postgraduate and further education;
- 3) The capabilities of teachers who are highly qualified specialists.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 22, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 1:** *accomplished*

##### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- To provide for the role of education in ensuring the quality of cancer care medical services of the population when updating the mission of the NROC.

##### **Standard 2: POSTGRADUATE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

NROC provides training in 8 specialties of residency, at the same time there is a license for 13 specialties. Additional education was carried out until 2018, and in connection with the restructuring of the center, it is planned to recruit students in 2020. Experts studied the educational and methodological documentation (WC, calendar-thematic plans, educational journals, assessment criteria, evaluation sheets, regulations on assessment methods, etc. ). and came to the conclusion that educational programs are being designed in accordance with SCES 2015 order No. 647 of 31.07.15) and are consistent with the mission of the NROC and the

relevant applications, requests and recommendations of the MH RK and employers. The structure of educational programs meets the needs of the region and the Republic.

During a survey of 60 residents and conversations directly in the NROC departments, it was determined that they are being consulted upon completion of training in a residency (there is a mentor, curator) on training planning, a schedule of classes, a study schedule and practice, the choice of topics for research and employment, inclusion in the work program as part of the component of choice. Programs are reviewed (internal review) and approved at meetings of the EMB, which is enshrined in the minutes of the meeting of the EMB. The provisions on EMB, composition (order) and several protocols were reviewed.

For the effective implementation of training programs, the NROC has its own multidisciplinary clinical base - 11 departments that have been visited by the EEC and we made sure that the practical part of the educational programs is carried out at the proper level. Teachers use a variety of teaching methods, focusing on active methods and practice in the departments of the NROC. During an interview with residents it was established that in the last year of study they possess all the necessary skills of a specialist, are confident in their competence and intend to apply all the knowledge in practice.

Thus, continuous improvement of educational programs is carried out on the basis of the introduction of new teaching methods, updating the bibliographic index and applying self-assessment methods for the resident's readiness for independent practice.

**Strong points:**

1) The presence of its own multidisciplinary clinical base, including therapy, surgery and transplantsology;

2) Involvement in the teaching, counseling and treatment of the faculty of universities and leading experts of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

3) Integration of science, education and clinical practice;

4) Introduction of modern scientific data into educational programs, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 20, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 2:** *accomplished*

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- To attract to review educational and methodological documentation (educational programs, syllabuses, tests) scientific and pedagogical employees of third-party organizations and representatives of practical health care to ensure the quality of materials for postgraduate and additional education;

- To standardize methodological documentation for postgraduate and further education through the development of regulations and monitoring the quality of performance and use in the educational process;

- In order to internationalize education, more actively conduct research and training events for residents and students of continuing education programs in English, as well as stimulate and support student publications in English;

- To implement the trilingual program in the educational process.

**Standard 3: ASSESMENT OF POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS**

In the process of studying the documentation, experts obtained evidence that the assessment criteria are described in the EMC for each specialty (8), mainly tests, oral interviews and check lists (point assessment) that need improvement.

Moreover, assessment methods are proposed for use depending on what competencies are formed / developed and the outcomes of training in a particular discipline (therapeutic or surgical profile, for health organization). The choice of assessment method is carried out more often by the teacher on the basis of acceptability and effectiveness in relation to the established training outcome, is carried out by the teacher and is reflected in the EMC. At the same time, assessment methods go through the mandatory consideration and approval process at the EMB, but there is

no review. Tests are mainly of 1-2 levels of difficulty, are solved in electronic form. To do this, there is a computer class with 12 seats.

The quality assurance system for the design and implementation of educational programs functions as a continuous cycle of internal quality assessment and examination of postgraduate education programs (residency), which is carried out by the Department of Education and Science.

The leading role in managing and ensuring the quality of education belongs to the Department of Education and Science and teachers. The direct providers of these educational processes are highly professional employees of the center.

**Strong points:**

1) The application of principles and methods of assessment that facilitate integrated training and involvement in practical clinical work, provide professional knowledge and skills.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- To improve instrumentation in postgraduate education by developing tests of the 2-3 level of complexity, active application of MCQ technology in training and assessment of knowledge;

- To unify student assessment criteria with the development of evaluation sheets that meet the requirements of a point-rating system;

**Standard 4: POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS**

The order of training at the residency for continuing education and retraining of personnel is regulated in the rules of the organization of the educational process, the policy to ensure the quality of the NROC activity, the Regulation on the Department of Education and Science. Admission, training and evaluation are carried out in accordance with the norms of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan for residency. Continuing education and retraining programs are not currently being implemented, but are planned for 2020. In total, 67 residents are currently studying in 8 specialties.

