#### REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ORGANISATIONS FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

## "INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION" LLP (Summary)

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No.15 dated 26.12.2018 year formed External Expert Committee (EEC) for the institutional accreditation of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP composed of:



**Chairman** - ISENOVA SAULE SHAYKENOVNA Doctor of medical sciences, Excellent Worker of Public Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

JSC "National Medical University", Head of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology



Foreign expert - Lidiya Georgieva Katrova Doctor of Medicine, Doctor of Sociology, Professor Member ADEE (the Association for Dental Education in Europe), awarded the medal of the European Association for the dental education is included in the anthology "Luminaries on Bulgarskata medicine"

Medical University of Sofia, Department of Public Health Dentistry



National expert
KYZAEVA AIZHAN DYUSENBEKOVNA
PhD, Member ASPHER (Association of Schools of Public
Health in the European Region), ORPHEUS (International
Union for doctoral programs), APACPH (Asia-Pacific
Academic Consortium for Public Health)
Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHOZ", Vice-Rector for
International Relations



National expert
SHAMSUTDINOVA ALFIA GUMAROVNA, PhD,
President of the NGO "Association of Bioethics and Medical
Law", member of the World Association for Medical Law
(WAML), the European Association of Pediatric and Adolescent
Gynecology (EUROPAG)
JSC "Central Clinical Hospital" (Almaty), Head of the Center of
innovation and education.



Expert - Representative of practical health
RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN HAMZAEVNA
M.D, Candidate of Medical Sciences,
Kazakh Corporation of Health and Medical Insurance
"Interteach" allergist



Expert - Representative of the healthcare professionals
- ABDRASULOV RASHID BOLATOVICH
M.D., Candidate of Medical Sciences, anesthesiologistresuscitator of the National Scientific Center for
Phthisiopulmonology of the Ministry of Healthcare of the
Republic of Kazakhstan



ECAQA observer
SARSENBAYEVA SAULE
M.D., Doctor of medical sciences, MBA Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care, Director General

In the period from 16 to 17 January 2019 evaluated compliance with the basic directions of activity of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" to institutional accreditation the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals.

The EEC report contains an assessment of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP on compliance improvement activities of the accredited organization.

Activities of additional education organizations (CPD) is not licensed. So far, the institutional accreditation IIST was not carried out.

#### General part of the final report of the EEC

International Institute of Postgraduate Education (IIPE) - an educational institution offering students a competitive additional medical education with the issuance of certificates of the established sample

Establishment of the International Institute of Postgraduate Education has its prehistory. In 2014, when the Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education was organized by the Department of subcontracting "Health, Environment and Health" under the guidance of Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Tolemisova Aray Magauiyanovna. At the department conducted refresher training on various topics specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology." Teaching was carried out by doctors and candidates of sciences, as well as experienced professionals of Scientific and practical center of sanitary epidemiological examination and monitoring having the highest qualification category and conducts training of specialists in all regions of the country. In 2012-2015, only in specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology" were trained 862 cadets.

In January 2016 the department of "Hygiene, Environment and Health" was renamed the International Institute of Postgraduate Education (order №1 from 29.01.2016g.), In this context, expanded activities, including training, not only in specialty "Hygiene and Epidemiology "but also on surgical and therapeutic.

Educational and research activities implemented by 30 departments according to the list of structural divisions, while two specialties: obstetrics and gynecology, including Children and anesthesiology and resuscitation, including Children participate in specialized accreditation, which is planned to open in the future residency in these specialties.

For the purpose of the continuous development of the IIEP and ensuring its smooth functioning of the departments created educational-methodical work and strategic development department, quality management system, human resources and functional maintenance, scientific and clinical department, accounting department. Structural subordination provides a harmonious work of all the departments of the Institute, whose activities are also based on these internal regulations: IIPE Charter, internal regulations, quality manual, documented procedures and other rules and regulations, approved by the Academic Board of the IIEP. IIST awarded the title "Industry Leader 2016", has a certificate of conformity of the QMS and other IIEP recognition certificates identified the main goal:

Contracts for training sessions with the clinical bases of medical institutions: multidisciplinary clinic "Rakhat" with a network of hospitals and other organizations of Almaty city Health Department.

Actual direction of the activities of IIPE is currently the training of qualified health personnel by means of continuing professional education for specialists with integration into the international educational space, reflecting the Institute's mission. The Strategic Plan of IIPE particular importance is given to both postgraduate education specialists and programs of continuing professional development of medical personnel.

