# REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ORGANISATIONS FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

# OF THE "INTERNATIONAL PROGRESSIVE ACADEMY" LLP

# Dates of the external visit - March 19-20, 2019

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No.26 dated March 6, 2019 formed External Expert Commission (EEC) for conducting institutional accreditation of "International Progressive Academy" LLP on March 19-20, 2019. **Composition of External Expert Commission**:



# Chairman -

#### Atarbaeva Vaziliya Shakentaevna

M.D., Dr of MSc, Professor, Head of the Department of Cardiology and Rheumatology, Kazakhstan Medical University "BIIIO3", member of the Presidium of the Association of

Cardiologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan, member of the European Society of Cardiology and the World Heart Federation, Vice-President of the Association of PHC





# Foreign expert -Ovoynka Banjo Richard

The founder of the company «Rich world International», Department of Education and International Languages, University of Turan Almaty

National expert -Niztaeva Elmira Nuridinovna M.Sc. "Public health" Deputy Director of the Training Center Higher medical college CPP Almaty city



Judge - representative of practical health Abdikarimova Gulmira Chapaevna M.Sc. "Public health" Highest qualification category in the specialty "Public Health / Social Hygiene and Health Organization " Deputy Director of PE "INSPECTION", Astana

**Expert - listener Amenov Azamat Akhsanovich** General doctor, Supervisors substation No. 3 Station emergency care Almaty



**Observer ECA** Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna Head of accreditation and monitoring NU "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care"

### General part of the final report of the EEC

"International Progressive Academy" (hereinafter - the "Academy") was registered on October 18, 2017. The Academy aims to ensure continuous professional development and protection of the rights of health workers.

The main activity of "Academy" is to provide additional education of health professionals, experts trained in the field of sanitary - epidemiological examination carried out by sanitary - epidemiological auditing and improving health literacy in health, well-being of the population.

The peculiarity of the organization of advanced training courses for medical workers in the "Academy" is determined by the fact that the results of the sanitary and epidemiological examinations conducted form the content of educational programs, i.e. training is conducted with the coverage of current problems of practical health care, the level of health literacy.

Sanitary and epidemiological audit is an independent audit of compliance with the requirements of the legislation in the field of sanitary and epidemiological welfare of the population at facilities subject to sanitary and epidemiological supervision.

The main objective of the development plan of the educational program of the Academy is to improve the conditions for obtaining high-quality, quality additional vocational education in accordance with the vision, mission and strategy aimed at developing competitive, highly qualified personnel in the healthcare industry with modern systemic knowledge and necessary competencies that are in demand in Kazakhstan and in the world scientific and educational space, as well as for the development of social-oriented, highly cultured and competent personality.

To solve the above problems, we have the following tasks have been identified:

1. Employers' Involvement in the process of improving educational programs, definitions of professional competencies, training and methodological support of educational disciplines offered by the employer, allowing students to obtain high-quality professional education, including professional certificate in the process of learning;

2. To establish strong relationships with structures to ensure the protection of public health, foreign partners in order to implement joint educational programs, attracting renowned scholars, RK public and political figures to the implementation of educational programs;

3. To attract conducting lectures of specialists practitioners (leaders of organizations, entrepreneurs, experts, etc.);

4. To expand range of educational services.

# 2. Analysis of the report on self-assessment "International Progressive Academy" LLP for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals

Report on the institutional self-assessment "International Progressive Academy" LLP is presented on 107 pages, excluding annexes, characterized by completeness, structuring and internal unity of the information provided by the "Academy". A cover letter signed by the Director of "Academy" Tuyebahov M.D. is attached to the report, confirming the authenticity of the information and data contained in the report.

The report was prepared in accordance with the Guidelines for self-assessment in the framework of institutional accreditation and are in compliance with the institutional accreditation of additional education organizations (CPD) ECA. There is a list of members of the internal committee self-assessment indicating the responsibilities of each internal committee member (6 people), information about the representatives of the "Academy", responsible for the conduct of institutional self –accreditation - Zhienbaeva Nursaule Zhumabaevna, Deputy Director, responsible contractor, as well as a Chairman

of the Internal Committee in preparation for the institutional accreditation - Tuyebahov Meyrzhan Duysenbaevich.