When planning training, each resident is supervised by a curator and trained under the guidance of a mentor, and personally bears the main responsibility for his participation in training and observing discipline. According to the results of a survey of 60 residents, experts were able to obtain evidence of a high level of satisfaction with training at the NROC for the majority of respondents regarding the flexibility of the programs, the professionalism of teachers, the large share of training in clinical disciplines and the individual approach to programs planning, the training schedule and the desire to recommend this organization to your colleagues.

Experts from practical health care are involved in planning and implementing residency activities; questionnaires on the results and conditions of training are regularly conducted. Employees of the NROC are the main specialists of the MH RK, participants of various working groups of the MH RK in the development of issues in their field.

Upon completion of the training process, teacher conducts an assessment of the practical knowledge acquired and there is the possibility of conducting (practicing, polishing up) independent manipulations during training (including in a simulation center, on the equipment of the departments). Experts made sure that the criteria of this standard were met.

**Strong points:**

1) Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to postgraduate education;

2) Mentoring of residents, advisory support in professional issues and conducting scientific work.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 27, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 4: accomplished**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**



- In order to internationalize education, more actively conduct research and training events for residents and students of continuing education programs in English, as well as stimulate and support student publications in English;

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC AND SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT**

The activities of the NROC are carried out in accordance with the Charter of the organization, where the educational direction is one of the key areas, along with clinical and scientific work; it characterizes the integration of education-science-practice. The initiation of institutional accreditation of the NROC is a fact of recognition by this center of the need to improve its activities and ensure the quality of postgraduate and continuing professional development. In educational activity, the NROC is guided by the main regulatory acts in the field of postgraduate education and CPD in health care, observing licensing and qualification requirements in relation to education in terms of structure, personnel, educational programs, material and technical base, and educational quality monitoring processes. In NROC there is a status of a mentor and curator of a resident. Residents are trained in each of the 11 departments; they have real contact with the patient and are allowed to work on high-tech equipment under the supervision of a doctor (mentor). The mentor works with two residents, which guarantees an individual approach and sufficient time for mastering the skills. This takes into account the qualifications, professionalism and academic experience of the teacher. In total, 27 people are involved in the educational process: 3 doctors of medical sciences; 10 candidates of medical sciences; 2 PhD; 2 master; 10 doctors of the highest and first category.

Most teachers underwent advanced training in professional skills and only about 1/3 in pedagogical excellence.

#### **Strong points:**

1) High scientific and pedagogical potential of employees and the possibility of involving them in educational activities;

2) The republican budget programs, which provide the opportunity to improve the skills of employees in foreign scientific and clinical centers, as well as to attract foreign mentors to the clinic base.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 12, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

*Standard 5: accomplished*

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- To plan and implement systematic training of center employees involved in the educational process in the residency and advanced training.

- To improve the system of access to international databases of professional and scientific literature;

- To improve the incentive system for employees and students when publishing scientific papers in peer-reviewed journals with a high impact factor (development of a regulation on material stimulation of publications).

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

NROC passed legal re-registration in LLP and reorganization of the organizational structure with the creation of a Department of Education and Science. However, the center has a stable material and technical base, including administrative and training facilities. NROC has a site of 26 thousand square meters. There are 3 study rooms for 15–20 seats, a lecture hall for 25–40 people, a conference room for 96 people, and a small conference room for 20–25 people. Each department has a staffroom, where residents have access to computers, have the opportunity to engage with doctors. Heads of departments hold discussions with residents in their offices. Clinical base agreements were concluded with 6 medical organizations of the city of Nur-Sultan. 2 of which are accredited by the JCI International Commission.

In NROC, there is a simulation room (4 manikins for training BLS) and a test center for 7 seats; a library of its own are not available, but agreements have been signed with the School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University and the NRCMCH.

The quality management policy of the RCMI, the organizational structure of management (director, vice-rector, management), well-thought-out management, and planned funding allow RCMI to implement AT and PR in 31 directions with an annual increase in the number of students. Among the medical information resources are PubMed, Up to Date, Medline Complete, Clinical Key, Access medicine, Clinical trials, Cochrane Library.

During a survey of residents, it was revealed that they are aware of access to international bases and they have repeatedly used it. Thus, practical training is carried out on real medical equipment. Residents are provided with a sufficient number of seats in the classrooms; lecture halls are equipped with multimedia equipment and comply with sanitary standards.