# Analysis of the self-assessment report of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP for compliance with institutional accreditation standards organizations of additional education (continuing professional development)

Report on the institutional self-evaluation of educational organization / program (name) is presented on page 101, excluding attachments, characterized by structuring and internal unity of the information provided by the accredited institution of additional education about their activities. A cover letter signed by the Director Tolemisovoy A.M. is attached to the report confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

Institutional self-assessment of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP was held on the basis of the order No.9 dated 04.08.2018, "On approval of the working group on preparation for accreditation."

### The level and quality of self-awareness activities of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP

Based on the analysis of self-evaluation by experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional standards accreditation of medical institutions additional education (CPD) ECAQA.

During the visit, and external evaluation of IIPE LLP, the EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the educational organization for compliance with institutional accreditation standards of additional (CPD) education ECAQA.

Analyzed the information provided by external experts during a visit to IIPE LLP in meetings with management, staff offices, the study of documents, with the survey of students and teachers, interviewing employers, graduates and compared with the data of the report on self-assessment that will ensure the credibility and validation provided in IIPE LLP report information.

Despite the fact that the report on the institutional self-assessment IIPE LLP described their best practices to meet the standards of institutional accreditation, during a visit by external experts, it has requested the necessary information on the self-assessment of individual units IIPE LLP (strategic plan, reports, a, syllabus, control and measuring means of feedback, the model certificates, working curriculum, minutes of meetings of the Academic Council, the agreement with the clinical database, library, financial data), which revealed compliance of the IIPE LLP to the standards institutional accreditation organization of additional education ECAQA.

# Analysis for compliance institutional accreditation standards for the external evaluation of IIPE LLP and an overview of the strengths of each standard. Standard 1: Mission and outcomes Strengths:

- Developed mission education organization that actualized in 2018 and participated in the formulation of the mission stakeholders, the mission is communicated to all participants in the educational process is available on the website for informational and educational materials in the classroom;
- Integration into the international educational space, the introduction of joint and international training programs, cooperation with hospitals in Turkey, Korea, Azerbaijan, Belarus, etc.;
- There is an inverse relationship with stakeholders survey of practical public health representatives, students with the aim of further improving the working curricula, programs, refresher courses and retraining and other measures;
- The presence of listeners updated database to monitor customer satisfaction and ways to improve the activities of IIPE;
  - Academic autonomy of organization.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 13 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES Strengths:**

- additional education programs are designed in accordance with the regulatory requirements and the needs of practical health care;
  - In the preparation of listeners used the competence-based approach;

- In IIEP provided training in various clinical conditions, bases which have a profile clinics, various categories of patients, the level of care (primary care, specialized care, highly specialized care);
- Use as a tool to improve programs exchange of experience and transfer of technology, the availability of exit cycles, program of visiting professors;
  - Autonomy in the development of additional education programs;
- Annual meetings, joint meetings of chairs, round tables with employers and stakeholders in the development of new programs;
  - The close relationship between IIPE and employers;
- OP agreed with the representatives of professional associations, practical public health, reviewed by specialists of the corresponding profile;

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* correspond to - 16 correspond partly - 3 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Greater use of new information technologies and scientific approaches to provide the theoretical and practical skills;
- Activating the research work of teachers and implementation of the scientific component in the educational process (under the CDS, preparing systematic reviews of fragments, a coffee club);
  - Introduction of remote learning technologies to listeners.

### **Standard 3: Assessment and Documentation Strengths:**

- Formation and evaluation of all key competences listener;
- Availability of appropriate assessment methods in addition to traditional examinations / tests use self-assessment techniques;
- Monitoring the development of students learning outcomes through feedback.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 6 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: Completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Introduction of electronic document management, including documentation of evaluation of educational achievements of students;
- Feedback optimization through the implementation of electronic questionnaires;
  - Develop document management procedure (SOP);
- Develop and implement a standardized form for the development of teaching materials (syllabus), which reflects the objectives, targets, modular learning system, learning outcomes, teaching methods, evaluation methods, relevant bibliography, review and approval date;

- Consider the possibility of introducing a system of confidential preservation of personal data of students, teachers, patients enrolled in the educational process.