Self-assessment of "Academy" was held on the basis of the order No.1 dated 12.01.2019 "On holding the institutional accreditation." In January 2019 the General Director of ECA Sarsenbayeva S.S. was conducted employee training on preparation for self-assessment.

Internal Commission of "Academy" for the period of self-assessment, since December 2018, has done the following work: to gather the necessary information in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis of the materials, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional Accreditation Standards includes a description of the ECA and strengths, areas for improvement in each of the 9 standard.

Database applications are complete, consistent, and there are references to them in the text of the report.

The report written by competent language, the language of each standard are clear and understandable, tables contain references in the text and are numbered consecutively.

# The level and quality of self-емфдгфешщт of the International Progressive Academy LLP

Based on the analysis of self-evaluation by experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional standards accreditation of medical institutions additional education ECA. By all the standards, the Academy presents real practice, arguments, examples confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description of the activities of the "Academy" based on the accreditation standards is quite complete and updated (for key areas of activity, strategic objectives, number of students, information on the recruitment of students, results of input and final control, monitoring based on feedback, financial information, international cooperation, etc.).

At the end of the report, a SWOT analysis is given, which includes a description of strengths and weaknesses, areas for improvement. In accordance with the requirement of the ECA Self-Assessment Guidelines, copies of documents (organizational structure, certificates) are attached to the report, which complement the description of the accreditation standards.

Thus, the self-assessment report of "Academy" provides objective and reliable information on all activities in accordance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of the ECA.

# **3.** Analysis for compliance institutional accreditation standards for the external evaluation of "Academy" and a review of the strengths of each standard

#### **Standard 1: Mission and outcomes**

"Academy" operates 1.5 years and their dce aims at providing continuous professional development and protection of the rights of health workers. "Academy" has developed and implemented the mission and vision. "Academy" The main activity is to provide additional education of health professionals, experts trained in the field of sanitary -

epidemiological examination, sanitary - epidemiological auditing and improving health literacy in health, well-being of the population.

The strategic plan is based on the mission and developed In accordance with the basic policy documents in the field of Health and Education. External experts have provided clear evidence of a mission, participated in its creation of key stakeholders. At the same time it requires more than Shirov inform the mission of other stakeholders (employers, national and international parnerov). All educational activities "Academy" is aimed at the achievement of students learning outcomes and thus to influence the improvement of the quality of medical care to the population.

# **Strengths:**

- Location of "Academy" in Almaty and enrollment staff leading medical organizations and metropolitan area;

- Qualified teaching staff with more clinical, teaching, research, expertise, a high proportion of academic holders;

- Certified trainers who are members of various international associations;

- A good reputation of the customers, that is, students and employers.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 13 correspond partially - 0 not correspond - 0.

### Standard 1: completed

### **Recommendations:**

1. More broadly informed about the mission and involved in the development of its stakeholders;

### **Standard 2: Educational programmes**

In the "Academy", almost all forms of supplementary education are implemented, with restrictions on retraining programs. The programs are mainly based on the needs of both medical organizations and students. "Academy" provides assistance in the selection and selection of topics for improvement and uses different methods in training. To strengthen partnerships abroad, the Academy provides international cooperation with leading clinics and universities. Memorandums of cooperation have been concluded on the issues of advanced training of medical workers and exchange of experience. The accredited organization uses various methods of training (active, interactive, presentational, expert situation analysis, analysis of real medical cases, etc.). All advanced training programs are supported by the appropriate methodological material. At the same time, there is no unification of teaching and reporting documentation. Mainly they are guided by the instructional letter 9, which does not reflect modern requirements for keeping educational documentation. Electronic document flow that could optimize the processes of planning, recording, logging (recording), accounting and reporting has not been implemented. In RUPs it is not quite clearly spelled out how the assessment of knowledge and skills obtained by the students during training is conducted.