**Strong points:**

- 1) Scientific and clinical multidisciplinary base, contributing to the intensification of educational and clinical processes, conducting of scientific research involving students;
- 2) Wide availability of resources for residents training;
- 3) High scientific and academic potential;
- 4) Wide access to international databases of modern scientific and professional literature;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 11, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 6:** *accomplished*

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- To implement the trilingual program in the educational process.

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS**

In the NROC, a systematic assessment of the educational process is carried out with a focus on monitoring the availability of resources (clinical base, access to modern literature, classroom facilities, equipment, the composition of teachers-curators and tutors), the analysis of the conformity of educational programs with the requirements of SCES 2015, standard training programs, professional standards and sectoral qualification framework.

The system of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program is carried out at all levels, using a multi-level approach, at the same time, not all teachers who were present at the interview fully informed about the content of this methodology. The most used method is feedback (questionnaire); in the offices there are boxes for complaints and suggestions.

During the external visit, the experts were able to make sure that an important mechanism for evaluation of educational programs is a questionnaire of residents and teachers (360 ° methodology) on the quality of the programs content and verbal feedback from employers (through HR departments) that allow the NROC to carry out corrective amendments for improving, introduce new teaching methods, change the place of training.

Survey questions were discussed and approved at a meeting of the EMC. The leadership of the NROC determines training needs based on reports and recommendations of the MH RK. The whole process is carried out by specialist methodologists with pedagogical education of the Department of Education and Science, and the department head regulates and controls the process.

The assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the educational process should also include monitoring of the progress of residents which is evaluated according to a 100-point system. Thus, the NROC has its own methodology for assessing the quality of the educational process, the results of which allow making improvements in educational programs, proposing new topics or attracting qualified teachers.

**Strong points:**

- 1) The system of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program is carried out at all levels, using the competency-based approach and includes a 360 degree assessment methodology.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 7:** accomplished

**Recommendations for improvement:** no.

### **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

NROC has an organizational structure that meets the requirements for the organization of postgraduate and further education (inclusion in the structure of the Department of Education and Science and prospects for expanding the department and tasks). General management is carried out by the chairman of the board, and the responsibility of the head of the Department of Education and Science is planning and control of all aspects of the educational process. The Institute staff includes specialists who are responsible for the implementation and effectiveness of educational programs in 8 residency specialties. Only 4 administration staff. The advisory body that provides methodological support for further education is the Educational and Methodical Council (EMC), which includes teachers, administration, and a representative of employers. EMS meets regularly, has its own plan and reporting. The management of residency programs and the planning of CPD are transparent.

NROC demonstrated to experts its scientific and academic leadership in postgraduate (residency) and the possibility of further education in cardiology, therapy, gastroenterology with endoscopy, surgery, oncology, oncohematology with transplantation, which is confirmed by the increase in the number of residents, the potential for training students and the attractiveness of programs among the heads of medical organizations of Kazakhstan.

The academic freedom of residents is expressed in the right of access to the educational program, resources, to receive knowledge according to their inclinations and needs, and is reflected in the rules of the organization of the educational process, which is discussed and approved at the Educational and Methodical Council. NROC cooperates with 3 international organizations (South Korea, Lithuania, Turkey).

Budget allocation is carried out in accordance with the strategic plan of the NROC for 2018-2022. Financial matters are the responsibility of the chief accountant. The institute's budget is formed from various sources - medical services, residency training, and other income.

#### **Strong points:**

- 1) System management of all areas of activity aimed at achieving the mission and goal;
- 2) The responsibility and obligations in relation to the management of the educational program are defined (there is a subdivision "Department of Education and Science");

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** fulfilled - 19, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

**Standard 8:** accomplished

**Recommendations for improvement:** no.

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

Strategic Development Plan of the NROC for 2019-2023 provides for tasks and measures for the continuous improvement of all areas of activity, the implementation of which is analyzed and monitored by the administration, and in terms of educational activities by the head of the Department of Education and Science. In 2020, the NROC plans to expand the staff and tasks of the continuing education unit. Currently, preparations for licensing a number of residency programs, the distribution of goals and tasks between the parent organization of the NROC - the National Center of Oncology and Transfusiology JSC of the MH RK and NROC LLP, the implementation of the tasks approved in 2019 Strategy for the center's development in the field of education are conducted.