## Standard 4: The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development) Strengths:

- High qualification of teaching staff of departments involved in the implementation of the CPD;
- At clinical sites created opportunities for the development of all necessary competences in accordance with the stages of medical expert assistance, including specialized;
- At specialized department provides students participation in all the medical activities of the clinical sites;
  - The modular training system;
  - Jobs' listeners Support Service. "

**WEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 18 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 4:** Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

### **Standard 5: CPD PROVISION (Continuing Professional Development) Strengths:**

- Academic degree holders rate of teachers are high, the presence of the highest qualification of medical category, large medical and pedagogical faculty work experience, participating in the preparation of students;
- Availability of human resources policies to encourage and reward teachers to develop their expertise in education;
- Employee development, support their learning, ensuring their further professional development;
- Monitoring of the educational process on the part of management and departments;
- Use of modern methods and technologies of training of doctors and nurses.

*EEC conclusions on the criteria:* correspond to - 11 correspond partially - 1 do not correspond -

Standard 5: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Encouraging scientific work of teachers;
- To improve control of professional development of teachers and teacher training.

### Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES Strengths:

 Sufficient and developing the material and technical base and clinical resources;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 23 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 6: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Strengthening the participation of IIEP staff expertise in the field of education;
- Improving the provision of educational programs by own equipment where necessary.

### Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

#### **Strengths:**

- Monitoring and evaluation of the educational program;
- Using feedback analysis by stakeholders to improve the educational programs;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partly - 2 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7:** completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- To improve monitoring of educational programs with subsequent amendments;
- To improve the educational achievements of students evaluation system.

#### Standard 8. ORGANIZATION

#### **Strengths:**

- Stable financial condition of IIPE;
- Extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector;
- Competent personnel policy;
- Flexibility and responsiveness of training programs to modern health care needs;
  - Electronic data base of listeners.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 8: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Effective use of information and communication technologies in the management system (electronic document);
- Expansion of Web site content (publishing job training programs, control and measuring devices, syllabus, etc.) With the introduction of registration of listeners through a restricted access system.

### **Standard 9. Continuous Renewal Strengths:**

- Processes for continual improvement of additional education programs include professional development of teaching staff every 5 years, including on pedagogical competences;
- Exchange of experience with colleagues in other institutions of education and science of Kazakhstan and foreign countries implementing additional education programs;
- Development of material resources, expansion of classroom fund
   EEC conclusions on the criteria: correspond to 5 correspond partially 0 do not correspond 0.

**Standard 9:** Completed

#### Recommendations for improvement:

- Improvement of self-listeners (computer room, electronic library, annotation bibliography in syllabus, access to tests for self-assessment) 4
- Enhance cooperation with professional and national organizations to review the educational programs of additional education.

### 3. Recommendations for improving the activity of "International Institute for Postgraduate Education":

- 1) Introduction of electronic document management, including documentation of evaluation of educational achievements of students;
- 2) To implement standardized forms and procedures for the management of the educational process, including feedback from all interested parties;
  - 3) To improve conditions for self-listeners, including simulation equipment;
- 4) To enhance the interaction with professional national and international organizations, educational programs for review additional education;
- 5) To develop joint educational programs with foreign partners, taking into account the practical needs of health of RoK.

#### 7. Recommendations for Accreditation council of the ECAQA

The EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit "International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP for 5 years.

Chairman Isenova Saule Shaykenovna

Foreign expert Lidiya Georgieva Katrova

National expert Kyzaeva Aizhan Dyusenbekovna

National expert Shamsutdinova Alfia Gumarovna

Expert - representative of practical

health Ramazanova Sholpan Hamzaevna

Expert- Representative of

the healthcare professionals Abdrasulov Rashid Bolatovich

ECAQA observer Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna

8. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать ТОО «Международный институт последипломного образования» сроком на 5 (пять) лет.

Председатель ВЭК Члены ВЭК: Исенова Сауде Шайкеновна Зарубежный эксперт Лидия Георгиева Катрова Национальный Шамсутдинова Альфия академический Гумаровна эксперт Национальный Кызасва Айжан Дюсенбековна академический эксперт Рамазанова Шолпан Хамзаевпа Экспертпредставитель практического здравоохранения Слушатель-эксперт Абдрасулов Рашид Болатович Наблюдатель от ЕЦА Сарсенбаева Саулс Сергазиевна

#### Annex 1

### **Quality Profile And Criteria of Institutional Assessment** IIPE (organization additional education (CPD) (Generalized version)

Number of standards	accreditation standards  Number of evaluation criteria	Assessment		
		Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply
1.	Mission and Outcomes	13	0	0
2.	Educational programme	16	3	0
3.	Assessment and Documentation	6	1	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)	18	1	0
5.	CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)	11	1	0
6.	<b>Educational resources</b>	23	1	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	9	2	0
8.	Organization	9	0	0
9.	Continuous Renewal	5	0	0
	Total	110	9	0