### Strengths:

- Implementation of sanitary - epidemiological audit enables the development of relevant educational programs based on the results of the examinations;

- Expert activities of "Academy" allows you to monitor the level of survival knowledge among students on the basis of which the "Academy" may take a decision on the need for additional training courses;

- Willingness and commitment to continuous improvement of accumulated experience;

- Initial potential resources availability for the students, a wide range of thematic courses for all interested students;

- Expansion of services and an enrollment by attracting students from all areas involved in the process of formation of public health.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 18 correspond partially - 1 do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 2: Completed

# **Recommendations:**

- 1. To unify all forms of educational materials with the subsequent approval by the Educational and Methodological Board;
- 2. To record changes and additions to the work program based on the analysis of questionnaires of students and employers in order to update a practical health care needs of these programs;
- **3.** To include a system of rating estimations of knowledge and skills acquired during training to training programs.

# **Standard 3: Assessment and Documentation**

With an external visit, experts obtained evidence of the use of innovative teaching, learning and assessment methods. So, at the lessons in the Academy one can follow the students 'presentation logic, the ability to use knowledge to explain various processes, prove their point of view, to refute the wrong opinion, etc. Various other methods of competency assessment are actively used: control of the initial level of knowledge, final control in the form of testing, demonstration of practical skills. The solution of situational problems, the compilation of an action algorithm for a given situation are widely used. Forms of classes are traditional, in the form of lectures with an illustrated presentation. Before the beginning of the class, an introductory survey of students is conducted to determine the level of training. However, analysis of the survey results and its discussion is not conducted. Valuation techniques based primarily on project specification recommendations at the same time, experts have not been demonstrated approaches to the assessment of students enrolled in short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration. at the same time, experts do not approach to the assessment of students were shown the students on short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration. at the same time, experts do not approach to the assessment of students were shown the students on short-term cycles of training. In general, no conclusive data on how the estimated quality of each training program, regardless of its duration.

# Strengths:

- Active expert activities of "Academy", which allows for assessment of competencies for employees of medical institutions, to monitor the level of students' knowledge of survival;

- There is a system to initiate and justify the need for additional training for students.

- Willingness and commitment to continuous improvement of the documentation;

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 6 correspond partilly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: Completed

# **Recommendations:**

- 1. It is advisable to develop an additional education program evaluation policy by developing a map of competencies and knowledge assessment tools;
- 2. To form a portfolio of teachers with a personal growth plan;
- 3. To conduct improving pedagogical skills of teachers using innovative learning technologies;

# Standard 4: The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)

"Academy" provides delivery of high quality training on cycles of training and encourages students to participate in programs and activities of the NDP. Students are motivated by the accredited organization and realize that their self-education is a prerequisite for the provision of quality health services to the population. "Academy" developstraining programs that meet the requirements for training health professionals and are based on expert assessments and results of Sanitary and Epidemiological Surveillance of medical organizations.

"Academy" strives for advanced training programs to be based on educational strategies, taking into account the individual level of competence of students and work experience in the profession.

During the implementation of the educational process, training rooms are provided for practicing health care professionals, equipped with audio-video equipment, flipchart, writing boards, equipped simulation center. Time is allotted for self-training of students, access to electronic information databases is provided. Practical classes are held at clinical sites with the possibility of practicing practical skills.

### **Strengths:**

- Qualified faculty and certified trainers with a great clinical, teaching, research, expertise, who are members of various international associations;

- Sustainable development of the organization and a commitment to continuous improvement of the accumulated experience as an expert in the work and learning;

- Use of innovative technologies in the examination, the San epid.nadzore and training of students;

- Considering the needs of practical health care professionals in the development of training programs.

Conclusions of the EEC according to criteria correspond to - 19 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 4: Completed

### **Recommendations:**

**1.** It is advisable to conduct primary questioning and listening test for the formation of groups based on the level of competence and experience in the specialty.

### Standard 5: CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)

"Academy" was founded as an organization, providing Sanitary and Epidemiological Surveillance, advice to health professionals in the selection of vocational training programs, both at home and abroad. assessment of students and recognition system CPD programs, as a necessary condition to improve competence listeners, which is the basic principles of the accredited organization to substantiate passing institutional accreditation "Academy".