Thus, the NROC as an innovative educational institution pursues a policy of improving its activities with a focus on the integration of clinics, education and science, as well as providing this process with appropriate material and technical resources. Evidence of this process is the expansion of the management staff and the list of residency programs, an increase in the teacher base, and an increase in the number of residents. The experts established the commitment of the

academic leadership and teachers to assure the quality of education, which was confirmed by the questionnaire. More than 97% of the teachers surveyed are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace, and more than 95% speak of a good micro-climate in the team, 93% of the teachers are confident that they are able to realize themselves as professionals in the specialty within the walls of the NROC, i.e. the tendency of the staff involved in teaching to develop the NROC is fully supported.

Experts have received convincing proof of compliance with this standard.

**Strong points:**

1) Strategic planning with the regard to the modern achievements of oncology and transplantology and the updating of educational standards in the residency and LSI in additional education;

2) Integration of science, education and clinical practice.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* fulfilled - 13, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

*Standard 9: accomplished*

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

- NROC should initiate the creation of an association or society of cancer patients and determine their role and forms of participation in improving the training of residents in relevant specialties

So, all 9 accreditation standards have been met; no compliance with the criteria for each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing of the self-assessment report and an external visit to the accredited organization was found.

**6. Recommendations for improving National Research Oncology Center LLP activities for complying with the Standards of institutional accreditation of medical organization of postgraduate and supplementary education:**

1. When updating the mission of the NROC, to provide for the role of education in ensuring the quality of cancer care medical services to the population;

2. To involve scientific and pedagogical staff of third-party organizations and representatives of practical health care for peer-reviewing of educational and methodological documentation (educational programs, syllabuses, tests) to ensure the quality of materials for postgraduate and additional education;

3. To improve instrumentation in postgraduate education by developing tests of the 2-3 level of complexity, active application of MCQ technology in training and assessment of knowledge;

4. To plan and implement systematic training for center staff involved in the educational process in the residency and advanced training of doctors, of methods and technologies of innovative interactive teaching;

5. To standardize methodological documentation for postgraduate and further education through the development of regulations and monitoring the quality of performance and use in the educational process;

6. To unify student assessment criteria with the development of evaluation sheets that meet the requirements of a point-rating system;

7. To improve the system of access to international databases of professional and scientific literature;

8. To improve the incentive system for employees and students when publishing scientific papers in peer-reviewed journals with a high impact factor (development of a regulation on material stimulation of publications);

9. In order to internationalize education, more actively conduct research and training events for residents and students of continuing education programs in English, as well as stimulate and support students' publications in English;

10. To implement the trilingual program in the educational process;

11. The NROC should initiate the creation of an association or society of patients with cancer and determine their role and forms of participation in improving the training of residents in their respective specialties.







## 7. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Members of EEC reached common ground to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit National Research Oncology Center LLP as the organization implementing postgraduate and additional education for a period of 5 years.

EEC Chairman	<b>Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna</b>	_____
EEC members:		
Foreign expert	<b>Attila Tordai</b>	_____
National academic expert	<b>Esenkulova Saule Askerovna</b>	_____
Expert – representative of professional association	<b>Ospanova Madina Eralyevna</b>	_____
Expert – resident	<b>Tazhigalieva Torgyn Maksatkyzy</b>	_____
ECAQA observer	<b>Sarsenbaeva Saule Sergazievna</b>	_____

### 7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать ТОО «Национальный научный онкологический центр» в качестве организации, осуществляющей последипломное и дополнительное образование на период 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	<b>Чингаева Гульнар Нуртасовна</b>	
Члены ВЭК:		
Зарубежный эксперт	<b>Аттила Тордай (Attila Tordai)</b>	
Национальный академический эксперт	<b>Есенкулова Сауле Аскеровна</b>	
Эксперт- представитель профессиональной ассоциации	<b>Оспанова Мадина Ералыевна</b>	
Эксперт - резидент	<b>Тажигалиева Торгын Максаткызы</b>	
Наблюдатель от ЕЦА	<b>Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна</b>	

## Appendix 1.

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of National Research Oncology Center LLP for conformity to the Standards of institutional accreditation of postgraduate education medical organizations

Standard	Assessment criteria	Evaluation		
		Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	22	1	0
2.	POSTGRADUEATE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	20	2	0
3.	ASSESMENT OF POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS	10	2	0
4.	POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS	27	1	0
5.	ACADEMIC AND SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT	12	0	0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	11	0	0
7.	EVALUATION OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS	10	2	0
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	19	1	0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	13	0	0
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>144</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>0</b>