The EEC received evidence that the Academy is an official legal organization, including those engaged in the implementation of CPD programs in health care (state registration of a legal entity with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2017). It has been established that PC programs comply with the established requirements of the state (the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, orders on academic staff, etc.) to the quality of medical education. At the same time, teachers, in spite of high professionalism, need advanced training on innovative teaching methods. When studying contracts with teachers and external experts involved in teaching, it was discovered that the Academy closely cooperates with medical universities in Almaty and involves them in improving the quality of CPD programs.

### **Strengths:**

- "Academy" allows efficient implementation of services for conducting training cycles, certification and training, while respecting the state policy in the field of the NDP, and taking into account the individual needs of students in training;

- "Academy" founded to develop computer programs on the results of SEN medical institutions, thus contributing to the improvement of medical aid to the population;

- "Academy" provides organization of PC programs in medical institutions, taking into account their needs in content, venue and time;

- "Academy" supports the government's policy in the field of quality assurance of additional education in the field of health.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 12 correspond partilly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: Completed

### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To ensure ongoing improvement of pedagogical skills of teachers.

### **Standard 6: Educational resources**

External experts in the program visits "Academy" provided evidence of the presence of a sufficient amount of office space, auditoriums (classrooms total area of 500 m<sup>2</sup> methodical center total area of 150 m<sup>2</sup>), contracts to clinical sites (19). For example, the author's courses "Advanced international technologies in the management

of childhood diseases. Integrated management of childhood diseases" and "Neonatal diseases. Tactics of conducting "are carried out in on the basis of Children's city clinical infectious diseases hospital. The course "Medical-social and medical labor examination and rehabilitation" is conducted on the basis of the Center of Modern Medicine "MEDITERRA". In PVC "Ambulance Station" of the Public Health Department of Almaty city, the skills of BLS are practiced. Obstetrician-gynecological aids are developed on the basis of the PCE on the REHE Maternity Hospital No. 4 of the Almaty City Health Department. The principles of the outpatient polyclinic service, management capabilities in the context of priority development of primary health care and its modernization, disease management programs are mastered in the City polyclinics number 4, 5, 6, 8, 22, 26. The premises provide a safe environment for employees and trainees.

"Academy" provided access to web resources (website http://ipamed.kz/) and other electronic training tools (links to international databases Pubmed, Scopus, Medline, DynaMed, Webofknowledge, Cochranelibrary, professional literature, electronic textbooks).

"Academy" conducts information work in social networks Facebook, Telegram, Instagram. Distance learning is provided through the Moodle system. There is access to electronic databases of medical literature: Pubmed, Scopus, Medline, DynaMed, Webofknowledge, Cochranelibrary.

"Academy" is an equal member of the "Association of primary care professionals and restoration and rehabilitation medicine", "Association of specialists and general preventive medicine", "Association of dermatologists and dermatologists' and actively promoting the strategy of innovative education in Kazakhstan in accordance with international standards.

At the same time, not fully discovered the scientific activity of the accredited organization.

### **Strengths:**

- Flexibility in the planning of training programs, dynamism in dealing with practical public health, the tendency to stability of financial indicators;

- Developed material and technical base;

- Cooperation with the Public Health Department of Almaty.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 24 correspond partilly -0 not correspond - 0.

Standard 6: Completed

### **Recommendations:**

1. To continue strengthen international cooperation in research and educational activities.

### **Standard 7: Evaluation of CPD Activities**

"Academy" systematically evaluates the quality of sold AT programs, basing it on the feedback results with students, teachers. The EEC studied profiles and analytical reports. For example, the annual situational analysis of the external factors of the organization, a quarterly research with drawing up the relevant reports, surveys of consumers and workers 'organizations, continuous tracking of changes in the legislative and legal database, etc. Monitoring and analysis of CPD evaluation data is UMS' Academy ". All work programs drawn up in accordance with the standard program of training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.165 dated April 14, 2017. **Strengths:** 

- "Academy" has a vision for the evaluation of educational programs and ensure their implementation processes;

- introduced a feedback system with the audience.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 10 correspond partly -1 do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 7: Completed

# **Recommendations:**

- **1.** Following the results of the analysis of the survey of students to develop a plan to improve operations and educational programs;
- **2.** To implement a survey of heads of medical organizations to assess the quality of training health professionals.

# **Standard 8: Organization**

""Academy" in its areas of activity is a unique organization and in this regard, the organizational structure is built taking into account the conduct of: sanitary-epidemiological audit; additional professional education; Disinsection-Disinfection-Disinfusion; assistance in online registration, documentary support of health workers in the submission of documents for the assessment of professional readiness (certification) and / or confirmation of qualification compliance.

Sectors of the main profiles of the health system are designed to provide SEN. The implementation of the educational process is ensured through the monitoring of the training department, which distributes streams studying in the areas of training, ie, in the public health sector, clinical disciplines or study in the department of chronic noncommunicable diseases.

"Academy" operates in accordance with the strategic development plan. An important part of the plan is ensuring the necessary financial and material resources. The activities envisaged in the plan are aimed at improving the economic efficiency of the "Academy". "Academy" annually receives an order from the public and private health organizations for educational and expert events.

### Strengths:

- Diversity of activities aimed at providing high quality sanitary-epidemiological expertise and educational services;

- Financial stability;

- Autonomy planning and management of resources of the organization;

- Competent top management;
- Availability of development strategy.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 8: Completed

**Recommendations for improvement:** 

- 1. Continued involvement of specialists from the leading medical education with clinical experience;
- 2. Training of employees of methodical work.

# **Standard 9: Continuous Renewal**

Academy conducts continuous monitoring of changes in the field of healthcare and education, regulatory documents and changes in society, and taking into account these updates, the Academy develops its activities. Constant improvement of the educational process (educational programs and services) is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the health care system, requirements and expectations of direct consumers, interested parties; study, analysis and implementation of advanced, including international experience in raising the level of professional skills of specialists. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the results of the activities of the "Academy" is based on the satisfaction of the audience.

# **Strengths:**

- "Academy" improves the methods and techniques in teaching students;

- Educational programs are updated taking into account the needs of practical health care, the results of Sanitary and Epidemiological Surveillance, changes in international standards, NLA of the RoK, model curricula, clinical protocols of diagnosis and treatment of RoK;

- Measures for continuous improvement are included in the strategic development plan of the Academy until 2022.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 5 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: Completed

**Recommendations: no.** 

# 4. Recommendations on improvement of "International Progressive Academy" LLP activities:

1. To improve information content and website

2. To expand international relations in the sphere of improvement of listeners` qualification.

3. To strengthen feedback with employers on the results of listeners 'education.

4. To strengthen partnership with professional associations under development of methodical materials and listeners 'education

5. To ensure review of educat.-met. materials

**5.** The EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit "International Progressive Academy" LLP for 5 years.

Chairman	Atarbaeva Vaziliya Shakentaevna
Foreign expert	Ovoynka Banjo Richard
National expert	Niztaeva Elmira Nuridinovna
Expert-representative of practical health	Abdikarimova Gulmira Chapaevna
Expert - representative of the Healthcare Professionals	Amenov Azamat Akhsanovich
ECAQA Observer	Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

#### Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать организацию образования ТОО «Международная Прогрессивная Академия» сроком на 5лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Атарбаева Вазилия Шакентаевна	<u>A-</u>
Зарубежный эксперт	Овойнка Банжи Ричард	hot
Национальный академический эксперт	Низтаева Эльмира Нуридиновна	N
Эксперт – представитель практического здравоохранения	Абдикаримова Гульмира Чапаевна	Marp-
Эксперт – слушатель	Аменов Азамат Ихсанович	
Наблюдатель ВЭК	Умарова Макпал Альдибековна	Huf

# Annex 1

Criteria for assessment		Assessment		
	Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply	
1.	Mission and Outcomes	13	0	0
2.	Educational programme	18	1	0
3.	Assessment and Documentation	6	1	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)	19	0	0
5.	CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)	12	0	0
6.	Educational resources	24	0	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	10	1	0
8.	Organization	9	0	0
9.	Continuous Renewal	5	0	0
	Total	116	3	0

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation supplementary education